

A portrait of Richard Wolff, an older man with glasses and a checkered shirt, looking directly at the camera. The background is a dark, abstract composition with splatters of red, yellow, and blue paint, and a large, flowing red shape that resembles a ribbon or a wave. The overall aesthetic is dynamic and artistic.

**RICHARD
WOLFF**

**SOCIAL
INFLUENCE
ON THE MIND**

1
00:00:05,670 --> 00:00:03,030
for me that's a sign of movement

2
00:00:07,670 --> 00:00:05,680
immaturity if we're going to sit around

3
00:00:10,709 --> 00:00:07,680
and who's more oppressed

4
00:00:13,990 --> 00:00:10,719
black people female people

5
00:00:16,790 --> 00:00:14,000
this per what what are we doing

6
00:00:17,590 --> 00:00:16,800
these are qualitative differences when

7
00:00:20,630 --> 00:00:17,600
you reduce

8
00:00:22,710 --> 00:00:20,640
qualitative difference to quantity it's

9
00:00:25,189 --> 00:00:22,720
an old mathematical and philosophic

10
00:00:27,109 --> 00:00:25,199
problem there's something going on there

11
00:00:33,190 --> 00:00:27,119
that you ought to interrogate

12
00:00:36,470 --> 00:00:34,389
i want you to know that this is not a

13
00:00:37,830 --> 00:00:36,480

debate i've watched almost all of your

14

00:00:39,830 --> 00:00:37,840

interviews like debate debate

15

00:00:40,950 --> 00:00:39,840

heated debate with marxist like this

16

00:00:43,670 --> 00:00:40,960

these are questions

17

00:00:44,549 --> 00:00:43,680

i have i think of me as a fool i don't

18

00:00:47,830 --> 00:00:44,559

know much

19

00:00:50,790 --> 00:00:47,840

you're a scholar i

20

00:00:52,869 --> 00:00:50,800

i'm just a filmmaker just a humble

21

00:00:55,430 --> 00:00:52,879

obsequious filmmaker

22

00:00:56,709 --> 00:00:55,440

i'll ask you questions and peter will do

23

00:01:00,150 --> 00:00:56,719

the same

24

00:01:03,349 --> 00:01:00,160

you do know i hope that the scholar

25

00:01:05,350 --> 00:01:03,359

is exactly described honestly as you've

26

00:01:07,990 --> 00:01:05,360

just described yourself

27

00:01:10,469 --> 00:01:08,000

it's just that the scholar functions in

28

00:01:14,149 --> 00:01:10,479

an institutional arrangement

29

00:01:17,670 --> 00:01:14,159

where he has to or she now has to

30

00:01:22,070 --> 00:01:17,680

position himself herself um

31

00:01:25,749 --> 00:01:22,080

as some kind of expert some kind of

32

00:01:27,990 --> 00:01:25,759

raised being and that's you know

33

00:01:29,590 --> 00:01:28,000

if you have some compassion it's

34

00:01:33,270 --> 00:01:29,600

something that the academic

35

00:01:34,469 --> 00:01:33,280

fell into it shouldn't be blamed on the

36

00:01:36,950 --> 00:01:34,479

academic

37

00:01:39,510 --> 00:01:36,960

i mean granted they abuse it and they

38

00:01:41,350 --> 00:01:39,520

exploit it and all the rest they do

39

00:01:42,789 --> 00:01:41,360

most of them do and that's been my

40

00:01:45,350 --> 00:01:42,799

experience

41

00:01:47,510 --> 00:01:45,360

and i've been an academic all my life

42

00:01:51,030 --> 00:01:47,520

but

43

00:01:54,069 --> 00:01:51,040

they're not the author of their own

44

00:01:57,910 --> 00:01:54,079

sad position and they often

45

00:02:01,270 --> 00:01:57,920

stumble in their own personal lives and

46

00:02:03,910 --> 00:02:01,280

in their academic environments

47

00:02:05,510 --> 00:02:03,920

because that posturing as the scholar

48

00:02:09,190 --> 00:02:05,520

who knows

49

00:02:09,830 --> 00:02:09,200

is a heavy burden and it it doesn't work

50

00:02:12,869 --> 00:02:09,840

well

51
00:02:13,510 --> 00:02:12,879
and it even the scholars would be better

52
00:02:16,550 --> 00:02:13,520
off

53
00:02:19,910 --> 00:02:16,560
if they could stop that fakery and

54
00:02:23,270 --> 00:02:19,920
get on with talking honestly about their

55
00:02:25,350 --> 00:02:23,280
ambivalences their uncertainties

56
00:02:27,910 --> 00:02:25,360
the parts of the story they can't tell

57
00:02:30,550 --> 00:02:27,920
because they don't know

58
00:02:31,350 --> 00:02:30,560
instead of looking upon that as like you

59
00:02:35,270 --> 00:02:31,360
know

60
00:02:37,190 --> 00:02:35,280
some defect that they have to mask

61
00:02:38,949 --> 00:02:37,200
find it on opening for an interesting

62
00:02:41,750 --> 00:02:38,959
conversation it's sad

63
00:02:43,830 --> 00:02:41,760

very sad but then there's no tenure or

64

00:02:47,990 --> 00:02:43,840

maybe that's why there's ten

65

00:02:50,710 --> 00:02:48,000

that's right and then if you're unsure

66

00:02:52,869 --> 00:02:50,720

you know the tendency is to play

67

00:02:56,470 --> 00:02:52,879

one-upsmanship games with other

68

00:02:59,110 --> 00:02:56,480

academics and to utilize your power

69

00:03:01,830 --> 00:02:59,120

position relative to students

70

00:03:02,790 --> 00:03:01,840

to you to work off on them to act out

71

00:03:06,070 --> 00:03:02,800

your own

72

00:03:08,229 --> 00:03:06,080

confidence

73

00:03:09,830 --> 00:03:08,239

which then in turn because the students

74

00:03:12,869 --> 00:03:09,840

always pick it up

75

00:03:14,229 --> 00:03:12,879

makes them turn off to education and i

76

00:03:18,710 --> 00:03:14,239

think in part

77

00:03:22,309 --> 00:03:18,720

become an audience for you all right man

78

00:03:25,509 --> 00:03:22,319

peter all right so my name is

79

00:03:28,710 --> 00:03:25,519

uh peter guinos and i'm here

80

00:03:31,990 --> 00:03:28,720

with kirchio mongol kurt

81

00:03:35,270 --> 00:03:32,000

uh filmmaker and head of

82

00:03:39,110 --> 00:03:35,280

better left unsaid we are here today

83

00:03:41,350 --> 00:03:39,120

with dr wolf marx's professor

84

00:03:42,149 --> 00:03:41,360

who is going to help us shed some

85

00:03:44,869 --> 00:03:42,159

clarity

86

00:03:46,229 --> 00:03:44,879

on some of the ideas circulating around

87

00:03:50,309 --> 00:03:46,239

marxism both

88

00:03:54,149 --> 00:03:50,319

in the past and in our times

89

00:03:56,309 --> 00:03:54,159

so my first question uh for you dr wolf

90

00:03:57,270 --> 00:03:56,319

is uh do you mind just starting by

91

00:03:58,550 --> 00:03:57,280

telling us

92

00:04:00,149 --> 00:03:58,560

in the audience a little bit about

93

00:04:01,030 --> 00:04:00,159

yourself your past where you're coming

94

00:04:03,030 --> 00:04:01,040

from

95

00:04:05,589 --> 00:04:03,040

and what you're working on now what

96

00:04:08,949 --> 00:04:05,599

you're working towards

97

00:04:12,070 --> 00:04:08,959

okay i am the

98

00:04:14,550 --> 00:04:12,080

child of two immigrants who came to the

99

00:04:16,629 --> 00:04:14,560

united states from europe

100

00:04:18,390 --> 00:04:16,639

my father was french my mother was

101
00:04:21,110 --> 00:04:18,400
german

102
00:04:23,189 --> 00:04:21,120
i was born in the only place my father

103
00:04:24,629 --> 00:04:23,199
could get a job as an immigrant when he

104
00:04:27,189 --> 00:04:24,639
came here

105
00:04:29,590 --> 00:04:27,199
which was as a steel worker in

106
00:04:31,030 --> 00:04:29,600
youngstown ohio which is where i was

107
00:04:34,390 --> 00:04:31,040
born

108
00:04:35,670 --> 00:04:34,400
um i grew up speaking mostly french and

109
00:04:39,030 --> 00:04:35,680
german because that was

110
00:04:41,030 --> 00:04:39,040
those were the languages of my home

111
00:04:42,150 --> 00:04:41,040
i really only started learning english

112
00:04:44,790 --> 00:04:42,160
when they

113
00:04:45,590 --> 00:04:44,800

dropped me off at my kindergarten to

114

00:04:48,950 --> 00:04:45,600

start

115

00:04:52,870 --> 00:04:51,909

and i'm very grateful that they had the

116

00:04:55,030 --> 00:04:52,880

wisdom to

117

00:04:57,189 --> 00:04:55,040

teach me these languages so that i grew

118

00:05:00,310 --> 00:04:57,199

up basically being

119

00:05:01,270 --> 00:05:00,320

trilingual which for a child is very

120

00:05:03,670 --> 00:05:01,280

easy to do

121

00:05:05,350 --> 00:05:03,680

and much easier than learning languages

122

00:05:08,230 --> 00:05:05,360

later on

123

00:05:10,310 --> 00:05:08,240

um but as the child and i was the first

124

00:05:14,150 --> 00:05:10,320

child of immigrants

125

00:05:17,590 --> 00:05:14,160

who had fled europe because of the war

126
00:05:21,510 --> 00:05:17,600
and who kind of had the death all around

127
00:05:23,670 --> 00:05:21,520
them as part of their lives

128
00:05:25,110 --> 00:05:23,680
there was a pretty heavy burden on me as

129
00:05:28,230 --> 00:05:25,120
a child

130
00:05:31,189 --> 00:05:28,240
to fulfill the life

131
00:05:32,150 --> 00:05:31,199
ambitions that had been cut short for my

132
00:05:34,310 --> 00:05:32,160
parents

133
00:05:36,550 --> 00:05:34,320
because they had to leave the countries

134
00:05:40,950 --> 00:05:36,560
and the positions and the careers

135
00:05:45,590 --> 00:05:40,960
that they had had over there

136
00:05:48,870 --> 00:05:45,600
so i was early on oriented towards being

137
00:05:49,670 --> 00:05:48,880
a proper achiever and since my mother

138
00:05:52,950 --> 00:05:49,680

was german

139

00:05:56,710 --> 00:05:52,960

achievement always meant physical

140

00:05:57,430 --> 00:05:56,720

as well as mental capability and ability

141

00:06:01,430 --> 00:05:57,440

so

142

00:06:04,469 --> 00:06:01,440

i always played sports as well as doing

143

00:06:06,469 --> 00:06:04,479

academic work and being a good student

144

00:06:08,629 --> 00:06:06,479

i had to be a good student because if i

145

00:06:10,790 --> 00:06:08,639

came home with anything else

146

00:06:12,469 --> 00:06:10,800

both my mother and father would begin

147

00:06:15,029 --> 00:06:12,479

tearing up

148

00:06:16,790 --> 00:06:15,039

uh i just say that to give you an idea

149

00:06:20,950 --> 00:06:16,800

of the level of psychic pressure

150

00:06:23,350 --> 00:06:20,960

there was so i ended up um

151
00:06:25,189 --> 00:06:23,360
being a very good student and an athlete

152
00:06:26,150 --> 00:06:25,199
and i played the violin in the orchestra

153
00:06:29,189 --> 00:06:26,160
the whole bit

154
00:06:31,830 --> 00:06:29,199
um and in those days

155
00:06:34,150 --> 00:06:31,840
uh harvard university was making an

156
00:06:36,870 --> 00:06:34,160
experiment

157
00:06:38,469 --> 00:06:36,880
and bringing in people who i think

158
00:06:40,150 --> 00:06:38,479
normally would not have been brought

159
00:06:41,830 --> 00:06:40,160
there so i went to harvard as an

160
00:06:44,469 --> 00:06:41,840
undergraduate

161
00:06:45,749 --> 00:06:44,479
um where i was told why would you not

162
00:06:47,029 --> 00:06:45,759
normally have been brought there you

163
00:06:49,350 --> 00:06:47,039

said that you were a great student a

164

00:06:52,230 --> 00:06:49,360

great athlete

165

00:06:53,430 --> 00:06:52,240

uh my experience at harvard where i

166

00:06:56,390 --> 00:06:53,440

spent four years

167

00:06:58,070 --> 00:06:56,400

well let me explain i went to harvard

168

00:06:59,990 --> 00:06:58,080

and when i finished at harvard i went to

169

00:07:01,430 --> 00:07:00,000

stanford and when i finished at stanford

170

00:07:05,189 --> 00:07:01,440

i went to yale

171

00:07:08,710 --> 00:07:05,199

so i am i spent 10 years of my life

172

00:07:12,629 --> 00:07:08,720

in this rarefied atmosphere of the elite

173

00:07:15,189 --> 00:07:12,639

universities of this country and i know

174

00:07:16,390 --> 00:07:15,199

both because of what i learned there and

175

00:07:19,510 --> 00:07:16,400

what i have learned

176

00:07:22,790 --> 00:07:19,520

umpteen times since that this

177

00:07:25,350 --> 00:07:22,800

is a highly stratified society

178

00:07:27,510 --> 00:07:25,360

who sends its children to the same

179

00:07:29,909 --> 00:07:27,520

universities they went to

180

00:07:31,749 --> 00:07:29,919

et cetera et cetera et cetera and i'm

181

00:07:33,110 --> 00:07:31,759

not part of that my parents had nothing

182

00:07:35,110 --> 00:07:33,120

to do with that they came from another

183

00:07:36,469 --> 00:07:35,120

part of the world

184

00:07:38,629 --> 00:07:36,479

i didn't go to harvard by the way

185

00:07:40,950 --> 00:07:38,639

because it was harvard my parents didn't

186

00:07:42,469 --> 00:07:40,960

know what harvard was

187

00:07:43,990 --> 00:07:42,479

the guidance counselor in the high

188

00:07:46,869 --> 00:07:44,000

school the public high school i went

189

00:07:49,110 --> 00:07:46,879

to thought i should apply to harvard and

190

00:07:50,950 --> 00:07:49,120

i did but that was not my first choice

191

00:07:52,230 --> 00:07:50,960

at all i wanted to go to where a friend

192

00:07:54,790 --> 00:07:52,240

of mine had gone

193

00:07:56,790 --> 00:07:54,800

a small college called oberlin in in

194

00:07:59,350 --> 00:07:56,800

ohio

195

00:08:01,670 --> 00:07:59,360

that i had visited and loved but harvard

196

00:08:02,309 --> 00:08:01,680

gave me more money and my parents had no

197

00:08:04,309 --> 00:08:02,319

money

198

00:08:05,830 --> 00:08:04,319

so my father said well this is easy

199

00:08:08,790 --> 00:08:05,840

you're going to harvard so

200

00:08:09,990 --> 00:08:08,800

i went to harvard because it was cheap

201
00:08:12,469 --> 00:08:10,000
for me

202
00:08:13,110 --> 00:08:12,479
given the fellowship and all the crap i

203
00:08:17,670 --> 00:08:13,120
got

204
00:08:19,990 --> 00:08:17,680
place was and i've learned since

205
00:08:22,070 --> 00:08:20,000
how it works but people like me do not

206
00:08:24,150 --> 00:08:22,080
normally end up

207
00:08:26,390 --> 00:08:24,160
at a place like harvard that really the

208
00:08:28,629 --> 00:08:26,400
fact that i was good in school or played

209
00:08:31,749 --> 00:08:28,639
football or any of the other stuff

210
00:08:33,350 --> 00:08:31,759
really uh very nice but it's not it's

211
00:08:35,110 --> 00:08:33,360
not what happens

212
00:08:36,709 --> 00:08:35,120
and partly it's not even harvard that

213
00:08:37,909 --> 00:08:36,719

rejects you it's that you don't even

214

00:08:39,829 --> 00:08:37,919

think

215

00:08:41,670 --> 00:08:39,839

of applying there it's just not part of

216

00:08:42,550 --> 00:08:41,680

your universe and it wouldn't have been

217

00:08:44,470 --> 00:08:42,560

of mine

218

00:08:45,829 --> 00:08:44,480

had it not been for the guidance

219

00:08:47,990 --> 00:08:45,839

counselor's

220

00:08:49,590 --> 00:08:48,000

uh desire that someone from our high

221

00:08:51,910 --> 00:08:49,600

school get to harvard

222

00:08:53,269 --> 00:08:51,920

and i think that year i was their best

223

00:08:54,949 --> 00:08:53,279

shot anyway i went okay

224

00:08:56,470 --> 00:08:54,959

let's let's get to your current work and

225

00:09:00,870 --> 00:08:56,480

then what you're working toward

226

00:09:02,949 --> 00:09:00,880

okay um i didn't like how this country

227

00:09:05,509 --> 00:09:02,959

treated my parents as immigrants they

228

00:09:07,110 --> 00:09:05,519

were quite grateful that they were alive

229

00:09:09,190 --> 00:09:07,120

and they gave the united states credit

230

00:09:12,389 --> 00:09:09,200

for being alive so

231

00:09:13,269 --> 00:09:12,399

they weren't the critics i was but i saw

232

00:09:16,870 --> 00:09:13,279

what

233

00:09:19,990 --> 00:09:16,880

parents led

234

00:09:20,949 --> 00:09:20,000

and i didn't blame them i blamed the

235

00:09:23,670 --> 00:09:20,959

system

236

00:09:24,710 --> 00:09:23,680

that was an early insight of mine and i

237

00:09:28,150 --> 00:09:24,720

i stayed with it

238

00:09:30,470 --> 00:09:28,160

ever since i gave myself the task

239

00:09:31,509 --> 00:09:30,480

understand how and why this system did

240

00:09:34,550 --> 00:09:31,519

what it did

241

00:09:35,269 --> 00:09:34,560

to my parents and and the people around

242

00:09:39,030 --> 00:09:35,279

them that i

243

00:09:42,470 --> 00:09:39,040

got to know so i've been a critic

244

00:09:46,470 --> 00:09:42,480

of the system for as long as i've been

245

00:09:48,630 --> 00:09:46,480

more or less of an adult and

246

00:09:49,590 --> 00:09:48,640

i found it an interesting challenge that

247

00:09:52,470 --> 00:09:49,600

harvard

248

00:09:53,030 --> 00:09:52,480

and stanford and yale did their level

249

00:09:56,470 --> 00:09:53,040

best

250

00:09:58,550 --> 00:09:56,480

to persuade me otherwise and i took what

251
00:10:01,509 --> 00:09:58,560
they were trying to teach me seriously i

252
00:10:04,870 --> 00:10:01,519
didn't dismiss it i wasn't

253
00:10:07,190 --> 00:10:04,880
glad handing what they were offering

254
00:10:08,310 --> 00:10:07,200
but they didn't persuade me they really

255
00:10:10,870 --> 00:10:08,320
didn't

256
00:10:12,069 --> 00:10:10,880
and what i also saw which has been a

257
00:10:15,509 --> 00:10:12,079
very important

258
00:10:19,430 --> 00:10:15,519
shaping of my life i saw

259
00:10:22,630 --> 00:10:19,440
naked fear i saw it over and over again

260
00:10:25,829 --> 00:10:22,640
at harvard at stanford and at yale

261
00:10:26,389 --> 00:10:25,839
and here's what i mean i would raise a

262
00:10:29,030 --> 00:10:26,399
question

263
00:10:31,350 --> 00:10:29,040

or other students it wasn't just me that

264

00:10:35,350 --> 00:10:31,360

had something to do with the critique

265

00:10:38,150 --> 00:10:35,360

of capitalism and i could see the way

266

00:10:41,350 --> 00:10:38,160

any human being can see it in another

267

00:10:43,910 --> 00:10:41,360

the fear in my instructor's

268

00:10:45,750 --> 00:10:43,920

faces and i'm including here the

269

00:10:46,550 --> 00:10:45,760

instructors that i like who were good

270

00:10:47,910 --> 00:10:46,560

teachers

271

00:10:49,509 --> 00:10:47,920

and the instructors that i didn't

272

00:10:50,150 --> 00:10:49,519

particularly like who weren't such good

273

00:10:53,430 --> 00:10:50,160

teachers

274

00:10:57,590 --> 00:10:53,440

and this is around 1970s 1960s yeah it

275

00:10:59,509 --> 00:10:57,600

was in the 1986 mostly the 1960s i mean

276

00:11:01,590 --> 00:10:59,519

my basic education is tonight

277

00:11:03,269 --> 00:11:01,600

in my period of going to the ivy leagues

278

00:11:05,509 --> 00:11:03,279

these three schools

279

00:11:07,990 --> 00:11:05,519

that's the 1960s okay and you attribute

280

00:11:10,790 --> 00:11:08,000

that fear to what

281

00:11:11,829 --> 00:11:10,800

uh the cold war mccarthyism whatever you

282

00:11:15,269 --> 00:11:11,839

want to call it

283

00:11:18,550 --> 00:11:15,279

my professors had two problems basically

284

00:11:21,190 --> 00:11:18,560

the first problem was they often didn't

285

00:11:22,069 --> 00:11:21,200

know the answer to the question that i

286

00:11:24,790 --> 00:11:22,079

asked

287

00:11:26,870 --> 00:11:24,800

they simply didn't know and you know in

288

00:11:27,990 --> 00:11:26,880

the academic world as you've probably

289

00:11:31,110 --> 00:11:28,000

discovered

290

00:11:33,269 --> 00:11:31,120

it's very painful for a scholar to say

291

00:11:34,310 --> 00:11:33,279

i don't know as if that were some

292

00:11:37,350 --> 00:11:34,320

fundamental

293

00:11:38,949 --> 00:11:37,360

defect that they should be ashamed about

294

00:11:40,790 --> 00:11:38,959

so they were fearful because they did

295

00:11:41,350 --> 00:11:40,800

not want in front of a classroom of

296

00:11:43,910 --> 00:11:41,360

young

297

00:11:44,550 --> 00:11:43,920

folks like me to be in the position of

298

00:11:47,190 --> 00:11:44,560

saying

299

00:11:47,670 --> 00:11:47,200

i don't know but they didn't know

300

00:11:50,870 --> 00:11:47,680

because

301

00:11:53,350 --> 00:11:50,880

marxism was so toxic

302

00:11:54,389 --> 00:11:53,360

to them in their environment at that

303

00:11:57,509 --> 00:11:54,399

time

304

00:12:02,150 --> 00:11:57,519

that it went to the point of not reading

305

00:12:05,910 --> 00:12:02,160

the books not learning the arguments

306

00:12:07,269 --> 00:12:05,920

or the other kind of fear uh was just oh

307

00:12:10,470 --> 00:12:07,279

my god don't

308

00:12:13,509 --> 00:12:10,480

i don't want to go there this is

309

00:12:16,470 --> 00:12:13,519

dangerous material please ask

310

00:12:17,990 --> 00:12:16,480

somebody else please go somewhere else

311

00:12:20,710 --> 00:12:18,000

with your question

312

00:12:21,590 --> 00:12:20,720

and whatever they said to me their faces

313

00:12:25,030 --> 00:12:21,600

were like

314

00:12:28,069 --> 00:12:25,040

um tableaux of anxiety

315

00:12:30,310 --> 00:12:28,079

and difficulty and i you know like any

316

00:12:33,350 --> 00:12:30,320

young person i think with half a

317

00:12:35,750 --> 00:12:33,360

bit of curiosity to his or her soul

318

00:12:36,710 --> 00:12:35,760

i wanted to understand what's going on

319

00:12:39,910 --> 00:12:36,720

here

320

00:12:41,750 --> 00:12:39,920

what what's happening why is this

321

00:12:44,069 --> 00:12:41,760

every time i bring up something about

322

00:12:46,949 --> 00:12:44,079

marxism or socialism

323

00:12:47,509 --> 00:12:46,959

or communism which by the way were front

324

00:12:50,389 --> 00:12:47,519

page

325

00:12:50,949 --> 00:12:50,399

news in the daily newspapers all the

326

00:12:55,190 --> 00:12:50,959

time

327

00:12:57,590 --> 00:12:55,200

on here

328

00:12:59,269 --> 00:12:57,600

and then i began to ask questions and i

329

00:13:01,030 --> 00:12:59,279

began to learn

330

00:13:03,110 --> 00:13:01,040

so let me let me make a simple statement

331

00:13:05,190 --> 00:13:03,120

that summarizes it

332

00:13:07,110 --> 00:13:05,200

i spent 10 years of my life at harvard

333

00:13:10,150 --> 00:13:07,120

stanford and yale

334

00:13:14,150 --> 00:13:10,160

one professor in all those ten years

335

00:13:17,670 --> 00:13:14,160

assigned us one

336

00:13:21,190 --> 00:13:17,680

passages from karl marx's capital

337

00:13:22,710 --> 00:13:21,200

his major adult work of analyzing

338

00:13:25,829 --> 00:13:22,720

capitalism

339

00:13:27,750 --> 00:13:25,839

one professor during one semester

340

00:13:30,629 --> 00:13:27,760

happened to be at stanford by the way

341

00:13:33,670 --> 00:13:30,639

not at harvard and not at yale

342

00:13:36,310 --> 00:13:33,680

and i have one ba from harvard

343

00:13:36,949 --> 00:13:36,320

three master's degrees from stanford and

344

00:13:41,990 --> 00:13:36,959

yale

345

00:13:45,509 --> 00:13:42,000

there is no excuse

346

00:13:49,110 --> 00:13:45,519

intellectually or any other way for such

347

00:13:51,990 --> 00:13:49,120

a lopsided crazy

348

00:13:53,990 --> 00:13:52,000

curriculum that's not about analysis

349

00:13:57,350 --> 00:13:54,000

that's not about priorities

350

00:14:01,110 --> 00:13:57,360

that's about political fear

351

00:14:03,189 --> 00:14:01,120

career fear these professors did not

352

00:14:04,230 --> 00:14:03,199

want and if by the way if you were to

353

00:14:06,710 --> 00:14:04,240

ask me

354

00:14:07,670 --> 00:14:06,720

might some of them have been sympathetic

355

00:14:09,750 --> 00:14:07,680

the answer is

356

00:14:12,389 --> 00:14:09,760

they might have been but they were so

357

00:14:13,670 --> 00:14:12,399

scared that i'll never know and i can't

358

00:14:16,790 --> 00:14:13,680

answer your question

359

00:14:19,110 --> 00:14:16,800

if you have that in your mind by the way

360

00:14:20,069 --> 00:14:19,120

the united states we're living in right

361

00:14:24,230 --> 00:14:20,079

now

362

00:14:27,509 --> 00:14:24,240

is itself the product of an entire

363

00:14:30,710 --> 00:14:27,519

half century of self

364

00:14:31,750 --> 00:14:30,720

copyright that makes it impossible for

365

00:14:34,870 --> 00:14:31,760

large numbers

366

00:14:36,069 --> 00:14:34,880

of perfectly intelligent uh human beings

367

00:14:39,110 --> 00:14:36,079

in this country

368

00:14:40,710 --> 00:14:39,120

to have a clue as to what the critique

369

00:14:43,509 --> 00:14:40,720

of capitalism means

370

00:14:44,150 --> 00:14:43,519

around the world the power it has the

371

00:14:47,110 --> 00:14:44,160

influence

372

00:14:47,509 --> 00:14:47,120

it has i can't get it it's a mystery

373

00:14:50,310 --> 00:14:47,519

that

374

00:14:51,430 --> 00:14:50,320

continues to overwhelm them okay could

375

00:14:52,870 --> 00:14:51,440

it also be

376

00:14:55,990 --> 00:14:52,880

that as you mentioned in one of your

377

00:14:58,389 --> 00:14:56,000

other interviews marx is so

378

00:15:00,069 --> 00:14:58,399

has already influenced our critiques of

379

00:15:01,590 --> 00:15:00,079

capitalism to such a degree that we

380

00:15:03,750 --> 00:15:01,600

don't necessarily need to go back to the

381

00:15:05,110 --> 00:15:03,760

source for example in physics we never

382

00:15:08,230 --> 00:15:05,120

read newton

383

00:15:09,990 --> 00:15:08,240

we don't read archimedes we know about

384

00:15:11,670 --> 00:15:10,000

what newton has influenced we don't go

385

00:15:13,590 --> 00:15:11,680

to the principy of mathematica

386

00:15:15,030 --> 00:15:13,600

in biology you don't read about lamarck

387

00:15:16,550 --> 00:15:15,040

because that's outdated although you

388

00:15:17,990 --> 00:15:16,560

might hear

389

00:15:19,670 --> 00:15:18,000

about why lamarck's theories are

390

00:15:21,750 --> 00:15:19,680

incorrect you don't go to the source so

391

00:15:24,550 --> 00:15:21,760

could it not also be that

392

00:15:26,230 --> 00:15:24,560

it that would make sense if the great

393

00:15:30,069 --> 00:15:26,240

marxist thinkers

394

00:15:33,829 --> 00:15:30,079

since marks were on the reading list

395

00:15:36,710 --> 00:15:33,839

but they're absent also part of the loss

396

00:15:37,509 --> 00:15:36,720

of not reading the original which by the

397

00:15:40,310 --> 00:15:37,519

way

398

00:15:41,189 --> 00:15:40,320

isn't that old you know marx's mature

399

00:15:45,030 --> 00:15:41,199

writing

400

00:15:47,749 --> 00:15:45,040

is 150 years old it's not inaccessible

401
00:15:49,509 --> 00:15:47,759
it's not you know from another universe

402
00:15:51,990 --> 00:15:49,519
but even put that aside

403
00:15:53,189 --> 00:15:52,000
i could give you a list of 20 or 30 or

404
00:15:55,590 --> 00:15:53,199
50

405
00:15:57,269 --> 00:15:55,600
marxists who came afterwards who

406
00:15:59,910 --> 00:15:57,279
developed the thought

407
00:16:00,550 --> 00:15:59,920
often critically dropping this focusing

408
00:16:02,629 --> 00:16:00,560
on that

409
00:16:04,389 --> 00:16:02,639
extending it over there those are not on

410
00:16:07,509 --> 00:16:04,399
the reading list either

411
00:16:10,949 --> 00:16:07,519
because the topic is the problem

412
00:16:11,670 --> 00:16:10,959
the whole approach it it's like dealing

413
00:16:14,949 --> 00:16:11,680

with

414

00:16:16,629 --> 00:16:14,959

childishness among academics i don't

415

00:16:18,870 --> 00:16:16,639

want to see it i don't want to

416

00:16:20,550 --> 00:16:18,880

hear it i don't want to know it's there

417

00:16:21,990 --> 00:16:20,560

and the end result is you don't know

418

00:16:24,710 --> 00:16:22,000

anything about it

419

00:16:26,150 --> 00:16:24,720

look i have the following problem as an

420

00:16:28,870 --> 00:16:26,160

academic

421

00:16:30,150 --> 00:16:28,880

i had to learn neoclassical economics

422

00:16:32,710 --> 00:16:30,160

which is the dominant

423

00:16:34,470 --> 00:16:32,720

paradigm in this country i had to learn

424

00:16:36,949 --> 00:16:34,480

that because i had to teach it

425

00:16:37,990 --> 00:16:36,959

and i had to get my exams passed

426
00:16:40,230 --> 00:16:38,000
properly

427
00:16:41,110 --> 00:16:40,240
and i load keynesian economics which is

428
00:16:43,189 --> 00:16:41,120
the only

429
00:16:44,389 --> 00:16:43,199
slightly critical approach that is

430
00:16:47,269 --> 00:16:44,399
allowed

431
00:16:48,790 --> 00:16:47,279
so i can talk to my colleagues about

432
00:16:50,710 --> 00:16:48,800
what we share

433
00:16:52,710 --> 00:16:50,720
but the minute i start talking to them

434
00:16:55,110 --> 00:16:52,720
about marxian economics

435
00:16:56,870 --> 00:16:55,120
they don't know what to do it becomes a

436
00:17:00,389 --> 00:16:56,880
difficult conversation

437
00:17:03,430 --> 00:17:00,399
because they become at best the pupil

438
00:17:05,270 --> 00:17:03,440

and i become the teacher and that's not

439

00:17:07,350 --> 00:17:05,280

the relationship they want with me they

440

00:17:10,069 --> 00:17:07,360

want the relationship of colleagues

441

00:17:10,949 --> 00:17:10,079

not as teacher student and so the

442

00:17:14,069 --> 00:17:10,959

conversation

443

00:17:16,069 --> 00:17:14,079

dribbles off or dies or even takes an

444

00:17:18,150 --> 00:17:16,079

unpleasant turn

445

00:17:20,549 --> 00:17:18,160

so i've learned as people like me have

446

00:17:23,590 --> 00:17:20,559

had to learn in the united states

447

00:17:24,630 --> 00:17:23,600

to talk the marxism in a different

448

00:17:27,429 --> 00:17:24,640

language

449

00:17:28,950 --> 00:17:27,439

so that they can hear it and can maybe

450

00:17:31,750 --> 00:17:28,960

process a bit of it

451
00:17:33,830 --> 00:17:31,760
instead of having the visceral reaction

452
00:17:35,669 --> 00:17:33,840
which they mostly have

453
00:17:37,350 --> 00:17:35,679
not realizing it's to their own

454
00:17:39,750 --> 00:17:37,360
detriment

455
00:17:42,230 --> 00:17:39,760
the creation of these parallel languages

456
00:17:44,150 --> 00:17:42,240
to circumnavigate the center's impotence

457
00:17:46,710 --> 00:17:44,160
in discussing these topics is

458
00:17:47,669 --> 00:17:46,720
something that's not unfamiliar to our

459
00:17:50,710 --> 00:17:47,679
time

460
00:17:53,750 --> 00:17:50,720
uh i'm curious do you think that

461
00:17:54,950 --> 00:17:53,760
uh these the creation of these taboos

462
00:17:58,870 --> 00:17:54,960
around marxism

463
00:18:00,310 --> 00:17:58,880

in the 1960s were simply because of cold

464

00:18:03,190 --> 00:18:00,320

war tensions or does it

465

00:18:04,549 --> 00:18:03,200

highlight an institutional problem in

466

00:18:08,230 --> 00:18:04,559

our education system

467

00:18:10,390 --> 00:18:08,240

in universities or some other aspect of

468

00:18:14,310 --> 00:18:10,400

our education system

469

00:18:17,789 --> 00:18:14,320

well no because the the irony is before

470

00:18:20,710 --> 00:18:17,799

the cold war sets in that is before

471

00:18:23,510 --> 00:18:20,720

1945 to be precise

472

00:18:24,630 --> 00:18:23,520

you did have across the american

473

00:18:27,750 --> 00:18:24,640

academic

474

00:18:31,190 --> 00:18:27,760

spectrum quite a few

475

00:18:34,789 --> 00:18:31,200

seriously critical voices

476

00:18:35,830 --> 00:18:34,799

yes they were not as freely allowed in

477

00:18:37,909 --> 00:18:35,840

academia

478

00:18:39,430 --> 00:18:37,919

as they should have been i would be the

479

00:18:42,950 --> 00:18:39,440

first to say that

480

00:18:46,470 --> 00:18:42,960

but there was nothing like the wholesale

481

00:18:48,390 --> 00:18:46,480

silencing that you had in the aftermath

482

00:18:51,350 --> 00:18:48,400

of 1945.

483

00:18:53,110 --> 00:18:51,360

i'll give you an example and i'll do it

484

00:18:55,590 --> 00:18:53,120

from economics because that's the field

485

00:18:57,990 --> 00:18:55,600

i know one of the great economic

486

00:19:02,029 --> 00:18:58,000

economists of the 20th century

487

00:19:03,350 --> 00:19:02,039

uh was a man named paul sweehey

488

00:19:05,669 --> 00:19:03,360

s-w-e-e-z-y

489

00:19:07,350 --> 00:19:05,679

you can look him up lots of books very

490

00:19:11,270 --> 00:19:07,360

funny cite him in the transcript

491

00:19:13,350 --> 00:19:11,280

okay uh ironically a member of the

492

00:19:14,230 --> 00:19:13,360

rockefeller family here in the united

493

00:19:17,510 --> 00:19:14,240

states

494

00:19:20,549 --> 00:19:17,520

uh the rich ones um

495

00:19:23,990 --> 00:19:20,559

who also went to harvard by the way uh

496

00:19:26,230 --> 00:19:24,000

but in a way parallel to mine

497

00:19:27,190 --> 00:19:26,240

he ended up being a marxist long story

498

00:19:29,750 --> 00:19:27,200

short

499

00:19:30,470 --> 00:19:29,760

uh teaching at harvard where he had gone

500

00:19:33,830 --> 00:19:30,480

to school

501
00:19:34,549 --> 00:19:33,840
he was a professor um and one of the

502
00:19:37,669 --> 00:19:34,559
great

503
00:19:42,549 --> 00:19:37,679
inspirations to call to paul sweezey

504
00:19:45,990 --> 00:19:42,559
as a marxist at harvard was the american

505
00:19:48,390 --> 00:19:46,000
theorist and economist thorsten veblen

506
00:19:49,909 --> 00:19:48,400
whom i hope you know or if you don't you

507
00:19:52,870 --> 00:19:49,919
ought to learn one of the great

508
00:19:53,669 --> 00:19:52,880
thinkers on the left in the united

509
00:19:57,110 --> 00:19:53,679
states

510
00:19:58,630 --> 00:19:57,120
before world war one even let alone

511
00:20:01,510 --> 00:19:58,640
world war ii

512
00:20:02,710 --> 00:20:01,520
uh and sweesy was in fact responsible

513
00:20:06,310 --> 00:20:02,720

for

514

00:20:08,630 --> 00:20:06,320

keeping his legacy if you like alive

515

00:20:10,870 --> 00:20:08,640

veblen taught school in a variety of

516

00:20:14,390 --> 00:20:10,880

american universities

517

00:20:17,669 --> 00:20:14,400

uh sweezy taught at harvard but with the

518

00:20:20,230 --> 00:20:17,679

end with the cold war harvard in a

519

00:20:23,750 --> 00:20:20,240

typical gesture of academic

520

00:20:25,669 --> 00:20:23,760

courage fired sweezy

521

00:20:26,950 --> 00:20:25,679

okay he was the person who was

522

00:20:30,070 --> 00:20:26,960

designated

523

00:20:31,750 --> 00:20:30,080

as a young instructor to fill the shoes

524

00:20:34,549 --> 00:20:31,760

of the most famous professor

525

00:20:35,750 --> 00:20:34,559

at harvard in economics at that time a

526

00:20:39,190 --> 00:20:35,760

man named joseph

527

00:20:40,149 --> 00:20:39,200

schumpeter all right he was retiring he

528

00:20:43,750 --> 00:20:40,159

was an old man

529

00:20:45,909 --> 00:20:43,760

and sweezie was his prized student

530

00:20:46,870 --> 00:20:45,919

despite all of that despite all of

531

00:20:50,070 --> 00:20:46,880

sweesie's

532

00:20:51,430 --> 00:20:50,080

connections not only as a thinker and as

533

00:20:53,110 --> 00:20:51,440

a successful student

534

00:20:55,270 --> 00:20:53,120

but as a member of the rockefeller

535

00:20:57,350 --> 00:20:55,280

family and let me assure you

536

00:20:59,669 --> 00:20:57,360

that harvard takes a great deal of

537

00:21:00,070 --> 00:20:59,679

interest in anybody who has anything to

538

00:21:03,990 --> 00:21:00,080

do

539

00:21:05,669 --> 00:21:04,000

these universities

540

00:21:07,669 --> 00:21:05,679

but he they fired him because he was

541

00:21:10,549 --> 00:21:07,679

politically unpalatable

542

00:21:11,110 --> 00:21:10,559

and he went on to found a magazine uh

543

00:21:13,430 --> 00:21:11,120

called

544

00:21:14,390 --> 00:21:13,440

uh monthly review i'm not sure you're

545

00:21:16,470 --> 00:21:14,400

familiar with it

546

00:21:17,430 --> 00:21:16,480

uh it's been a socialist marxist

547

00:21:19,830 --> 00:21:17,440

magazine

548

00:21:21,270 --> 00:21:19,840

in the united states here it continues

549

00:21:25,990 --> 00:21:21,280

to publish now

550

00:21:29,350 --> 00:21:26,000

uh it started in 1949 when paul sweesey

551

00:21:31,750 --> 00:21:29,360

got together with albert einstein

552

00:21:33,430 --> 00:21:31,760

who was a socialist who wanted to

553

00:21:35,350 --> 00:21:33,440

support marxism

554

00:21:36,710 --> 00:21:35,360

i mentioned it only because most

555

00:21:40,310 --> 00:21:36,720

americans have

556

00:21:41,750 --> 00:21:40,320

cleansed mr einstein of his unfortunate

557

00:21:43,350 --> 00:21:41,760

political interests

558

00:21:45,430 --> 00:21:43,360

anyway they started this magazine

559

00:21:48,470 --> 00:21:45,440

together einstein and sweezie

560

00:21:50,390 --> 00:21:48,480

in 1949 call month review

561

00:21:52,630 --> 00:21:50,400

uh in which by the way i have published

562

00:21:55,909 --> 00:21:52,640

articles full transparency

563

00:21:59,350 --> 00:21:55,919

here uh but that kind of thing is was

564

00:22:01,990 --> 00:21:59,360

normal the professor who who by the way

565

00:22:02,630 --> 00:22:02,000

who the only professor i ever had who

566

00:22:05,789 --> 00:22:02,640

assigned

567

00:22:07,350 --> 00:22:05,799

marx was a man named paul buran

568

00:22:10,630 --> 00:22:07,360

b-a-r-a-n

569

00:22:13,750 --> 00:22:10,640

was a professor at that time in stanford

570

00:22:15,669 --> 00:22:13,760

and had gotten the job uh

571

00:22:17,110 --> 00:22:15,679

immediately at the end of the war

572

00:22:20,789 --> 00:22:17,120

because of his

573

00:22:23,110 --> 00:22:20,799

uh participation in the oss

574

00:22:25,350 --> 00:22:23,120

the office of strategic services which

575

00:22:28,789 --> 00:22:25,360

was the forerunner in the united states

576

00:22:31,190 --> 00:22:28,799

of the cia he had been a leftist

577

00:22:32,390 --> 00:22:31,200

and had been working as sweesy and

578

00:22:36,470 --> 00:22:32,400

others did

579

00:22:38,710 --> 00:22:36,480

in the anti-fascism movement which one

580

00:22:40,630 --> 00:22:38,720

included collaboration with the very

581

00:22:43,909 --> 00:22:40,640

same government that later

582

00:22:46,630 --> 00:22:43,919

turned on them uh when the wind

583

00:22:47,990 --> 00:22:46,640

changed but yes it it devastated

584

00:22:50,630 --> 00:22:48,000

american academics

585

00:22:51,909 --> 00:22:50,640

and by the way let me be clear it still

586

00:22:55,190 --> 00:22:51,919

does

587

00:22:57,270 --> 00:22:55,200

the cold war ended in 1989. at least

588

00:22:59,590 --> 00:22:57,280

that's what the history books tell us

589

00:23:00,630 --> 00:22:59,600

with the implosion of russia and eastern

590

00:23:03,350 --> 00:23:00,640

europe

591

00:23:05,830 --> 00:23:03,360

but you wouldn't know it if you go to

592

00:23:06,870 --> 00:23:05,840

academic economics in the united states

593

00:23:10,870 --> 00:23:06,880

today

594

00:23:14,230 --> 00:23:10,880

it is as lopsidedly unwilling

595

00:23:17,909 --> 00:23:14,240

to admit the entire corpus

596

00:23:22,710 --> 00:23:17,919

of marxist scholarship today as it was

597

00:23:25,350 --> 00:23:22,720

30 years ago it i find it stunning

598

00:23:26,230 --> 00:23:25,360

i find it something that really merits

599

00:23:29,350 --> 00:23:26,240

some

600

00:23:29,830 --> 00:23:29,360

uh analysis and one of the reasons if i

601
00:23:33,190 --> 00:23:29,840
can be

602
00:23:38,149 --> 00:23:33,200
personal that you find your way to me

603
00:23:41,110 --> 00:23:38,159
is because i am a product of that elite

604
00:23:42,710 --> 00:23:41,120
that opens doors for me because i went

605
00:23:45,590 --> 00:23:42,720
to those universities

606
00:23:47,110 --> 00:23:45,600
if i had gone to other universities all

607
00:23:49,430 --> 00:23:47,120
other things equal

608
00:23:51,510 --> 00:23:49,440
you would never have heard of me and we

609
00:23:54,310 --> 00:23:51,520
wouldn't be having this conversation

610
00:23:56,630 --> 00:23:54,320
that's part of the power of the ranking

611
00:23:59,430 --> 00:23:56,640
structure of american academia

612
00:24:00,950 --> 00:23:59,440
and it's been true all my life let's get

613
00:24:03,590 --> 00:24:00,960

some definitions out of the way

614

00:24:04,710 --> 00:24:03,600

for people i'm a man of definitions

615

00:24:07,269 --> 00:24:04,720

what's marxism

616

00:24:07,909 --> 00:24:07,279

what's communism and what's socialism

617

00:24:11,190 --> 00:24:07,919

very good

618

00:24:11,590 --> 00:24:11,200

let's do that marxism you know that's

619

00:24:13,990 --> 00:24:11,600

easy

620

00:24:15,830 --> 00:24:14,000

because it has something to do with karl

621

00:24:18,149 --> 00:24:15,840

marx and it has to do with

622

00:24:19,510 --> 00:24:18,159

with a remarkable reality about karl

623

00:24:23,029 --> 00:24:19,520

marx

624

00:24:25,990 --> 00:24:23,039

uh the man lives from 1818 to 1883.

625

00:24:26,549 --> 00:24:26,000

he does most of his writings around age

626

00:24:29,190 --> 00:24:26,559

30

627

00:24:31,430 --> 00:24:29,200

and afterwards so you can narrow down

628

00:24:35,110 --> 00:24:31,440

the middle of the 19th century

629

00:24:37,990 --> 00:24:35,120

as the core of marx's writings

630

00:24:39,830 --> 00:24:38,000

uh so we have what is 150 years more or

631

00:24:43,750 --> 00:24:39,840

less since then

632

00:24:45,909 --> 00:24:43,760

uh and that body of ideas that he writes

633

00:24:47,029 --> 00:24:45,919

quite prolific just a footnote in case

634

00:24:49,909 --> 00:24:47,039

your your your

635

00:24:51,110 --> 00:24:49,919

audience isn't familiar uh marx is born

636

00:24:53,669 --> 00:24:51,120

in germany

637

00:24:55,350 --> 00:24:53,679

um but he's exiled but that's the way

638

00:24:57,590 --> 00:24:55,360

they punished the political

639

00:24:58,710 --> 00:24:57,600

leftists in those days they didn't kill

640

00:25:01,269 --> 00:24:58,720

him they didn't

641

00:25:02,149 --> 00:25:01,279

arrest them they exiled them so he left

642

00:25:04,549 --> 00:25:02,159

germany

643

00:25:06,149 --> 00:25:04,559

um went to france they did the same went

644

00:25:08,070 --> 00:25:06,159

to belgium they did the same

645

00:25:09,510 --> 00:25:08,080

and he ended up where all refugees from

646

00:25:11,990 --> 00:25:09,520

europe in those days did

647

00:25:13,909 --> 00:25:12,000

in london which allowed you to stay

648

00:25:14,870 --> 00:25:13,919

there so he lived the rest of his life

649

00:25:17,269 --> 00:25:14,880

in london

650

00:25:18,470 --> 00:25:17,279

uh spoke english taught in english wrote

651
00:25:20,149 --> 00:25:18,480
in english

652
00:25:22,230 --> 00:25:20,159
but mostly in german because that was

653
00:25:26,390 --> 00:25:22,240
his basic language

654
00:25:30,230 --> 00:25:26,400
in 150 years since marx died

655
00:25:33,269 --> 00:25:30,240
his writings have inspired

656
00:25:36,470 --> 00:25:33,279
marxist thinkers in all

657
00:25:39,669 --> 00:25:36,480
fields natural science social science

658
00:25:41,510 --> 00:25:39,679
humanities you name it in every country

659
00:25:45,350 --> 00:25:41,520
on the face of the earth

660
00:25:48,789 --> 00:25:45,360
it's one of the most stunning spreadings

661
00:25:51,350 --> 00:25:48,799
in a historically short time 150 years

662
00:25:52,549 --> 00:25:51,360
is not long in history and there's no

663
00:25:53,990 --> 00:25:52,559

country on earth

664

00:25:55,590 --> 00:25:54,000

that doesn't have its marxist

665

00:25:58,149 --> 00:25:55,600

institutions marxist

666

00:25:59,190 --> 00:25:58,159

intellectuals you name it so it's

667

00:26:02,789 --> 00:25:59,200

everywhere

668

00:26:04,789 --> 00:26:02,799

which suggests if you're not close to it

669

00:26:06,070 --> 00:26:04,799

that there's something going on in this

670

00:26:09,350 --> 00:26:06,080

set of ideas

671

00:26:11,350 --> 00:26:09,360

that an awful lot of people find really

672

00:26:12,710 --> 00:26:11,360

interesting okay professor i'm going to

673

00:26:14,549 --> 00:26:12,720

get you to be a bit terse

674

00:26:15,909 --> 00:26:14,559

what is marxism what is socialism what

675

00:26:17,350 --> 00:26:15,919

is communism i want to

676
00:26:19,750 --> 00:26:17,360
make the most of your time i know you're

677
00:26:23,110 --> 00:26:19,760
getting it all right fine

678
00:26:25,990 --> 00:26:23,120
uh socialism is a different thing

679
00:26:27,269 --> 00:26:26,000
socialism existed before marx as did

680
00:26:29,350 --> 00:26:27,279
communism

681
00:26:30,310 --> 00:26:29,360
those were existing things that marx

682
00:26:32,710 --> 00:26:30,320
encountered

683
00:26:33,669 --> 00:26:32,720
he had positive and negative reactions

684
00:26:36,390 --> 00:26:33,679
to them

685
00:26:37,990 --> 00:26:36,400
broadly speaking in terms of what these

686
00:26:41,029 --> 00:26:38,000
words have meant

687
00:26:42,549 --> 00:26:41,039
a i have to tell you that there is no

688
00:26:44,149 --> 00:26:42,559

single definition there is no

689

00:26:47,110 --> 00:26:44,159

institution that issues

690

00:26:49,269 --> 00:26:47,120

definitions that everybody subscribes to

691

00:26:50,630 --> 00:26:49,279

when you hear that word used you have to

692

00:26:53,029 --> 00:26:50,640

look at the context

693

00:26:54,950 --> 00:26:53,039

you have to read a bit because what

694

00:26:58,630 --> 00:26:54,960

people mean by these terms

695

00:27:00,789 --> 00:26:58,640

has always been contested terrain

696

00:27:02,390 --> 00:27:00,799

that's true of most social science

697

00:27:05,029 --> 00:27:02,400

issues but it's true

698

00:27:06,070 --> 00:27:05,039

in spades of this one so here's what

699

00:27:07,990 --> 00:27:06,080

socialism

700

00:27:09,110 --> 00:27:08,000

has come to me and i'm going to narrow

701
00:27:12,710 --> 00:27:09,120
it down to

702
00:27:15,510 --> 00:27:12,720
three basic alternatives to help you out

703
00:27:16,470 --> 00:27:15,520
number one the kind of socialism

704
00:27:18,789 --> 00:27:16,480
associated

705
00:27:20,389 --> 00:27:18,799
with scandinavia western europe and a

706
00:27:23,269 --> 00:27:20,399
whole lot of other societies

707
00:27:24,470 --> 00:27:23,279
works roughly like this you have an

708
00:27:27,750 --> 00:27:24,480
economic system

709
00:27:28,870 --> 00:27:27,760
in which private enterprises are the

710
00:27:33,269 --> 00:27:28,880
dominant

711
00:27:37,110 --> 00:27:33,279
form however these private enterprises

712
00:27:41,269 --> 00:27:37,120
are organized in a very particular way

713
00:27:43,909 --> 00:27:41,279

which is called capitalism namely

714

00:27:45,830 --> 00:27:43,919

that they organize themselves with a

715

00:27:48,950 --> 00:27:45,840

very small number of people

716

00:27:51,190 --> 00:27:48,960

in a very dominant powerful position in

717

00:27:52,870 --> 00:27:51,200

modern capitalism these are called the

718

00:27:55,510 --> 00:27:52,880

major shareholders

719

00:27:57,190 --> 00:27:55,520

or the board of directors or if you know

720

00:28:00,310 --> 00:27:57,200

how a corporation works

721

00:28:01,350 --> 00:28:00,320

the major shareholders elect the board

722

00:28:04,789 --> 00:28:01,360

of directors

723

00:28:07,510 --> 00:28:04,799

and tell them what to do this is a tiny

724

00:28:09,590 --> 00:28:07,520

number of people in most enterprises the

725

00:28:10,630 --> 00:28:09,600

vast majority of people in most

726
00:28:13,909 --> 00:28:10,640
enterprises

727
00:28:14,870 --> 00:28:13,919
are called employees whereas the first

728
00:28:18,230 --> 00:28:14,880
group are called

729
00:28:18,870 --> 00:28:18,240
employers but the way capitalism is set

730
00:28:20,789 --> 00:28:18,880
up

731
00:28:24,389 --> 00:28:20,799
all the key decisions about every

732
00:28:27,750 --> 00:28:24,399
enterprise are made by a small minority

733
00:28:31,029 --> 00:28:27,760
that is not accountable to the large

734
00:28:34,310 --> 00:28:31,039
majority in that enterprise

735
00:28:34,950 --> 00:28:34,320
all the key decisions are made including

736
00:28:38,070 --> 00:28:34,960
those

737
00:28:41,269 --> 00:28:38,080
that impact the vast majority

738
00:28:44,230 --> 00:28:41,279

but the vast majority is excluded

739

00:28:45,110 --> 00:28:44,240

from participating in the decisions they

740

00:28:48,230 --> 00:28:45,120

simply have to

741

00:28:50,470 --> 00:28:48,240

live with the results which include

742

00:28:53,190 --> 00:28:50,480

firing them and not paying them any

743

00:28:55,990 --> 00:28:53,200

money and throwing their families into

744

00:28:57,990 --> 00:28:56,000

whatever dilemma that involves that's

745

00:29:00,549 --> 00:28:58,000

how private capitalism works

746

00:29:02,149 --> 00:29:00,559

and then they interact these enterprises

747

00:29:04,310 --> 00:29:02,159

with one another

748

00:29:06,870 --> 00:29:04,320

by means of market exchanges that's

749

00:29:10,070 --> 00:29:06,880

typically what we mean by capitalism

750

00:29:13,110 --> 00:29:10,080

and the socialism of western europe

751
00:29:14,310 --> 00:29:13,120
as the prime example involves the

752
00:29:17,070 --> 00:29:14,320
reaction

753
00:29:18,230 --> 00:29:17,080
of the mass of the people to the

754
00:29:21,590 --> 00:29:18,240
grotesquely

755
00:29:22,870 --> 00:29:21,600
undemocratic arrangement of a capitalist

756
00:29:26,470 --> 00:29:22,880
enterprise

757
00:29:28,630 --> 00:29:26,480
by wanting some relief

758
00:29:31,190 --> 00:29:28,640
and the way they get the relief is to

759
00:29:33,430 --> 00:29:31,200
utilize their political power

760
00:29:35,190 --> 00:29:33,440
to get the government and remember we're

761
00:29:37,830 --> 00:29:35,200
talking about societies

762
00:29:39,029 --> 00:29:37,840
in which universal suffrage exists to

763
00:29:42,789 --> 00:29:39,039

get the government

764

00:29:45,990 --> 00:29:42,799

which they vote in to regulate control

765

00:29:46,950 --> 00:29:46,000

and limit the private enterprises that's

766

00:29:50,870 --> 00:29:46,960

called

767

00:29:53,909 --> 00:29:50,880

socialism

768

00:29:55,350 --> 00:29:53,919

sometimes it's called social democracy

769

00:29:58,230 --> 00:29:55,360

sometimes it's called

770

00:29:59,269 --> 00:29:58,240

democratic socialism bernie sanders and

771

00:30:01,909 --> 00:29:59,279

aoc

772

00:30:03,830 --> 00:30:01,919

like to call it democratic socialism the

773

00:30:06,149 --> 00:30:03,840

europeans who they're copying

774

00:30:07,590 --> 00:30:06,159

like to call it social democracy that's

775

00:30:10,389 --> 00:30:07,600

one kind

776

00:30:11,990 --> 00:30:10,399

now there's a second kind and on this

777

00:30:16,389 --> 00:30:12,000

second kind there's a

778

00:30:18,310 --> 00:30:16,399

debate is it socialism is it communism

779

00:30:20,389 --> 00:30:18,320

here's the second kind and then i'll

780

00:30:23,350 --> 00:30:20,399

tell you what the debate is about

781

00:30:24,549 --> 00:30:23,360

the second kind has the government

782

00:30:27,029 --> 00:30:24,559

intervening

783

00:30:27,830 --> 00:30:27,039

not really one moment before we go into

784

00:30:29,269 --> 00:30:27,840

the second kind

785

00:30:30,789 --> 00:30:29,279

because you said there were i just want

786

00:30:31,830 --> 00:30:30,799

to make sure we we have our ground

787

00:30:34,070 --> 00:30:31,840

consolidated

788

00:30:36,470 --> 00:30:34,080

so we said that there were three key

789

00:30:39,590 --> 00:30:36,480

characteristics of socialism yes

790

00:30:43,510 --> 00:30:39,600

uh one that there is this private sphere

791

00:30:45,350 --> 00:30:43,520

that is uh disproportionately

792

00:30:48,230 --> 00:30:45,360

designed to favor those at the top the

793

00:30:51,830 --> 00:30:48,240

major shareholders the employers

794

00:30:53,590 --> 00:30:51,840

and this is at odds with a regulatory

795

00:30:56,310 --> 00:30:53,600

force from the government in the

796

00:30:57,590 --> 00:30:56,320

democratic society of universal suffrage

797

00:30:58,870 --> 00:30:57,600

right these are

798

00:31:00,950 --> 00:30:58,880

two forces that are kind of fighting

799

00:31:02,389 --> 00:31:00,960

each other in socialism are these the

800

00:31:04,149 --> 00:31:02,399

features that define

801
00:31:05,830 --> 00:31:04,159
uh socialism just i just want to make

802
00:31:08,789 --> 00:31:05,840
sure before we hey

803
00:31:10,230 --> 00:31:08,799
they define the first kind of socialism

804
00:31:12,630 --> 00:31:10,240
okay so the first kind so

805
00:31:13,590 --> 00:31:12,640
here's the second thing yes the second

806
00:31:17,269 --> 00:31:13,600
kind

807
00:31:19,509 --> 00:31:17,279
is the government steps in and takes a

808
00:31:22,710 --> 00:31:19,519
much more active role

809
00:31:26,149 --> 00:31:22,720
it displaces the private

810
00:31:29,990 --> 00:31:26,159
owners and the private directors

811
00:31:33,350 --> 00:31:30,000
of the enterprise it gets rid of them

812
00:31:36,789 --> 00:31:33,360
think of the soviet revolution in 1917.

813
00:31:40,389 --> 00:31:36,799

it gets rid of them and it replaces

814

00:31:43,190 --> 00:31:40,399

all of them with state officials

815

00:31:44,789 --> 00:31:43,200

the government is now usually by in

816

00:31:45,669 --> 00:31:44,799

russia it was called the council of

817

00:31:48,870 --> 00:31:45,679

ministers

818

00:31:51,269 --> 00:31:48,880

it sets up a government apparatus

819

00:31:51,909 --> 00:31:51,279

in which government persons people who

820

00:31:54,630 --> 00:31:51,919

have a

821

00:31:56,070 --> 00:31:54,640

official position in a governmental

822

00:31:59,990 --> 00:31:56,080

apparatus

823

00:32:02,389 --> 00:32:00,000

replace the major shareholders and

824

00:32:04,870 --> 00:32:02,399

the board of directors and and so we

825

00:32:06,310 --> 00:32:04,880

talk of in economics we talk of state

826
00:32:10,149 --> 00:32:06,320
enterprises

827
00:32:12,630 --> 00:32:10,159
um but i want to underscore some people

828
00:32:13,990 --> 00:32:12,640
still call this socialism other people

829
00:32:16,310 --> 00:32:14,000
call it communism

830
00:32:17,590 --> 00:32:16,320
that's usually a question of not being

831
00:32:19,509 --> 00:32:17,600
very clear

832
00:32:20,950 --> 00:32:19,519
about what happened and what the people

833
00:32:22,950 --> 00:32:20,960
themselves say

834
00:32:24,389 --> 00:32:22,960
and being lost in the propaganda of the

835
00:32:27,190 --> 00:32:24,399
cold war

836
00:32:29,269 --> 00:32:27,200
let me give you a simple example in

837
00:32:31,350 --> 00:32:29,279
russia and china

838
00:32:32,310 --> 00:32:31,360

the the political party that makes the

839

00:32:35,430 --> 00:32:32,320

revolution

840

00:32:38,630 --> 00:32:35,440

calls itself the communist party

841

00:32:41,750 --> 00:32:38,640

but never let me underscore that

842

00:32:42,710 --> 00:32:41,760

never have either the chinese or the

843

00:32:46,870 --> 00:32:42,720

russians

844

00:32:50,070 --> 00:32:46,880

called what they set up as communism

845

00:32:51,509 --> 00:32:50,080

that's a western invention they called

846

00:32:54,950 --> 00:32:51,519

their societies

847

00:32:57,830 --> 00:32:54,960

socialist for them it was a kind

848

00:32:59,269 --> 00:32:57,840

of socialism in which the government

849

00:33:02,389 --> 00:32:59,279

went beyond

850

00:33:03,110 --> 00:33:02,399

regulating as in scandinavia and western

851
00:33:06,389 --> 00:33:03,120
europe

852
00:33:07,990 --> 00:33:06,399
to actually operating large sections by

853
00:33:11,110 --> 00:33:08,000
the way never 100

854
00:33:14,389 --> 00:33:11,120
but large sections of the economy

855
00:33:17,750 --> 00:33:14,399
as a governmental uh exercise

856
00:33:21,190 --> 00:33:17,760
ussr stands for the union of soviet

857
00:33:23,830 --> 00:33:21,200
socialist republics it's a socialism

858
00:33:24,950 --> 00:33:23,840
and the communist party of china refers

859
00:33:28,070 --> 00:33:24,960
to china

860
00:33:30,310 --> 00:33:28,080
as a socialist economic system with

861
00:33:33,350 --> 00:33:30,320
chinese characteristics

862
00:33:36,389 --> 00:33:33,360
but the notion of a communism was

863
00:33:39,190 --> 00:33:36,399

always in those societies the place

864

00:33:40,070 --> 00:33:39,200

toward which the political party was

865

00:33:43,350 --> 00:33:40,080

hopefully

866

00:33:46,389 --> 00:33:43,360

taking the country not a status

867

00:33:48,149 --> 00:33:46,399

that had ever been achieved so the

868

00:33:51,590 --> 00:33:48,159

soviet union disappears

869

00:33:54,789 --> 00:33:51,600

before it could arrive at communism

870

00:33:57,509 --> 00:33:54,799

okay now so you have two

871

00:33:58,149 --> 00:33:57,519

two competing versions of socialism in

872

00:34:00,310 --> 00:33:58,159

one

873

00:34:01,750 --> 00:34:00,320

the government is regulated bernie

874

00:34:04,149 --> 00:34:01,760

sanders aoc

875

00:34:06,789 --> 00:34:04,159

folks like that in another one you have

876

00:34:07,509 --> 00:34:06,799

the government taking over russia china

877

00:34:10,790 --> 00:34:07,519

vietnam

878

00:34:14,629 --> 00:34:10,800

cuba and so on that's what they do

879

00:34:16,069 --> 00:34:14,639

now there's a third and the third one is

880

00:34:19,750 --> 00:34:16,079

emerging now

881

00:34:23,109 --> 00:34:19,760

because of the historical experiences

882

00:34:26,629 --> 00:34:23,119

of the first two see we have

883

00:34:28,950 --> 00:34:26,639

a century of the first kind of socialism

884

00:34:30,069 --> 00:34:28,960

and we have now a century of the second

885

00:34:32,230 --> 00:34:30,079

kind

886

00:34:34,149 --> 00:34:32,240

we have a lot of experience with

887

00:34:37,510 --> 00:34:34,159

socialist governments

888

00:34:39,750 --> 00:34:37,520

regulating private capitalism

889

00:34:40,550 --> 00:34:39,760

i i for example can tell you if you're

890

00:34:43,190 --> 00:34:40,560

interested

891

00:34:45,430 --> 00:34:43,200

about portugal portugal has been

892

00:34:48,230 --> 00:34:45,440

governed for the last several years

893

00:34:50,230 --> 00:34:48,240

by a coalition it comprises the

894

00:34:52,629 --> 00:34:50,240

portuguese socialist party

895

00:34:54,710 --> 00:34:52,639

the portuguese communist party and the

896

00:34:57,270 --> 00:34:54,720

portuguese green party

897

00:34:58,630 --> 00:34:57,280

i will not embarrass you by asking you

898

00:35:00,790 --> 00:34:58,640

whether you were aware

899

00:35:01,750 --> 00:35:00,800

that portugal has been governed by this

900

00:35:04,630 --> 00:35:01,760

coalition

901
00:35:05,510 --> 00:35:04,640
over recent years if you are typical

902
00:35:09,109 --> 00:35:05,520
americans

903
00:35:11,589 --> 00:35:09,119
you had no clue and that's the

904
00:35:13,589 --> 00:35:11,599
seabees that comes to mind in greece in

905
00:35:15,990 --> 00:35:13,599
greece

906
00:35:18,230 --> 00:35:16,000
there's definitely a movement right yeah

907
00:35:21,510 --> 00:35:18,240
but syriza didn't last real long

908
00:35:21,910 --> 00:35:21,520
and the portuguese experiment did and so

909
00:35:29,750 --> 00:35:21,920
it

910
00:35:32,390 --> 00:35:29,760
here's my point the the russian

911
00:35:34,150 --> 00:35:32,400
and the chinese and the western europe

912
00:35:37,109 --> 00:35:34,160
and the scandinavian

913
00:35:38,230 --> 00:35:37,119

these kinds of socialism have now been

914

00:35:41,270 --> 00:35:38,240

tried

915

00:35:41,990 --> 00:35:41,280

over the last century and while they

916

00:35:45,270 --> 00:35:42,000

achieved

917

00:35:48,310 --> 00:35:45,280

much that is valuable they also

918

00:35:51,589 --> 00:35:48,320

experienced major failings

919

00:35:53,829 --> 00:35:51,599

major failures major setbacks and the

920

00:35:56,310 --> 00:35:53,839

job of the marxist movement

921

00:35:57,270 --> 00:35:56,320

that tries to understand and analyze all

922

00:36:01,030 --> 00:35:57,280

of this

923

00:36:04,470 --> 00:36:01,040

is to understand both the successes

924

00:36:06,630 --> 00:36:04,480

and the failures so that the experiments

925

00:36:08,150 --> 00:36:06,640

will have taught us something and the

926
00:36:11,109 --> 00:36:08,160
next phase

927
00:36:11,510 --> 00:36:11,119
will be more successful and better than

928
00:36:14,150 --> 00:36:11,520
these

929
00:36:15,349 --> 00:36:14,160
early experiments in going beyond

930
00:36:16,870 --> 00:36:15,359
capitalism

931
00:36:18,710 --> 00:36:16,880
so what we're getting into the third

932
00:36:20,230 --> 00:36:18,720
phase and as a preface is this the one

933
00:36:23,190 --> 00:36:20,240
that you advocate for

934
00:36:24,550 --> 00:36:23,200
absolutely so here's the third

935
00:36:27,270 --> 00:36:24,560
definition

936
00:36:29,109 --> 00:36:27,280
of either socialism communism i really

937
00:36:32,150 --> 00:36:29,119
don't care about the language

938
00:36:34,069 --> 00:36:32,160

all that much the third version of

939

00:36:37,190 --> 00:36:34,079

socialism or if you like

940

00:36:40,230 --> 00:36:37,200

communism has to do with

941

00:36:42,310 --> 00:36:40,240

the response to the analytic

942

00:36:43,349 --> 00:36:42,320

of what the first two experiments in

943

00:36:46,390 --> 00:36:43,359

socialism

944

00:36:48,310 --> 00:36:46,400

of the last century have taught us

945

00:36:50,710 --> 00:36:48,320

and here's the biggest single lesson

946

00:36:53,750 --> 00:36:50,720

since our time is limited

947

00:36:55,270 --> 00:36:53,760

that the changes made both in the

948

00:36:58,790 --> 00:36:55,280

european western

949

00:37:01,589 --> 00:36:58,800

socialism and in the russia-china

950

00:37:02,790 --> 00:37:01,599

governmental apparatus was that what

951
00:37:05,270 --> 00:37:02,800
they changed

952
00:37:06,150 --> 00:37:05,280
was what we in economics call the macro

953
00:37:09,270 --> 00:37:06,160
level the big

954
00:37:12,069 --> 00:37:09,280
level of the economy they never

955
00:37:13,030 --> 00:37:12,079
here comes the punchline they never

956
00:37:16,870 --> 00:37:13,040
radically

957
00:37:19,990 --> 00:37:16,880
altered the internal organization

958
00:37:20,950 --> 00:37:20,000
of the enterprise the factory the office

959
00:37:23,430 --> 00:37:20,960
the store

960
00:37:25,109 --> 00:37:23,440
where the work gets done where the goods

961
00:37:28,310 --> 00:37:25,119
and services are produced

962
00:37:31,270 --> 00:37:28,320
and distributed they left them

963
00:37:33,109 --> 00:37:31,280

as a small group of people at the top

964

00:37:36,870 --> 00:37:33,119

making all the decisions

965

00:37:40,230 --> 00:37:36,880

and the mass of people being excluded

966

00:37:43,109 --> 00:37:40,240

from the decisions but required to live

967

00:37:46,069 --> 00:37:43,119

with the consequences of those decisions

968

00:37:47,829 --> 00:37:46,079

from which they had been excluded

969

00:37:51,109 --> 00:37:47,839

therefore

970

00:37:54,790 --> 00:37:51,119

the analytic runs as follows the

971

00:37:58,550 --> 00:37:54,800

failures the flaws

972

00:38:03,190 --> 00:37:58,560

of the existing experiments in socialism

973

00:38:07,230 --> 00:38:03,200

can be corrected can be improved upon

974

00:38:10,230 --> 00:38:07,240

if we take the step of radically

975

00:38:13,670 --> 00:38:10,240

democratizing the enterprise

976
00:38:17,589 --> 00:38:13,680
making socialism be not just

977
00:38:21,349 --> 00:38:17,599
a macroeconomic change but fundamentally

978
00:38:24,390 --> 00:38:21,359
a micro economic transformation

979
00:38:27,910 --> 00:38:24,400
in which you leave behind

980
00:38:31,109 --> 00:38:27,920
the dichotomy employer

981
00:38:34,069 --> 00:38:31,119
employee which i would argue

982
00:38:36,069 --> 00:38:34,079
is simply the modern version of the

983
00:38:39,750 --> 00:38:36,079
earlier dichotomy's

984
00:38:41,990 --> 00:38:39,760
lord surf master slave

985
00:38:42,950 --> 00:38:42,000
get rid of them democratize the

986
00:38:46,230 --> 00:38:42,960
enterprise

987
00:38:49,030 --> 00:38:46,240
it becomes a community

988
00:38:49,670 --> 00:38:49,040

governed by one person let me finish one

989

00:38:53,190 --> 00:38:49,680

person

990

00:38:55,829 --> 00:38:53,200

one vote where all the decisions

991

00:38:56,550 --> 00:38:55,839

what to produce how to produce where to

992

00:38:58,310 --> 00:38:56,560

produce

993

00:39:00,790 --> 00:38:58,320

and what to do with the profits or the

994

00:39:02,630 --> 00:39:00,800

net revenue or the surplus depending on

995

00:39:05,670 --> 00:39:02,640

how you think about these things

996

00:39:08,069 --> 00:39:05,680

are made democratically the

997

00:39:11,030 --> 00:39:08,079

democratization of the enterprise

998

00:39:12,230 --> 00:39:11,040

was not part of european western

999

00:39:15,829 --> 00:39:12,240

socialism

1000

00:39:19,589 --> 00:39:15,839

and it was not part of soviet chinese

1001

00:39:22,310 --> 00:39:19,599

socialism either footnote

1002

00:39:23,910 --> 00:39:22,320

for the last seven years the cuban

1003

00:39:26,550 --> 00:39:23,920

communist party

1004

00:39:27,510 --> 00:39:26,560

has been making a major effort to

1005

00:39:30,710 --> 00:39:27,520

develop

1006

00:39:32,550 --> 00:39:30,720

what are called worker co-ops which is

1007

00:39:34,630 --> 00:39:32,560

what i'm talking about

1008

00:39:35,829 --> 00:39:34,640

and make them an important part of the

1009

00:39:39,589 --> 00:39:35,839

cuban economy

1010

00:39:41,190 --> 00:39:39,599

so there is movement but that idea that

1011

00:39:43,670 --> 00:39:41,200

socialism needs

1012

00:39:44,550 --> 00:39:43,680

the micro level democratization of the

1013

00:39:47,670 --> 00:39:44,560

enterprise

1014

00:39:48,630 --> 00:39:47,680

that's the third kind of socialism if

1015

00:39:51,910 --> 00:39:48,640

you like

1016

00:39:53,349 --> 00:39:51,920

communism if you wish because the word

1017

00:39:56,630 --> 00:39:53,359

communism then

1018

00:39:58,150 --> 00:39:56,640

goes back to its root community common

1019

00:40:00,710 --> 00:39:58,160

and that's what it is to make a

1020

00:40:04,150 --> 00:40:00,720

community a democratic community

1021

00:40:06,069 --> 00:40:04,160

out of the workplace under the slogan

1022

00:40:07,270 --> 00:40:06,079

you're never going to have political

1023

00:40:10,230 --> 00:40:07,280

democracy

1024

00:40:12,230 --> 00:40:10,240

unless you build it on a foundation of

1025

00:40:15,109 --> 00:40:12,240

economic democracy

1026
00:40:16,710 --> 00:40:15,119
and that's what this kind of socialism

1027
00:40:19,109 --> 00:40:16,720
advocates

1028
00:40:20,230 --> 00:40:19,119
so that idea of communism comes from

1029
00:40:23,510 --> 00:40:20,240
commune

1030
00:40:26,630 --> 00:40:23,520
and in was

1031
00:40:30,390 --> 00:40:26,640
interestingly enough there was uh

1032
00:40:33,430 --> 00:40:30,400
a movement to communes pre-soviet union

1033
00:40:35,670 --> 00:40:33,440
in russia that kind of helped spark that

1034
00:40:37,829 --> 00:40:35,680
so this idea of you start small and you

1035
00:40:39,510 --> 00:40:37,839
create these smaller experiments and

1036
00:40:41,030 --> 00:40:39,520
then you scale them to the

1037
00:40:44,550 --> 00:40:41,040
you know to the larger picture to the

1038
00:40:47,109 --> 00:40:44,560

macro picture uh is definitely something

1039

00:40:48,230 --> 00:40:47,119

that wouldn't be unprecedented in the

1040

00:40:52,630 --> 00:40:48,240

history of

1041

00:40:54,230 --> 00:40:52,640

of communism let me add there are many

1042

00:40:55,910 --> 00:40:54,240

experiments and they weren't just in

1043

00:40:58,309 --> 00:40:55,920

russia they were all over the place

1044

00:40:59,270 --> 00:40:58,319

there were many experiments in what i

1045

00:41:02,710 --> 00:40:59,280

would call

1046

00:41:03,430 --> 00:41:02,720

the communism of a worker co-op type of

1047

00:41:04,870 --> 00:41:03,440

enterprise

1048

00:41:06,950 --> 00:41:04,880

there were many here in the united

1049

00:41:09,750 --> 00:41:06,960

states that i'm i'm speaking to you from

1050

00:41:10,870 --> 00:41:09,760

and in canada as well so it's all over

1051
00:41:13,910 --> 00:41:10,880
the place

1052
00:41:14,550 --> 00:41:13,920
there is nothing new in a sense what you

1053
00:41:17,910 --> 00:41:14,560
have

1054
00:41:19,030 --> 00:41:17,920
is a determination now to institute it

1055
00:41:22,309 --> 00:41:19,040
on a social

1056
00:41:22,950 --> 00:41:22,319
scale and one more thing because it

1057
00:41:25,510 --> 00:41:22,960
seems to

1058
00:41:28,390 --> 00:41:25,520
trouble americans when i talk this

1059
00:41:30,790 --> 00:41:28,400
notion that you start in a small

1060
00:41:33,030 --> 00:41:30,800
group a couple you know a communal

1061
00:41:35,750 --> 00:41:33,040
workshop that has 10 people in it or

1062
00:41:37,829 --> 00:41:35,760
20 people and then you build from there

1063
00:41:40,870 --> 00:41:37,839

as somehow not workable

1064

00:41:41,829 --> 00:41:40,880

i got news for you that's how capitalism

1065

00:41:43,829 --> 00:41:41,839

developed

1066

00:41:44,950 --> 00:41:43,839

the early capitalisms that came out of

1067

00:41:47,670 --> 00:41:44,960

feudal europe

1068

00:41:47,990 --> 00:41:47,680

they were tiny they were five people and

1069

00:41:51,910 --> 00:41:48,000

10

1070

00:41:55,109 --> 00:41:51,920

people and they had to learn how to grow

1071

00:41:57,109 --> 00:41:55,119

in the process of growing they invented

1072

00:41:58,470 --> 00:41:57,119

this joint stock company the whole

1073

00:42:01,109 --> 00:41:58,480

notion that you could have a

1074

00:42:01,750 --> 00:42:01,119

owner who wasn't on the spot working

1075

00:42:03,750 --> 00:42:01,760

with you

1076
00:42:04,870 --> 00:42:03,760
those were traumatic and difficult

1077
00:42:07,109 --> 00:42:04,880
transitions

1078
00:42:09,430 --> 00:42:07,119
they will be difficult for the

1079
00:42:11,750 --> 00:42:09,440
collective democratic communism

1080
00:42:13,030 --> 00:42:11,760
too but no one should think that because

1081
00:42:15,270 --> 00:42:13,040
you started small

1082
00:42:17,030 --> 00:42:15,280
that makes you in any way different from

1083
00:42:19,349 --> 00:42:17,040
every other economic system

1084
00:42:20,550 --> 00:42:19,359
and on that note right of joint stock

1085
00:42:22,390 --> 00:42:20,560
companies marx

1086
00:42:24,150 --> 00:42:22,400
when he writes on co-ops mentions that

1087
00:42:26,069 --> 00:42:24,160
right he says with the development of

1088
00:42:28,230 --> 00:42:26,079

cooperatives

1089

00:42:30,550 --> 00:42:28,240

on the workers part and joint stock

1090

00:42:33,670 --> 00:42:30,560

companies on the part of the bourgeoisie

1091

00:42:36,150 --> 00:42:33,680

the last pretext for confusing profit

1092

00:42:37,030 --> 00:42:36,160

of enterprise with the wages of

1093

00:42:40,550 --> 00:42:37,040

management

1094

00:42:44,150 --> 00:42:40,560

was removed and profit came to appear

1095

00:42:47,510 --> 00:42:44,160

in practice as what is undeniably

1096

00:42:50,790 --> 00:42:47,520

right sorry as what is undeniably

1097

00:42:53,670 --> 00:42:50,800

uh was in theory mere surplus value

1098

00:42:55,589 --> 00:42:53,680

value for which no equivalent was paid

1099

00:42:57,910 --> 00:42:55,599

he says it's in the third volume of

1100

00:42:59,030 --> 00:42:57,920

capital and so there's definitely this

1101

00:43:03,030 --> 00:42:59,040

this discussion

1102

00:43:05,349 --> 00:43:03,040

with uh cooperatives do you feel that

1103

00:43:06,230 --> 00:43:05,359

cooperatives in your review of marx are

1104

00:43:08,470 --> 00:43:06,240

cooperatives

1105

00:43:10,230 --> 00:43:08,480

do they take to do his writings on

1106

00:43:13,349 --> 00:43:10,240

cooperatives take essential

1107

00:43:16,550 --> 00:43:13,359

rules or do they take a sideline role

1108

00:43:18,950 --> 00:43:16,560

if this is sort of the true marxism

1109

00:43:19,750 --> 00:43:18,960

wouldn't we expect marx to just mainly

1110

00:43:23,190 --> 00:43:19,760

focus on

1111

00:43:24,470 --> 00:43:23,200

cooperatives yeah i would never argue

1112

00:43:26,390 --> 00:43:24,480

that it's marx's main

1113

00:43:27,910 --> 00:43:26,400

goal let me remind you a little bit

1114

00:43:32,150 --> 00:43:27,920

about marx

1115

00:43:35,589 --> 00:43:32,160

um he he took the analysis of capitalism

1116

00:43:37,829 --> 00:43:35,599

as a whole as his project and he

1117

00:43:39,670 --> 00:43:37,839

and that's crazy nobody can do that no

1118

00:43:42,309 --> 00:43:39,680

single person could ever do that

1119

00:43:43,910 --> 00:43:42,319

he undertook it as the french would say

1120

00:43:46,230 --> 00:43:43,920

fought demure

1121

00:43:47,990 --> 00:43:46,240

because it was the best he could do and

1122

00:43:50,230 --> 00:43:48,000

so he was going to try it

1123

00:43:51,589 --> 00:43:50,240

he only finished volume one volumes two

1124

00:43:54,309 --> 00:43:51,599

and three were put together

1125

00:43:55,430 --> 00:43:54,319

from his notebooks and his scribblings

1126

00:43:59,030 --> 00:43:55,440

volume two by

1127

00:44:01,109 --> 00:43:59,040

uh by engels and volume three by kowtsky

1128

00:44:02,470 --> 00:44:01,119

people who came after him or were

1129

00:44:04,950 --> 00:44:02,480

colleagues of his

1130

00:44:05,750 --> 00:44:04,960

so they made the decision given what was

1131

00:44:07,829 --> 00:44:05,760

in the mind

1132

00:44:09,510 --> 00:44:07,839

their minds at the time of what was

1133

00:44:11,670 --> 00:44:09,520

important and what was not and which

1134

00:44:14,390 --> 00:44:11,680

notebook would be

1135

00:44:16,790 --> 00:44:14,400

developed and which wouldn't etc etc so

1136

00:44:19,910 --> 00:44:16,800

marx's comments on co-ops which weren't

1137

00:44:22,069 --> 00:44:19,920

a major historical phenomena were

1138

00:44:23,109 --> 00:44:22,079

secondary to him you know he didn't

1139

00:44:25,510 --> 00:44:23,119

write about the state

1140

00:44:26,150 --> 00:44:25,520

either there's no marxist theory of the

1141

00:44:28,309 --> 00:44:26,160

state

1142

00:44:29,270 --> 00:44:28,319

there's very little on world trade and

1143

00:44:31,270 --> 00:44:29,280

stuff like that

1144

00:44:32,470 --> 00:44:31,280

these were important topics we know that

1145

00:44:35,030 --> 00:44:32,480

because he said so

1146

00:44:35,750 --> 00:44:35,040

but he didn't get to the kind of

1147

00:44:38,150 --> 00:44:35,760

analytic

1148

00:44:39,430 --> 00:44:38,160

of them that later marxists have been

1149

00:44:42,790 --> 00:44:39,440

able to do

1150

00:44:45,829 --> 00:44:42,800

so i think what you what you see is

1151
00:44:46,230 --> 00:44:45,839
people like me given what happened in

1152
00:44:49,670 --> 00:44:46,240
the

1153
00:44:51,430 --> 00:44:49,680
century after marx died building up on

1154
00:44:54,150 --> 00:44:51,440
parts of his analytic

1155
00:44:55,990 --> 00:44:54,160
that other people uh found less

1156
00:44:56,950 --> 00:44:56,000
important because of the times in which

1157
00:44:59,670 --> 00:44:56,960
they live

1158
00:45:01,589 --> 00:44:59,680
i'm not sure what in the world exactly

1159
00:45:04,790 --> 00:45:01,599
you would want to infer from that

1160
00:45:06,630 --> 00:45:04,800
one more example when i first started

1161
00:45:08,150 --> 00:45:06,640
getting interested in marks in economics

1162
00:45:10,069 --> 00:45:08,160
my

1163
00:45:11,750 --> 00:45:10,079

reading led me to believe that there was

1164

00:45:13,750 --> 00:45:11,760

a very important question

1165

00:45:14,870 --> 00:45:13,760

about the relationship between marx's

1166

00:45:17,349 --> 00:45:14,880

theory of value

1167

00:45:18,950 --> 00:45:17,359

on the one hand and explaining market

1168

00:45:21,510 --> 00:45:18,960

prices on the other

1169

00:45:22,710 --> 00:45:21,520

since i was taking courses in economics

1170

00:45:25,109 --> 00:45:22,720

i can tell you that

1171

00:45:27,190 --> 00:45:25,119

at harvard yale and stanford all

1172

00:45:29,430 --> 00:45:27,200

economics is about explaining

1173

00:45:31,109 --> 00:45:29,440

prices it's sometimes called price

1174

00:45:33,910 --> 00:45:31,119

theory because

1175

00:45:36,230 --> 00:45:33,920

that's what it focuses on it took me a

1176

00:45:39,589 --> 00:45:36,240

long time to figure out

1177

00:45:43,589 --> 00:45:39,599

that marx wasn't interested in prices

1178

00:45:46,230 --> 00:45:43,599

that was for him a secondary tertiary

1179

00:45:46,710 --> 00:45:46,240

issue he was interested in conflict

1180

00:45:49,750 --> 00:45:46,720

between

1181

00:45:52,550 --> 00:45:49,760

classes he was interested in the dynamic

1182

00:45:54,150 --> 00:45:52,560

that makes uh capitalist societies

1183

00:45:57,990 --> 00:45:54,160

function and change

1184

00:46:00,309 --> 00:45:58,000

and for him prices were a minor matter

1185

00:46:01,750 --> 00:46:00,319

and you have to understand that but

1186

00:46:04,150 --> 00:46:01,760

marxist for a while

1187

00:46:05,270 --> 00:46:04,160

didn't and went through enormous

1188

00:46:07,510 --> 00:46:05,280

connections

1189

00:46:09,910 --> 00:46:07,520

trying to figure out how to transform

1190

00:46:12,950 --> 00:46:09,920

the value system marx articulates

1191

00:46:15,430 --> 00:46:12,960

in volume one and three with the price

1192

00:46:16,550 --> 00:46:15,440

system uh that western capitalist

1193

00:46:19,670 --> 00:46:16,560

economics

1194

00:46:22,309 --> 00:46:19,680

deals with since i was a mathematician

1195

00:46:23,589 --> 00:46:22,319

it was quick for me to understand that

1196

00:46:26,150 --> 00:46:23,599

the mathematical

1197

00:46:26,870 --> 00:46:26,160

posing of this problem missed the whole

1198

00:46:28,790 --> 00:46:26,880

point

1199

00:46:30,870 --> 00:46:28,800

even though it engaged an entire

1200

00:46:34,150 --> 00:46:30,880

generation of economists

1201
00:46:35,430 --> 00:46:34,160
because after world war ii what was lost

1202
00:46:38,069 --> 00:46:35,440
to economics

1203
00:46:39,510 --> 00:46:38,079
in terms of the broader social issues

1204
00:46:42,790 --> 00:46:39,520
was replaced

1205
00:46:43,510 --> 00:46:42,800
by a fetishization of very simple mind

1206
00:46:46,150 --> 00:46:43,520
and math

1207
00:46:46,550 --> 00:46:46,160
and arithmetic which the economists

1208
00:46:50,230 --> 00:46:46,560
thought

1209
00:46:53,430 --> 00:46:50,240
was the greatest breakthrough imaginable

1210
00:46:55,030 --> 00:46:53,440
but wasn't so in the past too you've

1211
00:46:56,790 --> 00:46:55,040
talked about how

1212
00:46:58,309 --> 00:46:56,800
private property and the idea of

1213
00:46:59,109 --> 00:46:58,319

government ownership were something that

1214

00:47:00,790 --> 00:46:59,119

marx

1215

00:47:02,550 --> 00:47:00,800

didn't really have as a central focus

1216

00:47:05,750 --> 00:47:02,560

and it's sort of mistributed

1217

00:47:08,309 --> 00:47:05,760

uh to his his works right you say

1218

00:47:09,109 --> 00:47:08,319

uh you would have to search long and

1219

00:47:12,069 --> 00:47:09,119

hard

1220

00:47:12,710 --> 00:47:12,079

in the very voluminous works of karl

1221

00:47:15,829 --> 00:47:12,720

marx

1222

00:47:16,950 --> 00:47:15,839

to find one word about this he wasn't

1223

00:47:19,109 --> 00:47:16,960

interested

1224

00:47:21,829 --> 00:47:19,119

in the government he didn't write an

1225

00:47:26,069 --> 00:47:21,839

article or a book about the government

1226

00:47:30,549 --> 00:47:26,079

he wasn't interested and so this

1227

00:47:33,510 --> 00:47:30,559

this misattribution what caused it

1228

00:47:35,270 --> 00:47:33,520

a strategic decision made by socialists

1229

00:47:35,829 --> 00:47:35,280

in the 19th century kind of thing that

1230

00:47:39,829 --> 00:47:35,839

happens in

1231

00:47:43,589 --> 00:47:39,839

all schools of thought as they evolve

1232

00:47:45,109 --> 00:47:43,599

as you read marx as people like marx and

1233

00:47:46,790 --> 00:47:45,119

he wasn't the only one in the 19th

1234

00:47:49,750 --> 00:47:46,800

century not by a lone shot

1235

00:47:51,430 --> 00:47:49,760

and you you became aware in the middle

1236

00:47:53,589 --> 00:47:51,440

of the 19th century

1237

00:47:54,710 --> 00:47:53,599

that the great promises of the french

1238

00:47:56,950 --> 00:47:54,720

revolution

1239

00:48:00,549 --> 00:47:56,960

had been betrayed that the french

1240

00:48:03,030 --> 00:48:00,559

revolution had said to the europeans

1241

00:48:03,910 --> 00:48:03,040

that if you bring in capitalism to

1242

00:48:07,270 --> 00:48:03,920

replace

1243

00:48:11,510 --> 00:48:07,280

feudalism you will achieve

1244

00:48:16,150 --> 00:48:13,990

liberty equality and brotherhood and if

1245

00:48:19,190 --> 00:48:16,160

you deal with the american revolution

1246

00:48:23,109 --> 00:48:19,200

add democracy that capitalism

1247

00:48:25,910 --> 00:48:23,119

brings those human values

1248

00:48:27,030 --> 00:48:25,920

into reality that was the promise of the

1249

00:48:28,870 --> 00:48:27,040

french revolution

1250

00:48:30,470 --> 00:48:28,880

because that's what it was its slogan

1251

00:48:34,069 --> 00:48:30,480

liberty equality fraternity

1252

00:48:37,430 --> 00:48:34,079

okay by the 19th century critics

1253

00:48:40,790 --> 00:48:37,440

were able to make the following insight

1254

00:48:43,270 --> 00:48:40,800

capitalism sure has replaced feudalism

1255

00:48:45,109 --> 00:48:43,280

but as a mechanism to deliver liberty

1256

00:48:48,309 --> 00:48:45,119

equality and fraternity

1257

00:48:50,549 --> 00:48:48,319

it is a 100 bust

1258

00:48:52,150 --> 00:48:50,559

it failed and the only interesting

1259

00:48:55,190 --> 00:48:52,160

question was

1260

00:48:58,710 --> 00:48:55,200

for them why why

1261

00:49:01,750 --> 00:48:58,720

did this promise get betrayed

1262

00:49:05,510 --> 00:49:01,760

marx's answer was

1263

00:49:09,670 --> 00:49:05,520

it got betrayed because

1264

00:49:12,710 --> 00:49:09,680

capitalism itself is the obstacle

1265

00:49:16,069 --> 00:49:12,720

to achieving liberty equality fraternity

1266

00:49:19,109 --> 00:49:16,079

of course it could not bring what it is

1267

00:49:21,589 --> 00:49:19,119

itself the enemy of

1268

00:49:22,470 --> 00:49:21,599

and he devoted himself to making that

1269

00:49:25,589 --> 00:49:22,480

case

1270

00:49:26,470 --> 00:49:25,599

in his writings and he succeeded along

1271

00:49:29,030 --> 00:49:26,480

with others

1272

00:49:29,829 --> 00:49:29,040

so by the middle of the 19th century you

1273

00:49:34,069 --> 00:49:29,839

have

1274

00:49:37,030 --> 00:49:34,079

an enormous body

1275

00:49:38,790 --> 00:49:37,040

most beautifully encapsulated in in

1276

00:49:41,510 --> 00:49:38,800

german-speaking europe

1277

00:49:42,549 --> 00:49:41,520

uh austria on the one hand and germany

1278

00:49:45,270 --> 00:49:42,559

on the other

1279

00:49:47,430 --> 00:49:45,280

uh in terms of the spd in germany the

1280

00:49:49,109 --> 00:49:47,440

socialist party of

1281

00:49:50,870 --> 00:49:49,119

in german the country is called

1282

00:49:52,950 --> 00:49:50,880

deutschland the spd

1283

00:49:55,190 --> 00:49:52,960

socialist party of deutschland and in

1284

00:49:55,750 --> 00:49:55,200

austria the flourishing of marxist

1285

00:49:57,430 --> 00:49:55,760

theory

1286

00:49:59,430 --> 00:49:57,440

uh on a scale no one had ever seen

1287

00:50:02,549 --> 00:49:59,440

before was the first

1288

00:50:03,430 --> 00:50:02,559

flower of the postmarks generation of

1289

00:50:06,549 --> 00:50:03,440

marxists

1290

00:50:07,270 --> 00:50:06,559

who by the way were personally connected

1291

00:50:11,349 --> 00:50:07,280

to

1292

00:50:13,750 --> 00:50:11,359

uh sigmund freud uh rudolph carnap

1293

00:50:14,470 --> 00:50:13,760

lutwick wittgenstein and all of modern

1294

00:50:16,309 --> 00:50:14,480

thinking

1295

00:50:18,230 --> 00:50:16,319

which is another reason why excluding

1296

00:50:22,150 --> 00:50:18,240

marxism from the curriculum

1297

00:50:23,990 --> 00:50:22,160

is such a mind-bending craziness anyway

1298

00:50:25,349 --> 00:50:24,000

the question then became in the 19th

1299

00:50:26,870 --> 00:50:25,359

century how are you going to get from

1300

00:50:30,069 --> 00:50:26,880

capitalism

1301
00:50:31,750 --> 00:50:30,079
to the socialism that can bring liberty

1302
00:50:33,109 --> 00:50:31,760
equality and fraternity in the way

1303
00:50:36,309 --> 00:50:33,119
capitalism couldn't

1304
00:50:41,190 --> 00:50:36,319
and the answer they arrived at was

1305
00:50:44,710 --> 00:50:41,200
grab the state see if the mass of people

1306
00:50:47,270 --> 00:50:44,720
can get their hands on the state

1307
00:50:48,470 --> 00:50:47,280
because that will be the strategic key

1308
00:50:52,309 --> 00:50:48,480
way to move

1309
00:50:54,710 --> 00:50:52,319
if we get this state then we can use the

1310
00:50:58,390 --> 00:50:54,720
power of the state

1311
00:51:00,870 --> 00:50:58,400
to make the transition beyond capitalism

1312
00:51:03,190 --> 00:51:00,880
because there's no other way to get the

1313
00:51:05,670 --> 00:51:03,200

liberty equality and fraternity

1314

00:51:07,109 --> 00:51:05,680

that we have been motivated by the

1315

00:51:10,390 --> 00:51:07,119

french revolution

1316

00:51:14,309 --> 00:51:10,400

to seek so the focus on the state

1317

00:51:14,950 --> 00:51:14,319

becomes a strategic decision has nothing

1318

00:51:20,390 --> 00:51:14,960

to do

1319

00:51:22,309 --> 00:51:20,400

how we're going to get there and the big

1320

00:51:23,670 --> 00:51:22,319

debate then becomes by the end of the

1321

00:51:26,069 --> 00:51:23,680

19th century

1322

00:51:27,670 --> 00:51:26,079

do you grab the state by means of a

1323

00:51:31,430 --> 00:51:27,680

violent revolution

1324

00:51:34,069 --> 00:51:31,440

or by evolutionary parliamentary

1325

00:51:36,230 --> 00:51:34,079

politics and that's what engages the

1326

00:51:38,150 --> 00:51:36,240

state becomes really important

1327

00:51:39,750 --> 00:51:38,160

and what about for you is violence ever

1328

00:51:42,549 --> 00:51:39,760

justified

1329

00:51:44,230 --> 00:51:42,559

to bring about socialism only if it's

1330

00:51:47,030 --> 00:51:44,240

the self-defense

1331

00:51:48,470 --> 00:51:47,040

if the bourgeoisie can't leave quietly

1332

00:51:49,670 --> 00:51:48,480

then they'll have to leave some other

1333

00:51:52,549 --> 00:51:49,680

way

1334

00:51:53,990 --> 00:51:52,559

well when you say self-defense violence

1335

00:51:55,190 --> 00:51:54,000

can be interpreted as words

1336

00:51:56,710 --> 00:51:55,200

as we've seen on some of the

1337

00:51:58,390 --> 00:51:56,720

contemporary discourse like you're

1338

00:51:59,910 --> 00:51:58,400

assaulting me with your words

1339

00:52:01,750 --> 00:51:59,920

there are various ways of defining what

1340

00:52:03,030 --> 00:52:01,760

self-defense is so when you say

1341

00:52:06,069 --> 00:52:03,040

self-defense

1342

00:52:08,230 --> 00:52:06,079

what are you meaning by that

1343

00:52:09,910 --> 00:52:08,240

well in the world as i see it today the

1344

00:52:11,990 --> 00:52:09,920

monopoly of physical force

1345

00:52:12,950 --> 00:52:12,000

is in the hands of governments that are

1346

00:52:16,069 --> 00:52:12,960

in turn

1347

00:52:16,630 --> 00:52:16,079

agents of and tools of the capitalist

1348

00:52:19,670 --> 00:52:16,640

system

1349

00:52:21,510 --> 00:52:19,680

which they are devoted to reproduce

1350

00:52:23,349 --> 00:52:21,520

if the mass of people don't want

1351

00:52:26,549 --> 00:52:23,359

capitalism anymore

1352

00:52:29,990 --> 00:52:26,559

then the question becomes what is the

1353

00:52:33,190 --> 00:52:30,000

capitalist part of the society that has

1354

00:52:34,390 --> 00:52:33,200

the control of the monopoly of means of

1355

00:52:37,750 --> 00:52:34,400

physical force

1356

00:52:40,390 --> 00:52:37,760

what are they going to do if they exceed

1357

00:52:41,670 --> 00:52:40,400

to the will of the people to move on and

1358

00:52:44,630 --> 00:52:41,680

have a different system

1359

00:52:47,750 --> 00:52:44,640

then we don't need violence but if they

1360

00:52:49,910 --> 00:52:47,760

decide to use their monopoly of force

1361

00:52:51,990 --> 00:52:49,920

and the way i read history they don't

1362

00:52:54,870 --> 00:52:52,000

hesitate at all

1363

00:52:56,549 --> 00:52:54,880

then the question becomes for us will we

1364

00:53:00,470 --> 00:52:56,559

defend ourselves

1365

00:53:02,630 --> 00:53:00,480

or will we not speaking of force

1366

00:53:03,589 --> 00:53:02,640

what lenin lenin in the state and

1367

00:53:06,230 --> 00:53:03,599

revolutions

1368

00:53:07,670 --> 00:53:06,240

he doesn't like judges he doesn't like

1369

00:53:08,790 --> 00:53:07,680

police he doesn't like the military

1370

00:53:10,150 --> 00:53:08,800

because those are tools of the

1371

00:53:12,710 --> 00:53:10,160

bourgeoisie

1372

00:53:14,549 --> 00:53:12,720

do you what do you see what do you like

1373

00:53:17,349 --> 00:53:14,559

or not like about the defunding movement

1374

00:53:17,670 --> 00:53:17,359

defunding the police movement well i

1375

00:53:19,349 --> 00:53:17,680

don't

1376

00:53:21,030 --> 00:53:19,359

i'll be glad to come back to that let me

1377

00:53:22,069 --> 00:53:21,040

can i just finish the other point that i

1378

00:53:23,589 --> 00:53:22,079

was making because

1379

00:53:25,750 --> 00:53:23,599

i was still answering this question

1380

00:53:29,190 --> 00:53:25,760

about the state that that yeah before

1381

00:53:31,990 --> 00:53:29,200

go on go on my friend okay um

1382

00:53:32,870 --> 00:53:32,000

so here's what happened socialists

1383

00:53:35,589 --> 00:53:32,880

figured it out

1384

00:53:37,910 --> 00:53:35,599

they figured out how to get to state in

1385

00:53:40,470 --> 00:53:37,920

russia they did it by a revolution

1386

00:53:42,309 --> 00:53:40,480

in western europe as in portugal as i

1387

00:53:44,230 --> 00:53:42,319

gave you an example a minute ago

1388

00:53:45,430 --> 00:53:44,240

they did it in parliamentary means and

1389

00:53:47,829 --> 00:53:45,440

you know they've done it

1390

00:53:48,790 --> 00:53:47,839

quite successfully in many countries

1391

00:53:52,390 --> 00:53:48,800

socialists

1392

00:53:55,190 --> 00:53:52,400

have taken political or state power

1393

00:53:56,230 --> 00:53:55,200

now the question becomes once they've

1394

00:53:58,390 --> 00:53:56,240

done that

1395

00:54:00,630 --> 00:53:58,400

given the theory and the strategy

1396

00:54:03,750 --> 00:54:00,640

developed in the 19th century

1397

00:54:05,430 --> 00:54:03,760

how are you going to go about making the

1398

00:54:08,829 --> 00:54:05,440

transition

1399

00:54:09,990 --> 00:54:08,839

which is why you got state power from

1400

00:54:13,109 --> 00:54:10,000

capitalism

1401

00:54:16,390 --> 00:54:13,119

to socialism and at that point

1402

00:54:19,990 --> 00:54:16,400

very very important the capitalists

1403

00:54:21,990 --> 00:54:20,000

understood they had been defeated

1404

00:54:23,270 --> 00:54:22,000

they tried every whichever way to block

1405

00:54:26,950 --> 00:54:23,280

socialist parties

1406

00:54:28,230 --> 00:54:26,960

from coming to power violently in many

1407

00:54:30,549 --> 00:54:28,240

cases

1408

00:54:32,309 --> 00:54:30,559

but they failed they couldn't do it the

1409

00:54:35,750 --> 00:54:32,319

socialists outmaneuvered them

1410

00:54:37,030 --> 00:54:35,760

and became players in turkey in terms of

1411

00:54:39,589 --> 00:54:37,040

the state

1412

00:54:41,270 --> 00:54:39,599

the response of the bourgeoisie of the

1413

00:54:44,549 --> 00:54:41,280

capitalists if you like

1414

00:54:47,910 --> 00:54:44,559

was then to cut a deal having

1415

00:54:50,549 --> 00:54:47,920

lost the effort to prevent socialists

1416

00:54:52,630 --> 00:54:50,559

from state power now they had to deal

1417

00:54:55,990 --> 00:54:52,640

with the reality that the socialists

1418

00:54:57,670 --> 00:54:56,000

had it and again make a long story short

1419

00:55:01,190 --> 00:54:57,680

although we can go into it

1420

00:55:02,470 --> 00:55:01,200

the deal that was struck was we the

1421

00:55:06,870 --> 00:55:02,480

capitalists

1422

00:55:10,390 --> 00:55:06,880

will undo you unless

1423

00:55:11,270 --> 00:55:10,400

you come to terms with us and coming to

1424

00:55:15,589 --> 00:55:11,280

terms with us

1425

00:55:19,349 --> 00:55:15,599

meant a redefinition of socialism

1426

00:55:22,630 --> 00:55:19,359

no longer would it be the

1427

00:55:24,630 --> 00:55:22,640

process of a radical alteration of

1428

00:55:28,470 --> 00:55:24,640

society

1429

00:55:31,589 --> 00:55:28,480

no no what it would be would be

1430

00:55:35,030 --> 00:55:31,599

to be blunt capitalism with a human

1431

00:55:38,549 --> 00:55:35,040

face we socialists will be in power

1432

00:55:39,589 --> 00:55:38,559

but we'll make it softer we'll force the

1433

00:55:42,549 --> 00:55:39,599

capitalists

1434

00:55:43,750 --> 00:55:42,559

to have a minimum wage we'll force the

1435

00:55:46,789 --> 00:55:43,760

capitalists

1436

00:55:48,309 --> 00:55:46,799

to offset the horrible capitalist a

1437

00:55:53,270 --> 00:55:48,319

business cycles

1438

00:55:57,780 --> 00:55:54,630

modify you know we'll have an

1439

00:55:58,950 --> 00:55:57,790

unemployment pro socialism will become

1440

00:56:02,069 --> 00:55:58,960

[Music]

1441

00:56:05,510 --> 00:56:02,079

a less harsh capitalism than

1442

00:56:09,270 --> 00:56:05,520

it had been before just

1443

00:56:12,309 --> 00:56:09,280

don't mess with our dominance

1444

00:56:15,510 --> 00:56:12,319

in the enterprise and that's why it's

1445

00:56:19,190 --> 00:56:15,520

important to understand

1446

00:56:21,829 --> 00:56:19,200

with marx and hence my the quotation

1447

00:56:22,950 --> 00:56:21,839

that for marx it was never an exciting

1448

00:56:26,470 --> 00:56:22,960

question

1449

00:56:30,230 --> 00:56:26,480

whether the government played the role

1450

00:56:33,270 --> 00:56:30,240

of capitalists or a private person did

1451

00:56:35,910 --> 00:56:33,280

who the capitalist is is not the

1452

00:56:37,349 --> 00:56:35,920

issue it's the capital it's as if you

1453

00:56:40,549 --> 00:56:37,359

had said to me

1454

00:56:41,510 --> 00:56:40,559

uh slavery didn't exist in such and such

1455

00:56:44,470 --> 00:56:41,520

a society

1456

00:56:45,910 --> 00:56:44,480

because alongside the private slaves the

1457

00:56:49,030 --> 00:56:45,920

government had slaves

1458

00:56:50,630 --> 00:56:49,040

who the hell cares nobody would question

1459

00:56:52,309 --> 00:56:50,640

slavery on the grounds that the

1460

00:56:54,789 --> 00:56:52,319

government played a big role

1461

00:56:56,549 --> 00:56:54,799

or feudalism and let me tell you by the

1462

00:57:00,069 --> 00:56:56,559

way that slavery and feudalism

1463

00:57:01,349 --> 00:57:00,079

had governmental apparatuses that had

1464

00:57:02,950 --> 00:57:01,359

slaves and had

1465

00:57:05,190 --> 00:57:02,960

serfs the fact that there are

1466

00:57:07,910 --> 00:57:05,200

governments that have employees

1467

00:57:10,309 --> 00:57:07,920

doesn't change that it's capitalism it

1468

00:57:13,190 --> 00:57:10,319

just says their state capitalism

1469

00:57:14,789 --> 00:57:13,200

alongside the private which is in no way

1470

00:57:18,069 --> 00:57:14,799

unique to capitalism

1471

00:57:19,270 --> 00:57:18,079

and it has squat to do with socialism or

1472

00:57:22,870 --> 00:57:19,280

communism

1473

00:57:26,870 --> 00:57:22,880

other than as a moment in the history

1474

00:57:29,589 --> 00:57:26,880

when a strategic gain was undone

1475

00:57:30,630 --> 00:57:29,599

by a redefinition of what socialism

1476

00:57:34,390 --> 00:57:30,640

meant

1477

00:57:37,270 --> 00:57:34,400

so from the sound of it uh these

1478

00:57:38,230 --> 00:57:37,280

socialists get into power they become

1479

00:57:39,990 --> 00:57:38,240

the government

1480

00:57:41,430 --> 00:57:40,000

they strike a deal with these

1481

00:57:43,750 --> 00:57:41,440

capitalists

1482

00:57:45,829 --> 00:57:43,760

and you know the corruption starts there

1483

00:57:47,829 --> 00:57:45,839

my my question is

1484

00:57:50,710 --> 00:57:47,839

who are these capitalists is it possible

1485

00:57:53,670 --> 00:57:50,720

that the socialists get in the power

1486

00:57:54,230 --> 00:57:53,680

and they have no intention of sharing it

1487

00:57:57,430 --> 00:57:54,240

um

1488

00:57:59,670 --> 00:57:57,440

that is to say that they quickly become

1489

00:58:01,670 --> 00:57:59,680

exploiters themselves and that it's the

1490

00:58:04,870 --> 00:58:01,680

state that sort of dooms

1491

00:58:06,950 --> 00:58:04,880

marxism as as opposed to these more

1492

00:58:09,829 --> 00:58:06,960

anarchistic strains of marxism

1493

00:58:11,030 --> 00:58:09,839

that focus on the bottom up like worker

1494

00:58:13,510 --> 00:58:11,040

co-ops

1495

00:58:14,549 --> 00:58:13,520

uh communal living in the woods

1496

00:58:16,789 --> 00:58:14,559

somewhere like in

1497

00:58:18,630 --> 00:58:16,799

the case for russia or the peasant

1498

00:58:21,990 --> 00:58:18,640

commune

1499

00:58:23,829 --> 00:58:22,000

is the state and this is against

1500

00:58:25,069 --> 00:58:23,839

conventional wisdom i suppose but is the

1501
00:58:29,670 --> 00:58:25,079
state

1502
00:58:32,069 --> 00:58:29,680
antithetical to marxism

1503
00:58:33,990 --> 00:58:32,079
well that's been a debate inside marxism

1504
00:58:35,910 --> 00:58:34,000
for a very very long time

1505
00:58:38,710 --> 00:58:35,920
in the middle of the 19th century marx

1506
00:58:40,230 --> 00:58:38,720
himself had a political alliance as well

1507
00:58:42,549 --> 00:58:40,240
as a personal friendship

1508
00:58:43,990 --> 00:58:42,559
with a russian named bakunin who was at

1509
00:58:46,150 --> 00:58:44,000
arguably at that time

1510
00:58:48,630 --> 00:58:46,160
the leading theorist of anarchism in the

1511
00:58:50,309 --> 00:58:48,640
world or for any period of time

1512
00:58:52,470 --> 00:58:50,319
and they worked together they together

1513
00:58:53,910 --> 00:58:52,480

formulated the international working

1514

00:58:55,470 --> 00:58:53,920

men's association

1515

00:58:58,309 --> 00:58:55,480

which was the beginning of the

1516

00:59:00,870 --> 00:58:58,319

internationals that we've had ever since

1517

00:59:02,829 --> 00:59:00,880

so from the beginning marxism and

1518

00:59:05,670 --> 00:59:02,839

anarchism have had a very

1519

00:59:06,549 --> 00:59:05,680

complicated relationship sometimes close

1520

00:59:09,270 --> 00:59:06,559

sometimes

1521

00:59:11,349 --> 00:59:09,280

hostile to one another and so lenin is

1522

00:59:13,270 --> 00:59:11,359

the person who coined the phrase

1523

00:59:14,870 --> 00:59:13,280

when asked his question what do you want

1524

00:59:18,390 --> 00:59:14,880

the state to be

1525

00:59:21,430 --> 00:59:18,400

in in your new society he says our goal

1526

00:59:24,710 --> 00:59:21,440

is the withering away of the state and

1527

00:59:28,150 --> 00:59:24,720

and and to dismiss that as some kind of

1528

00:59:29,990 --> 00:59:28,160

you know trumpian verbiage is not to

1529

00:59:33,190 --> 00:59:30,000

understand a long history of

1530

00:59:34,309 --> 00:59:33,200

engagement between marxism and anarchism

1531

00:59:37,270 --> 00:59:34,319

precisely

1532

00:59:38,549 --> 00:59:37,280

on what is the role of the state both as

1533

00:59:41,190 --> 00:59:38,559

a transitional

1534

00:59:42,309 --> 00:59:41,200

strategic issue and as a long-term

1535

00:59:43,990 --> 00:59:42,319

institution

1536

00:59:45,910 --> 00:59:44,000

you said trumpian it's interesting

1537

00:59:47,270 --> 00:59:45,920

because bannon actually says he loves

1538

00:59:49,829 --> 00:59:47,280

london for that

1539

00:59:50,549 --> 00:59:49,839

line uh which is kind of crazy but

1540

00:59:52,950 --> 00:59:50,559

anyway

1541

00:59:54,950 --> 00:59:52,960

um so but i want to know what you think

1542

00:59:57,990 --> 00:59:54,960

do you believe that the state

1543

01:00:00,789 --> 00:59:58,000

is antithetical to marxism i also like

1544

01:00:02,870 --> 01:00:00,799

mr bannon because i think his concept of

1545

01:00:05,510 --> 01:00:02,880

charitable foundation is one that ought

1546

01:00:08,870 --> 01:00:05,520

to be more widely understood

1547

01:00:11,030 --> 01:00:08,880

um i'm sorry your last question was

1548

01:00:12,150 --> 01:00:11,040

that's interesting okay uh my last

1549

01:00:15,430 --> 01:00:12,160

question was

1550

01:00:17,510 --> 01:00:15,440

do you believe that state is

1551

01:00:18,870 --> 01:00:17,520

antithetical to marxism i get the

1552

01:00:22,069 --> 01:00:18,880

broader context

1553

01:00:23,910 --> 01:00:22,079

um i.e was bakunin or

1554

01:00:26,470 --> 01:00:23,920

maybe more preferable anarchists

1555

01:00:29,430 --> 01:00:26,480

krapotkin

1556

01:00:31,750 --> 01:00:29,440

tolstoy were they ranked on the issue as

1557

01:00:33,589 --> 01:00:31,760

opposed to the marxists

1558

01:00:35,430 --> 01:00:33,599

well i've always understood them to be a

1559

01:00:37,109 --> 01:00:35,440

necessary compliment to one another

1560

01:00:38,549 --> 01:00:37,119

which is why i think they got together

1561

01:00:41,430 --> 01:00:38,559

in the first place

1562

01:00:42,150 --> 01:00:41,440

in other words you're going the old

1563

01:00:44,710 --> 01:00:42,160

marxist

1564

01:00:46,710 --> 01:00:44,720

argument was the state is the agent of

1565

01:00:49,750 --> 01:00:46,720

the ruling class that the state

1566

01:00:53,910 --> 01:00:49,760

is an institution designed

1567

01:00:57,109 --> 01:00:53,920

to reproduce the society as a whole

1568

01:01:00,789 --> 01:00:57,119

in the manner that the ruling class

1569

01:01:01,510 --> 01:01:00,799

wishes it to be reproduced if you got

1570

01:01:05,109 --> 01:01:01,520

rid

1571

01:01:08,230 --> 01:01:05,119

of the dichotomy between ruler and rule

1572

01:01:10,950 --> 01:01:08,240

that exists inside the enterprise

1573

01:01:11,750 --> 01:01:10,960

then there wouldn't be a need for the

1574

01:01:14,870 --> 01:01:11,760

state

1575

01:01:17,990 --> 01:01:14,880

and it would then wither away

1576

01:01:19,109 --> 01:01:18,000

and on that basis a deal could be made a

1577

01:01:22,630 --> 01:01:19,119

strategic

1578

01:01:26,069 --> 01:01:22,640

alliance in principle and in practice

1579

01:01:28,150 --> 01:01:26,079

between marxists and anarchists

1580

01:01:29,349 --> 01:01:28,160

in order for us to get rid of the state

1581

01:01:32,230 --> 01:01:29,359

we need

1582

01:01:33,270 --> 01:01:32,240

the democratization of the workplace and

1583

01:01:36,230 --> 01:01:33,280

in order to

1584

01:01:38,230 --> 01:01:36,240

solidify the dominance socially of a

1585

01:01:40,950 --> 01:01:38,240

democratic workspace

1586

01:01:42,789 --> 01:01:40,960

you need to get rid of the state okay we

1587

01:01:45,589 --> 01:01:42,799

have a shared objective

1588

01:01:47,750 --> 01:01:45,599

if we work together we can together

1589

01:01:50,630 --> 01:01:47,760

better achieve the shared objective

1590

01:01:51,990 --> 01:01:50,640

than if either of us function on our own

1591

01:01:54,789 --> 01:01:52,000

so let's not only not be

1592

01:01:55,910 --> 01:01:54,799

enemies let's be allies with the

1593

01:01:59,190 --> 01:01:55,920

conjoint

1594

01:02:01,829 --> 01:01:59,200

goal of getting rid of the state and

1595

01:02:02,870 --> 01:02:01,839

creating the institutions at the base of

1596

01:02:05,430 --> 01:02:02,880

society

1597

01:02:06,390 --> 01:02:05,440

that can make sure the state is a not

1598

01:02:09,670 --> 01:02:06,400

necessary

1599

01:02:11,190 --> 01:02:09,680

and b not allowed to return

1600

01:02:12,870 --> 01:02:11,200

while we're on the way to getting rid of

1601
01:02:13,510 --> 01:02:12,880
the state what about defunding the

1602
01:02:15,349 --> 01:02:13,520
police

1603
01:02:16,789 --> 01:02:15,359
and also i'm curious to know what your

1604
01:02:17,190 --> 01:02:16,799
thoughts are on some contemporary issues

1605
01:02:18,789 --> 01:02:17,200
like

1606
01:02:20,150 --> 01:02:18,799
the black lives matter movement and do

1607
01:02:22,230 --> 01:02:20,160
you see them furthering the cause of

1608
01:02:25,190 --> 01:02:22,240
marxism

1609
01:02:26,470 --> 01:02:25,200
well i think like most movements um they

1610
01:02:29,910 --> 01:02:26,480
have within them

1611
01:02:32,470 --> 01:02:29,920
the potential or the or the actuality

1612
01:02:33,270 --> 01:02:32,480
of uh merging with marxist movements

1613
01:02:35,829 --> 01:02:33,280

allying

1614

01:02:37,510 --> 01:02:35,839

with marxist movements cooperating with

1615

01:02:39,670 --> 01:02:37,520

marx's movements

1616

01:02:41,589 --> 01:02:39,680

and they have within them the potential

1617

01:02:43,910 --> 01:02:41,599

to refuse any such thing

1618

01:02:45,349 --> 01:02:43,920

and to reject it and that those issues

1619

01:02:49,029 --> 01:02:45,359

and those questions

1620

01:02:52,150 --> 01:02:49,039

are in fact being fought out inside

1621

01:02:54,309 --> 01:02:52,160

if i ask myself why the rockefeller fund

1622

01:02:55,270 --> 01:02:54,319

gives as much money as it does to black

1623

01:02:58,069 --> 01:02:55,280

lives matter

1624

01:02:58,789 --> 01:02:58,079

i think i know what the answer is and i

1625

01:03:00,950 --> 01:02:58,799

understand

1626
01:03:02,630 --> 01:03:00,960
what why they're doing that and why they

1627
01:03:03,430 --> 01:03:02,640
have always done that and why the ford

1628
01:03:06,789 --> 01:03:03,440
foundation

1629
01:03:10,150 --> 01:03:06,799
does it also it's a question of shaping

1630
01:03:12,710 --> 01:03:10,160
as best you can which way this

1631
01:03:13,829 --> 01:03:12,720
internal debate in a movement like black

1632
01:03:16,390 --> 01:03:13,839
lives matter

1633
01:03:17,029 --> 01:03:16,400
works when it comes to defunding the

1634
01:03:19,910 --> 01:03:17,039
police

1635
01:03:20,230 --> 01:03:19,920
for me these are strategic questions uh

1636
01:03:23,270 --> 01:03:20,240
not

1637
01:03:25,270 --> 01:03:23,280
principal questions the police function

1638
01:03:27,829 --> 01:03:25,280

in a certain way in our society

1639

01:03:30,150 --> 01:03:27,839

and they do that for particular reasons

1640

01:03:32,710 --> 01:03:30,160

i do find it strange to

1641

01:03:34,150 --> 01:03:32,720

imagine and i hope most of the people

1642

01:03:36,069 --> 01:03:34,160

pushing this are not

1643

01:03:38,150 --> 01:03:36,079

doing what i'm about to say but to

1644

01:03:41,029 --> 01:03:38,160

imagine that you can go at the

1645

01:03:42,870 --> 01:03:41,039

to the last step of a long process

1646

01:03:45,990 --> 01:03:42,880

namely what the police do

1647

01:03:48,549 --> 01:03:46,000

fix it without changing the contacts

1648

01:03:49,349 --> 01:03:48,559

that makes it what it is if you defund

1649

01:03:52,230 --> 01:03:49,359

the police

1650

01:03:52,710 --> 01:03:52,240

and you have some other agency step in

1651
01:03:55,270 --> 01:03:52,720
to do

1652
01:03:56,390 --> 01:03:55,280
god knows what it will end up doing what

1653
01:03:58,150 --> 01:03:56,400
the police do

1654
01:03:59,670 --> 01:03:58,160
because you haven't changed the social

1655
01:04:02,390 --> 01:03:59,680
system within which

1656
01:04:03,349 --> 01:04:02,400
the police are given their tasks paid

1657
01:04:05,349 --> 01:04:03,359
their money

1658
01:04:06,789 --> 01:04:05,359
rewarded and punished for the things

1659
01:04:09,349 --> 01:04:06,799
they do and don't do

1660
01:04:11,109 --> 01:04:09,359
that's what has to be changed otherwise

1661
01:04:13,910 --> 01:04:11,119
you're just changing the personnel

1662
01:04:14,710 --> 01:04:13,920
or changing the who of the of the

1663
01:04:18,549 --> 01:04:14,720

behavior

1664

01:04:20,150 --> 01:04:18,559

in the social system

1665

01:04:22,069 --> 01:04:20,160

then it sounds like we've once again

1666

01:04:22,710 --> 01:04:22,079

returned to the more anarchistic

1667

01:04:24,309 --> 01:04:22,720

tendencies

1668

01:04:26,309 --> 01:04:24,319

of starting from the bottom up as

1669

01:04:26,710 --> 01:04:26,319

opposed to regulatory change from the

1670

01:04:30,069 --> 01:04:26,720

top

1671

01:04:32,069 --> 01:04:30,079

down um i unders i understand why

1672

01:04:33,029 --> 01:04:32,079

anarchists like to believe that this is

1673

01:04:35,109 --> 01:04:33,039

anarchism

1674

01:04:36,630 --> 01:04:35,119

but it isn't the anarchists have no

1675

01:04:38,470 --> 01:04:36,640

monopoly on the notion

1676

01:04:41,589 --> 01:04:38,480

that you do social development from the

1677

01:04:43,430 --> 01:04:41,599

bottom up the marxist movement in many

1678

01:04:46,470 --> 01:04:43,440

many of its incarnations

1679

01:04:49,510 --> 01:04:46,480

has been rigidly clear that its

1680

01:04:52,390 --> 01:04:49,520

logic is to transform at the base

1681

01:04:52,789 --> 01:04:52,400

and force it onto those at the top this

1682

01:04:56,630 --> 01:04:52,799

is

1683

01:04:59,750 --> 01:04:56,640

absolutely

1684

01:05:02,069 --> 01:04:59,760

no doubt but it shares it it isn't

1685

01:05:03,829 --> 01:05:02,079

the sole carrier of a notion of

1686

01:05:06,549 --> 01:05:03,839

bottom-up development that

1687

01:05:07,270 --> 01:05:06,559

that's really given that anarchism has

1688

01:05:10,309 --> 01:05:07,280

been a much

1689

01:05:12,470 --> 01:05:10,319

smaller movement around the world than

1690

01:05:15,829 --> 01:05:12,480

marxism and socialism

1691

01:05:16,150 --> 01:05:15,839

always and everywhere i mean i think

1692

01:05:19,430 --> 01:05:16,160

it's

1693

01:05:22,470 --> 01:05:19,440

fair to suggest that these are shared

1694

01:05:24,230 --> 01:05:22,480

notions of development and putting the

1695

01:05:26,069 --> 01:05:24,240

adjective anarchist in front of him was

1696

01:05:27,750 --> 01:05:26,079

a little strange

1697

01:05:29,829 --> 01:05:27,760

let's imagine our guests would own the

1698

01:05:31,029 --> 01:05:29,839

label uh i think it would be very

1699

01:05:33,829 --> 01:05:31,039

against

1700

01:05:34,150 --> 01:05:33,839

that philosophy to only label even their

1701

01:05:37,190 --> 01:05:34,160

own

1702

01:05:39,910 --> 01:05:37,200

but i i agree

1703

01:05:40,230 --> 01:05:39,920

no label the bottom up they're making

1704

01:05:43,109 --> 01:05:40,240

men

1705

01:05:44,950 --> 01:05:43,119

ask the question who in the various

1706

01:05:46,950 --> 01:05:44,960

actors in the social drama

1707

01:05:48,789 --> 01:05:46,960

who's committed to the a notion of

1708

01:05:50,870 --> 01:05:48,799

bottom-up transformation

1709

01:05:51,829 --> 01:05:50,880

and who isn't and there's i think where

1710

01:05:55,190 --> 01:05:51,839

you get the

1711

01:05:57,349 --> 01:05:55,200

the debate inside socialism these days

1712

01:06:00,470 --> 01:05:57,359

are we in favor of the government doing

1713

01:06:02,829 --> 01:06:00,480

12 more things than it currently does

1714

01:06:04,950 --> 01:06:02,839

or are we in favor of a bottom-up

1715

01:06:06,230 --> 01:06:04,960

transformation and the worker co-op

1716

01:06:08,789 --> 01:06:06,240

movement

1717

01:06:09,750 --> 01:06:08,799

is a bottom-up notion of of social

1718

01:06:12,150 --> 01:06:09,760

change

1719

01:06:13,029 --> 01:06:12,160

which calls itself socialist communist

1720

01:06:16,309 --> 01:06:13,039

marxist

1721

01:06:17,029 --> 01:06:16,319

and so forth okay bottom-up imagine you

1722

01:06:18,710 --> 01:06:17,039

can

1723

01:06:20,390 --> 01:06:18,720

advise the people of the black lives

1724

01:06:21,670 --> 01:06:20,400

matter movement as a whole they're all

1725

01:06:25,029 --> 01:06:21,680

watching this

1726

01:06:26,870 --> 01:06:25,039

what would you change

1727

01:06:28,470 --> 01:06:26,880

redirect about the movement to make it

1728

01:06:33,270 --> 01:06:28,480

more efficacious in your

1729

01:06:35,190 --> 01:06:33,280

estimation i don't know

1730

01:06:36,630 --> 01:06:35,200

i wouldn't have taken to on myself the

1731

01:06:38,950 --> 01:06:36,640

position of

1732

01:06:40,789 --> 01:06:38,960

articulating either such a question or

1733

01:06:44,710 --> 01:06:40,799

an answer so i don't know what

1734

01:06:47,990 --> 01:06:44,720

what i would say i would hope that

1735

01:06:51,029 --> 01:06:48,000

um the anti-capitalism

1736

01:06:52,710 --> 01:06:51,039

which i already see is present in the

1737

01:06:54,789 --> 01:06:52,720

black lives matter

1738

01:06:56,549 --> 01:06:54,799

statements that i've read interviews

1739

01:07:00,309 --> 01:06:56,559

i've watched and so on

1740

01:07:04,150 --> 01:07:00,319

i would hope that that's a growing

1741

01:07:08,470 --> 01:07:04,160

deepening uh commitment that that

1742

01:07:11,190 --> 01:07:08,480

an awareness that the problem of um

1743

01:07:13,430 --> 01:07:11,200

of an other in a capitalist society

1744

01:07:16,309 --> 01:07:13,440

which exists everywhere in the world

1745

01:07:17,510 --> 01:07:16,319

has landed on the african american

1746

01:07:20,630 --> 01:07:17,520

community

1747

01:07:22,950 --> 01:07:20,640

uh from the beginning here

1748

01:07:23,910 --> 01:07:22,960

to understand the role it plays and to

1749

01:07:26,710 --> 01:07:23,920

be insistent

1750

01:07:29,109 --> 01:07:26,720

i guess that would be my my hope to be

1751

01:07:33,430 --> 01:07:29,119

insistent that the transformation

1752

01:07:36,470 --> 01:07:33,440

beyond capitalism is a central part

1753

01:07:38,549 --> 01:07:36,480

of what can finally uh

1754

01:07:39,750 --> 01:07:38,559

liberate african americans from the

1755

01:07:41,589 --> 01:07:39,760

subordination

1756

01:07:43,829 --> 01:07:41,599

that they have suffered you know in this

1757

01:07:46,870 --> 01:07:43,839

society for so long

1758

01:07:49,990 --> 01:07:46,880

there's been a debate whether or not

1759

01:07:51,430 --> 01:07:50,000

the root cause of

1760

01:07:53,270 --> 01:07:51,440

much of the suffering for the

1761

01:07:54,230 --> 01:07:53,280

african-american community in the united

1762

01:07:58,069 --> 01:07:54,240

states

1763

01:07:59,829 --> 01:07:58,079

is economic or racial and

1764

01:08:01,349 --> 01:07:59,839

i believe it was sanders who said that

1765

01:08:04,150 --> 01:08:01,359

the the root problem of

1766

01:08:05,829 --> 01:08:04,160

our country was economy it was something

1767

01:08:09,029 --> 01:08:05,839

that we needed to fix

1768

01:08:10,710 --> 01:08:09,039

and i believe it was uh one of the

1769

01:08:14,549 --> 01:08:10,720

leaders of the black lives movement

1770

01:08:19,749 --> 01:08:14,559

who directly refuted him and said no

1771

01:08:23,430 --> 01:08:21,829

to me this sort of strikes the

1772

01:08:26,149 --> 01:08:23,440

difference between

1773

01:08:26,789 --> 01:08:26,159

this more let's say it's called the

1774

01:08:29,990 --> 01:08:26,799

older

1775

01:08:32,950 --> 01:08:30,000

left guard socialists and

1776

01:08:34,630 --> 01:08:32,960

the newer identity politics tendencies

1777

01:08:36,829 --> 01:08:34,640

of the left

1778

01:08:38,709 --> 01:08:36,839

do you find that this is a divide that

1779

01:08:41,189 --> 01:08:38,719

might uh

1780

01:08:42,630 --> 01:08:41,199

stunt or present a stumbling block to

1781

01:08:44,950 --> 01:08:42,640

socialism

1782

01:08:48,390 --> 01:08:44,960

what should be the socialists attitude

1783

01:08:50,149 --> 01:08:48,400

towards identity politics

1784

01:08:52,630 --> 01:08:50,159

well we don't all mean the same thing by

1785

01:08:55,990 --> 01:08:52,640

these words but let me try anyway

1786

01:08:57,510 --> 01:08:56,000

uh to get at it i find the discussion of

1787

01:09:00,870 --> 01:08:57,520

what the ultimate cause

1788

01:09:02,950 --> 01:09:00,880

of things is boring

1789

01:09:05,269 --> 01:09:02,960

i don't know exactly what's at stake

1790

01:09:08,309 --> 01:09:05,279

here i suspect

1791

01:09:12,870 --> 01:09:08,319

it's organizational turf uh

1792

01:09:17,030 --> 01:09:14,309

well you know that's a very different

1793

01:09:18,950 --> 01:09:17,040

thing priority is one thing

1794

01:09:21,030 --> 01:09:18,960

you know we all make priority i decide

1795

01:09:22,630 --> 01:09:21,040

what i'm going to do at 10 o'clock today

1796

01:09:23,749 --> 01:09:22,640

and i don't do something and i don't do

1797

01:09:25,189 --> 01:09:23,759

something else but i don't make the

1798

01:09:26,789 --> 01:09:25,199

world depend on it

1799

01:09:28,229 --> 01:09:26,799

i don't say that one is the more

1800

01:09:30,550 --> 01:09:28,239

fundamental i

1801

01:09:31,269 --> 01:09:30,560

i give a priority i'm more touched by

1802

01:09:34,229 --> 01:09:31,279

something

1803

01:09:35,590 --> 01:09:34,239

than the next person my autobiography is

1804

01:09:37,590 --> 01:09:35,600

differs from yours

1805

01:09:39,349 --> 01:09:37,600

and therefore i don't expect that the

1806

01:09:43,430 --> 01:09:39,359

things that you know

1807

01:09:45,510 --> 01:09:43,440

spark my passion are identical to yours

1808

01:09:47,030 --> 01:09:45,520

and i don't find that interesting your

1809

01:09:48,789 --> 01:09:47,040

mother was not mine

1810

01:09:51,110 --> 01:09:48,799

your community of growing up was not

1811

01:09:53,510 --> 01:09:51,120

mine you're a different person for me

1812

01:09:55,910 --> 01:09:53,520

and we can have different priorities i

1813

01:09:57,669 --> 01:09:55,920

assume we have different priorities

1814

01:09:59,590 --> 01:09:57,679

i think every political movement that

1815

01:10:00,070 --> 01:09:59,600

ever got anywhere was a movement of

1816

01:10:02,310 --> 01:10:00,080

people

1817

01:10:03,270 --> 01:10:02,320

who had different priorities but

1818

01:10:07,110 --> 01:10:03,280

understood

1819

01:10:07,510 --> 01:10:07,120

the need for a movement that captured

1820

01:10:10,149 --> 01:10:07,520

that

1821

01:10:10,709 --> 01:10:10,159

brought together people who had

1822

01:10:12,790 --> 01:10:10,719

different

1823

01:10:14,470 --> 01:10:12,800

priorities and therefore having the

1824

01:10:17,590 --> 01:10:14,480

debate what's the most

1825

01:10:20,390 --> 01:10:17,600

important thing strikes me is odd

1826

01:10:20,870 --> 01:10:20,400

i'm not sure let's decide moment to

1827

01:10:25,030 --> 01:10:20,880

moment

1828

01:10:26,709 --> 01:10:25,040

day by day what is a good target for our

1829

01:10:29,830 --> 01:10:26,719

activities over this week

1830

01:10:30,709 --> 01:10:29,840

over this month and and some days that

1831

01:10:33,110 --> 01:10:30,719

decision

1832

01:10:34,790 --> 01:10:33,120

will be shaped uh this way and other

1833

01:10:37,590 --> 01:10:34,800

days it'll be shaped that way

1834

01:10:38,390 --> 01:10:37,600

we make our priorities tactical

1835

01:10:41,510 --> 01:10:38,400

strategic

1836

01:10:44,709 --> 01:10:41,520

and so on but we do it knowing

1837

01:10:47,669 --> 01:10:44,719

that each of us is a different person

1838

01:10:48,630 --> 01:10:47,679

with different motivations different

1839

01:10:51,430 --> 01:10:48,640

personal

1840

01:10:53,110 --> 01:10:51,440

priorities and i'm okay with that i

1841

01:10:54,630 --> 01:10:53,120

don't think there's any way out of it

1842

01:10:56,550 --> 01:10:54,640

anyway the trick

1843

01:10:59,750 --> 01:10:56,560

is not to debate what's the most

1844

01:11:02,070 --> 01:10:59,760

important that strikes me as nutty

1845

01:11:04,229 --> 01:11:02,080

you and i don't have the same standards

1846

01:11:06,709 --> 01:11:04,239

for that that's what we debate

1847

01:11:08,470 --> 01:11:06,719

and then we vote and then we see how it

1848

01:11:10,310 --> 01:11:08,480

works out

1849

01:11:12,390 --> 01:11:10,320

but the rest of it the rest of it

1850

01:11:15,030 --> 01:11:12,400

strikes me

1851
01:11:16,149 --> 01:11:15,040
and here you get my my suspicions get

1852
01:11:19,189 --> 01:11:16,159
aroused

1853
01:11:21,750 --> 01:11:19,199
what is the motivation i worry

1854
01:11:22,470 --> 01:11:21,760
what is the motivation of posing the

1855
01:11:25,270 --> 01:11:22,480
question

1856
01:11:26,149 --> 01:11:25,280
since it makes no sense to me i wonder

1857
01:11:29,189 --> 01:11:26,159
why are we

1858
01:11:31,669 --> 01:11:29,199
asking whether it's more fundamental

1859
01:11:33,189 --> 01:11:31,679
to harm the economic change than the

1860
01:11:36,709 --> 01:11:33,199
racial change or the

1861
01:11:40,310 --> 01:11:36,719
you name it change do we re for me

1862
01:11:42,390 --> 01:11:40,320
that's a sign of movement immaturity

1863
01:11:43,669 --> 01:11:42,400

if we're going to sit around and who's

1864

01:11:46,790 --> 01:11:43,679

more oppressed

1865

01:11:50,070 --> 01:11:46,800

black people female people

1866

01:11:52,870 --> 01:11:50,080

this per what what are we doing

1867

01:11:53,669 --> 01:11:52,880

these are qualitative differences when

1868

01:11:56,550 --> 01:11:53,679

you reduce

1869

01:11:58,070 --> 01:11:56,560

qualitative difference to quantity

1870

01:11:59,750 --> 01:11:58,080

that's an old mathematical and

1871

01:12:01,510 --> 01:11:59,760

philosophic problem

1872

01:12:03,189 --> 01:12:01,520

there's something going on there that

1873

01:12:06,470 --> 01:12:03,199

you ought to interrogate

1874

01:12:08,229 --> 01:12:06,480

before you answer the question

1875

01:12:10,790 --> 01:12:08,239

it's like what you do if a person

1876

01:12:12,950 --> 01:12:10,800

accosts you in in a dark space

1877

01:12:14,550 --> 01:12:12,960

and says i'm gonna give you free choice

1878

01:12:15,430 --> 01:12:14,560

i can either bash you over the head with

1879

01:12:18,630 --> 01:12:15,440

this

1880

01:12:21,110 --> 01:12:18,640

brick or i can stab you if you start

1881

01:12:23,590 --> 01:12:21,120

agonizing over which way to go

1882

01:12:24,390 --> 01:12:23,600

in this question you've made a strategic

1883

01:12:26,310 --> 01:12:24,400

error

1884

01:12:27,990 --> 01:12:26,320

because the response there is i don't

1885

01:12:29,910 --> 01:12:28,000

accept the question

1886

01:12:31,350 --> 01:12:29,920

not that i'm going to choose which is

1887

01:12:34,070 --> 01:12:31,360

the better answer

1888

01:12:35,189 --> 01:12:34,080

and for me that's how i react to what i

1889

01:12:37,830 --> 01:12:35,199

think you mean

1890

01:12:39,590 --> 01:12:37,840

by identity politics okay well i have a

1891

01:12:42,070 --> 01:12:39,600

quick aside about the dark space

1892

01:12:42,790 --> 01:12:42,080

i'm gonna accost you in it you mentioned

1893

01:12:44,149 --> 01:12:42,800

that

1894

01:12:45,510 --> 01:12:44,159

let's imagine we have socialistic

1895

01:12:46,310 --> 01:12:45,520

societies and capitalistic than the

1896

01:12:49,350 --> 01:12:46,320

socialistic

1897

01:12:51,270 --> 01:12:49,360

if by your definition they come about

1898

01:12:53,110 --> 01:12:51,280

they would be more free that this

1899

01:12:53,590 --> 01:12:53,120

capitalistic societies have promised

1900

01:12:55,669 --> 01:12:53,600

freedom

1901

01:12:57,350 --> 01:12:55,679

liberty use the word liberty but haven't

1902

01:12:59,189 --> 01:12:57,360

delivered however liberty freedoms

1903

01:13:00,630 --> 01:12:59,199

are qualitative distinctions yet you're

1904

01:13:02,470 --> 01:13:00,640

saying that socialistic

1905

01:13:04,709 --> 01:13:02,480

in your definition of worker co-ops

1906

01:13:07,350 --> 01:13:04,719

being engendered and pervasive

1907

01:13:09,590 --> 01:13:07,360

would allow for more liberty and that to

1908

01:13:11,990 --> 01:13:09,600

me is a quantitative

1909

01:13:13,590 --> 01:13:12,000

now analysis because you've said more

1910

01:13:14,950 --> 01:13:13,600

which is less more less than is you know

1911

01:13:18,149 --> 01:13:14,960

less or equal than sign

1912

01:13:18,950 --> 01:13:18,159

okay so how are you transmuting this

1913

01:13:21,270 --> 01:13:18,960

qualitative

1914

01:13:23,189 --> 01:13:21,280

notion of freedom to a quantitative and

1915

01:13:25,110 --> 01:13:23,199

why does that not suffer from the same

1916

01:13:28,149 --> 01:13:25,120

problems that you just outlined with

1917

01:13:30,709 --> 01:13:28,159

measures of oppression let's say

1918

01:13:32,149 --> 01:13:30,719

if i made a verbal slip and i made

1919

01:13:34,310 --> 01:13:32,159

quality into quantity

1920

01:13:37,350 --> 01:13:34,320

then you're absolutely right to catch me

1921

01:13:40,149 --> 01:13:37,360

on it and caution me about doing that

1922

01:13:42,229 --> 01:13:40,159

i don't think i did it but i'm sure i

1923

01:13:43,590 --> 01:13:42,239

i'm the product of the school systems in

1924

01:13:46,430 --> 01:13:43,600

which i was produced

1925

01:13:48,149 --> 01:13:46,440

and making that kind of slip it's an

1926

01:13:50,229 --> 01:13:48,159

epistemological slip

1927

01:13:51,910 --> 01:13:50,239

it's part of the game that you as you

1928

01:13:54,870 --> 01:13:51,920

learn and as you change

1929

01:13:56,790 --> 01:13:54,880

i would insist that what the socialists

1930

01:13:59,910 --> 01:13:56,800

are about is a changed

1931

01:14:00,310 --> 01:13:59,920

quality of what the word liberty would

1932

01:14:03,110 --> 01:14:00,320

mean

1933

01:14:05,830 --> 01:14:03,120

what the reality of a society that

1934

01:14:08,070 --> 01:14:05,840

honored liberty equality and fraternity

1935

01:14:10,070 --> 01:14:08,080

would have would have to mean and that

1936

01:14:11,910 --> 01:14:10,080

that's necessarily built in

1937

01:14:14,950 --> 01:14:11,920

because we don't mean the same things by

1938

01:14:17,590 --> 01:14:14,960

these words liberty equality fraternity

1939

01:14:19,350 --> 01:14:17,600

i mean people who are carrying guns into

1940

01:14:21,510 --> 01:14:19,360

midwestern courtrooms

1941

01:14:22,390 --> 01:14:21,520

because they don't want to wear face

1942

01:14:24,149 --> 01:14:22,400

masks

1943

01:14:26,550 --> 01:14:24,159

use the word liberty to describe what

1944

01:14:28,310 --> 01:14:26,560

they're doing they want the liberty

1945

01:14:30,149 --> 01:14:28,320

to breathe on other people with the

1946

01:14:32,149 --> 01:14:30,159

disease it's like asking me

1947

01:14:33,590 --> 01:14:32,159

for me it reads like oh i want the

1948

01:14:35,350 --> 01:14:33,600

liberty of going through the

1949

01:14:37,189 --> 01:14:35,360

traffic intersection without paying

1950

01:14:39,669 --> 01:14:37,199

attention to the green and the red light

1951

01:14:40,310 --> 01:14:39,679

i mean i understand the use of the word

1952

01:14:43,270 --> 01:14:40,320

liberty

1953

01:14:44,149 --> 01:14:43,280

but it has no no residence for me i mean

1954

01:14:46,550 --> 01:14:44,159

by liberty

1955

01:14:47,990 --> 01:14:46,560

something completely different from that

1956

01:14:49,030 --> 01:14:48,000

which they don't recognize and i

1957

01:14:50,950 --> 01:14:49,040

understand that

1958

01:14:52,870 --> 01:14:50,960

so i shouldn't use words like more or

1959

01:14:53,590 --> 01:14:52,880

less because we're really talking about

1960

01:14:57,270 --> 01:14:53,600

very

1961

01:14:59,669 --> 01:14:57,280

differently qualitative notions of what

1962

01:15:00,950 --> 01:14:59,679

would exist if we may defend the idea of

1963

01:15:02,630 --> 01:15:00,960

setting priorities

1964

01:15:04,229 --> 01:15:02,640

and you know especially in political

1965

01:15:05,030 --> 01:15:04,239

movements as to what is important and

1966

01:15:09,830 --> 01:15:05,040

what is not

1967

01:15:12,950 --> 01:15:09,840

important and which ones take precedence

1968

01:15:15,350 --> 01:15:12,960

you know if there's a current debate

1969

01:15:16,070 --> 01:15:15,360

but not only between identity politics

1970

01:15:18,310 --> 01:15:16,080

and

1971

01:15:19,990 --> 01:15:18,320

socialism that you find on the ground

1972

01:15:21,669 --> 01:15:20,000

that is a debate

1973

01:15:23,990 --> 01:15:21,679

that transcends what's on the ground but

1974

01:15:26,149 --> 01:15:24,000

even bubbles up to policy

1975

01:15:28,310 --> 01:15:26,159

uh decisions as to whether or not

1976

01:15:31,350 --> 01:15:28,320

funding should be directed more towards

1977

01:15:35,669 --> 01:15:31,360

people of particular groups or

1978

01:15:37,669 --> 01:15:35,679

to the poor in aggregate or in general

1979

01:15:39,590 --> 01:15:37,679

when it comes to this idea of liberty

1980

01:15:43,110 --> 01:15:39,600

that you mentioned with the masks

1981

01:15:44,550 --> 01:15:43,120

people storming into armed gunmen

1982

01:15:47,189 --> 01:15:44,560

storming into

1983

01:15:49,270 --> 01:15:47,199

these government buildings you could

1984

01:15:52,550 --> 01:15:49,280

argue even here there is a debate

1985

01:15:53,750 --> 01:15:52,560

between which liberties triumph over

1986

01:15:56,390 --> 01:15:53,760

which other liberties

1987

01:15:57,510 --> 01:15:56,400

does my liberty to breathe on you with a

1988

01:16:00,550 --> 01:15:57,520

disease

1989

01:16:03,110 --> 01:16:00,560

uh triumph your liberty to

1990

01:16:04,390 --> 01:16:03,120

trump your liberty to not have me do

1991

01:16:05,830 --> 01:16:04,400

that and

1992

01:16:07,910 --> 01:16:05,840

to me i think the answer is kind of

1993

01:16:09,990 --> 01:16:07,920

clear on that one person but

1994

01:16:11,830 --> 01:16:10,000

you know some people do not think so so

1995

01:16:13,270 --> 01:16:11,840

i think it is worthy having these

1996

01:16:16,790 --> 01:16:13,280

discussions even in a

1997

01:16:20,149 --> 01:16:16,800

liberal society as to where

1998

01:16:20,550 --> 01:16:20,159

where do our rights take precedent where

1999

01:16:23,910 --> 01:16:20,560

do

2000

01:16:27,910 --> 01:16:23,920

our issues take their importance

2001

01:16:31,030 --> 01:16:27,920

anyway so when we look at

2002

01:16:33,590 --> 01:16:31,040

the world now and we see this

2003

01:16:35,110 --> 01:16:33,600

conflict between identity politics and

2004

01:16:38,630 --> 01:16:35,120

socialism

2005

01:16:40,870 --> 01:16:38,640

could i could i interrupt sure

2006

01:16:42,390 --> 01:16:40,880

i don't like that way of posing it and i

2007

01:16:45,910 --> 01:16:42,400

want to just object

2008

01:16:49,350 --> 01:16:45,920

to it i for me

2009

01:16:52,070 --> 01:16:49,360

if i'm advocating for what i guess

2010

01:16:53,430 --> 01:16:52,080

is meant here by socialism i'm

2011

01:16:57,110 --> 01:16:53,440

advocating

2012

01:17:00,630 --> 01:16:57,120

on behalf of people who are employees

2013

01:17:03,669 --> 01:17:00,640

and who have an identity as

2014

01:17:07,189 --> 01:17:03,679

such so i am an employee

2015

01:17:10,390 --> 01:17:07,199

i may also be a male i may also be white

2016

01:17:11,270 --> 01:17:10,400

i may also be educated i may also be

2017

01:17:14,870 --> 01:17:11,280

unskilled

2018

01:17:18,709 --> 01:17:14,880

i may be all kind i have lots of

2019

01:17:19,350 --> 01:17:18,719

identification lots of communities if

2020

01:17:23,110 --> 01:17:19,360

you like

2021

01:17:23,430 --> 01:17:23,120

in which i participate and the composite

2022

01:17:30,310 --> 01:17:23,440

of

2023

01:17:33,590 --> 01:17:30,320

i wouldn't understand that i'm more

2024

01:17:36,950 --> 01:17:33,600

a man than i am white

2025

01:17:39,590 --> 01:17:36,960

or i'm more an employee than i am

2026
01:17:40,470 --> 01:17:39,600
white or any i don't understand

2027
01:17:43,590 --> 01:17:40,480
literally

2028
01:17:44,709 --> 01:17:43,600
what i'm supposed to make of these

2029
01:17:48,229 --> 01:17:44,719
things

2030
01:17:49,110 --> 01:17:48,239
again for me a successful political

2031
01:17:51,590 --> 01:17:49,120
movement

2032
01:17:53,510 --> 01:17:51,600
is an alliance if you like or a

2033
01:17:56,550 --> 01:17:53,520
coalition or whatever word

2034
01:18:00,790 --> 01:17:56,560
you want of people who have

2035
01:18:03,270 --> 01:18:00,800
different sets of identifications

2036
01:18:04,470 --> 01:18:03,280
that get together because they can

2037
01:18:08,149 --> 01:18:04,480
define

2038
01:18:09,110 --> 01:18:08,159

a common objective and they can work

2039

01:18:11,830 --> 01:18:09,120

together

2040

01:18:12,790 --> 01:18:11,840

to try to come up with strategies and

2041

01:18:15,270 --> 01:18:12,800

tactics

2042

01:18:16,229 --> 01:18:15,280

to achieve whatever the common

2043

01:18:19,510 --> 01:18:16,239

objectives

2044

01:18:22,709 --> 01:18:19,520

have been determined to be that's what i

2045

01:18:26,390 --> 01:18:22,719

think of and a socialist

2046

01:18:29,990 --> 01:18:26,400

contribution is to bring

2047

01:18:33,910 --> 01:18:30,000

for me the organization of the economy

2048

01:18:37,830 --> 01:18:33,920

at both the micro and macro levels

2049

01:18:41,270 --> 01:18:37,840

into play as among the varying

2050

01:18:43,870 --> 01:18:41,280

identities each of us brings

2051

01:18:45,030 --> 01:18:43,880

into the possibility of a social

2052

01:18:48,630 --> 01:18:45,040

transformational

2053

01:18:50,870 --> 01:18:48,640

movement i'm curious to know where you

2054

01:18:52,550 --> 01:18:50,880

disagree with marx what are your biggest

2055

01:18:58,470 --> 01:18:52,560

gripes

2056

01:18:59,990 --> 01:18:58,480

well you know it has to do with the

2057

01:19:03,430 --> 01:19:00,000

tradition of marxism

2058

01:19:07,350 --> 01:19:03,440

afterwards um i'm a little bit

2059

01:19:09,510 --> 01:19:07,360

pissed off that he did not write

2060

01:19:11,030 --> 01:19:09,520

as he had promised he would or that he

2061

01:19:13,910 --> 01:19:11,040

hoped he would

2062

01:19:14,310 --> 01:19:13,920

uh the works about the state the works

2063

01:19:20,229 --> 01:19:14,320

about

2064

01:19:23,510 --> 01:19:20,239

we now call economic development

2065

01:19:26,149 --> 01:19:23,520

um i think there were problems there

2066

01:19:27,189 --> 01:19:26,159

i think that the early work he did with

2067

01:19:30,310 --> 01:19:27,199

engels

2068

01:19:33,030 --> 01:19:30,320

around the analysis of of

2069

01:19:34,070 --> 01:19:33,040

household male female relationships

2070

01:19:37,270 --> 01:19:34,080

particularly

2071

01:19:38,709 --> 01:19:37,280

in the household uh was a wonderful

2072

01:19:42,229 --> 01:19:38,719

beginning

2073

01:19:46,070 --> 01:19:42,239

and i i'm i'm distraught that more work

2074

01:19:49,270 --> 01:19:46,080

didn't follow about that whole

2075

01:19:51,750 --> 01:19:49,280

quest the origins of the family um

2076

01:19:53,350 --> 01:19:51,760

and how that linked up to the rest of

2077

01:19:57,510 --> 01:19:53,360

capitalism

2078

01:19:59,350 --> 01:19:57,520

uh i think marx could have

2079

01:20:01,189 --> 01:19:59,360

worked more than he did he did great

2080

01:20:04,709 --> 01:20:01,199

contributions but he could have done

2081

01:20:07,990 --> 01:20:04,719

more on why

2082

01:20:10,550 --> 01:20:08,000

the paris commune of 1870 marx is

2083

01:20:13,189 --> 01:20:10,560

still alive at that time and he writes

2084

01:20:15,990 --> 01:20:13,199

very famous pamphlets about

2085

01:20:17,110 --> 01:20:16,000

the paris commune and at that time it

2086

01:20:20,390 --> 01:20:17,120

was the first

2087

01:20:24,149 --> 01:20:20,400

effort to go beyond capitalism

2088

01:20:27,590 --> 01:20:24,159

in a major european country france paris

2089

01:20:28,470 --> 01:20:27,600

um and his own people were involved in

2090

01:20:30,790 --> 01:20:28,480

it

2091

01:20:32,470 --> 01:20:30,800

he wrote a very good essay about what

2092

01:20:33,189 --> 01:20:32,480

went wrong but he could have done much

2093

01:20:36,470 --> 01:20:33,199

more

2094

01:20:38,310 --> 01:20:36,480

since lenin used marx's writings on the

2095

01:20:40,390 --> 01:20:38,320

paris commune

2096

01:20:41,430 --> 01:20:40,400

to shape his strategy for the russian

2097

01:20:44,870 --> 01:20:41,440

revolution

2098

01:20:46,229 --> 01:20:44,880

had marx done more work analyzing

2099

01:20:48,149 --> 01:20:46,239

particularly

2100

01:20:51,350 --> 01:20:48,159

the ambivalence of the rest of the

2101
01:20:55,350 --> 01:20:51,360
french about the paris commune

2102
01:20:57,590 --> 01:20:55,360
it would have cautioned lenin in ways

2103
01:20:59,189 --> 01:20:57,600
uh that i wish and here's perhaps the

2104
01:21:01,990 --> 01:20:59,199
biggest one

2105
01:21:03,430 --> 01:21:02,000
marx also made comments about worker

2106
01:21:07,350 --> 01:21:03,440
co-ops

2107
01:21:08,870 --> 01:21:07,360
uh as lenin did um they recognized the

2108
01:21:11,830 --> 01:21:08,880
potential

2109
01:21:13,189 --> 01:21:11,840
but they did not do what it is i'm

2110
01:21:16,550 --> 01:21:13,199
suggesting now

2111
01:21:21,750 --> 01:21:16,560
has to be done they never devoted

2112
01:21:24,870 --> 01:21:21,760
an analytic focus on asking the question

2113
01:21:28,310 --> 01:21:24,880

how should socialist society

2114

01:21:29,910 --> 01:21:28,320

transform the workplace let's remember

2115

01:21:32,390 --> 01:21:29,920

that's where most people spend most of

2116

01:21:34,629 --> 01:21:32,400

their adult lives

2117

01:21:35,910 --> 01:21:34,639

nine to five five days of the week you

2118

01:21:38,709 --> 01:21:35,920

go to work

2119

01:21:40,149 --> 01:21:38,719

it defines those five days you prepare

2120

01:21:42,870 --> 01:21:40,159

for work you do your work

2121

01:21:44,390 --> 01:21:42,880

you recoup from work you go to a bar to

2122

01:21:46,870 --> 01:21:44,400

have a happy hour to cope

2123

01:21:48,870 --> 01:21:46,880

with what the work meant to you it

2124

01:21:50,950 --> 01:21:48,880

shapes your personal life it shapes your

2125

01:21:51,990 --> 01:21:50,960

sexual life it shapes everything about

2126
01:21:55,270 --> 01:21:52,000

you

2127
01:21:57,110 --> 01:21:55,280

one would think that marxists focus on

2128
01:22:00,189 --> 01:21:57,120

the working class

2129
01:22:01,350 --> 01:22:00,199

including how the workplace shapes the

2130
01:22:04,470 --> 01:22:01,360

ideological

2131
01:22:05,590 --> 01:22:04,480

openness of workers to a movement for

2132
01:22:07,430 --> 01:22:05,600

socialism

2133
01:22:10,629 --> 01:22:07,440

that there would have been on the part

2134
01:22:11,430 --> 01:22:10,639

of marx and marxist later the kind of

2135
01:22:14,629 --> 01:22:11,440

analytic

2136
01:22:15,910 --> 01:22:14,639

focus on the household on gender

2137
01:22:19,430 --> 01:22:15,920

relationships

2138
01:22:20,390 --> 01:22:19,440

on the identification of sexuality and

2139

01:22:24,149 --> 01:22:20,400

so on

2140

01:22:27,990 --> 01:22:24,159

so i think those are areas that marx

2141

01:22:30,229 --> 01:22:28,000

disappoints me because i learned so much

2142

01:22:32,790 --> 01:22:30,239

from what he did focus on

2143

01:22:34,870 --> 01:22:32,800

i wish he had given comparable

2144

01:22:36,870 --> 01:22:34,880

analytical attention to those kinds of

2145

01:22:38,470 --> 01:22:36,880

topics

2146

01:22:39,910 --> 01:22:38,480

you know as we were talking before we

2147

01:22:41,270 --> 01:22:39,920

said that a whole

2148

01:22:42,790 --> 01:22:41,280

a large part of this channel is about

2149

01:22:43,830 --> 01:22:42,800

when does the right go too far when does

2150

01:22:45,350 --> 01:22:43,840

the left go too far

2151
01:22:47,590 --> 01:22:45,360
and you can pull a gnome chops and say

2152
01:22:49,350 --> 01:22:47,600
the only the right goes too far

2153
01:22:50,950 --> 01:22:49,360
even though he admitted that the left at

2154
01:22:52,870 --> 01:22:50,960
least the democratic left has abandoned

2155
01:22:54,470 --> 01:22:52,880
the working class

2156
01:22:56,310 --> 01:22:54,480
when do you see the right is going too

2157
01:22:58,070 --> 01:22:56,320
far ideologically speaking and when do

2158
01:23:00,070 --> 01:22:58,080
you see the left as going too far

2159
01:23:01,510 --> 01:23:00,080
like can equality be taken too far can

2160
01:23:04,629 --> 01:23:01,520
diversity be taken too far

2161
01:23:07,110 --> 01:23:04,639
you interpreted it as you wish

2162
01:23:08,229 --> 01:23:07,120
well i'm not clear i understand the

2163
01:23:11,750 --> 01:23:08,239

question but

2164

01:23:13,910 --> 01:23:11,760

being a student of uh marx requires one

2165

01:23:16,950 --> 01:23:13,920

to be

2166

01:23:19,510 --> 01:23:16,960

in my judgment anyway also a student of

2167

01:23:23,350 --> 01:23:19,520

marx's philosophic teacher

2168

01:23:25,350 --> 01:23:23,360

named hegel

2169

01:23:26,870 --> 01:23:25,360

and one of the things hegel argues in

2170

01:23:31,270 --> 01:23:26,880

his work

2171

01:23:34,149 --> 01:23:31,280

is that everything is contradictory

2172

01:23:35,189 --> 01:23:34,159

and that if you don't see the

2173

01:23:38,629 --> 01:23:35,199

contradictions

2174

01:23:42,149 --> 01:23:38,639

in something you're not getting it

2175

01:23:43,830 --> 01:23:42,159

that there's stuff you are occluding

2176
01:23:46,310 --> 01:23:43,840
and then it becomes a psychological

2177
01:23:49,350 --> 01:23:46,320
question why you would do that

2178
01:23:53,910 --> 01:23:49,360
so i don't expect liberty freedom

2179
01:23:55,910 --> 01:23:53,920
quality to be uncontradictory concepts

2180
01:23:57,590 --> 01:23:55,920
so when earlier it was said i don't

2181
01:24:00,229 --> 01:23:57,600
remember which of us said it

2182
01:24:02,149 --> 01:24:00,239
that the liberty of one person is is the

2183
01:24:04,470 --> 01:24:02,159
absence of liberty to another

2184
01:24:05,350 --> 01:24:04,480
that's exactly what hegel would argue

2185
01:24:08,070 --> 01:24:05,360
that's not a

2186
01:24:09,030 --> 01:24:08,080
flaw in someone's understanding of

2187
01:24:14,229 --> 01:24:09,040
liberty

2188
01:24:18,070 --> 01:24:14,239

contradictory

2189

01:24:20,470 --> 01:24:18,080

reality because all reality is

2190

01:24:22,870 --> 01:24:20,480

and now pardon my language over

2191

01:24:24,870 --> 01:24:22,880

determined anything we can think about

2192

01:24:26,149 --> 01:24:24,880

anything we can touch anything we can

2193

01:24:28,390 --> 01:24:26,159

see is

2194

01:24:30,870 --> 01:24:28,400

over determined by everything else going

2195

01:24:34,470 --> 01:24:30,880

on in this society

2196

01:24:37,350 --> 01:24:34,480

you or i are shaped by countless

2197

01:24:38,229 --> 01:24:37,360

literally an infinity of economic

2198

01:24:41,990 --> 01:24:38,239

political

2199

01:24:42,310 --> 01:24:42,000

cultural natural phenomena that impinge

2200

01:24:45,669 --> 01:24:42,320

on

2201

01:24:47,590 --> 01:24:45,679

us the air the water the dream

2202

01:24:49,350 --> 01:24:47,600

the the comment of your boyfriend or

2203

01:24:52,709 --> 01:24:49,360

girlfriend or whatever

2204

01:24:55,510 --> 01:24:52,719

all of those things shape us and

2205

01:24:56,470 --> 01:24:55,520

they shape us in different ways they

2206

01:24:59,430 --> 01:24:56,480

push and pull

2207

01:25:01,070 --> 01:24:59,440

us in all together we're full of the

2208

01:25:04,390 --> 01:25:01,080

resulting

2209

01:25:05,189 --> 01:25:04,400

contradictions that emerge as the other

2210

01:25:07,590 --> 01:25:05,199

side

2211

01:25:08,470 --> 01:25:07,600

of our over determination and that

2212

01:25:11,590 --> 01:25:08,480

applies to

2213

01:25:14,149 --> 01:25:11,600

liberty or african-american-ness

2214

01:25:15,270 --> 01:25:14,159

if that's the right word or any other

2215

01:25:17,510 --> 01:25:15,280

construct

2216

01:25:18,470 --> 01:25:17,520

that we come up with mentally or

2217

01:25:20,790 --> 01:25:18,480

encounter

2218

01:25:21,510 --> 01:25:20,800

in our physical world so i'm not i don't

2219

01:25:24,310 --> 01:25:21,520

find it a

2220

01:25:25,270 --> 01:25:24,320

flaw of the concept of liberty or

2221

01:25:28,070 --> 01:25:25,280

anything else

2222

01:25:29,110 --> 01:25:28,080

that people don't agree about it see it

2223

01:25:35,430 --> 01:25:29,120

differently

2224

01:25:39,270 --> 01:25:35,440

that's what social life is in part a

2225

01:25:43,030 --> 01:25:39,280

struggle in which we all push

2226

01:25:46,070 --> 01:25:43,040

for whatever at those varying moments

2227

01:25:50,470 --> 01:25:46,080

shapes us as a desitorotime something

2228

01:25:52,390 --> 01:25:50,480

we would like to to push for

2229

01:25:53,350 --> 01:25:52,400

professor edward stewart i'm not sure if

2230

01:25:54,790 --> 01:25:53,360

you're familiar with him he's a

2231

01:25:57,030 --> 01:25:54,800

comparative economics professor at

2232

01:25:59,110 --> 01:25:57,040

northeastern illinois university

2233

01:26:01,750 --> 01:25:59,120

he said i have a question for richard

2234

01:26:05,910 --> 01:26:01,760

wolfe and he's a keynesian he's

2235

01:26:08,070 --> 01:26:05,920

okay he said biden wins what's the match

2236

01:26:09,669 --> 01:26:08,080

you can advise biden what specific

2237

01:26:13,030 --> 01:26:09,679

policy would you

2238

01:26:16,229 --> 01:26:13,040

like to see enacted i would advise him

2239

01:26:26,629 --> 01:26:18,950

okay your president what specific policy

2240

01:26:30,790 --> 01:26:29,510

i suppose i would go i would take my

2241

01:26:34,229 --> 01:26:30,800

clue

2242

01:26:38,390 --> 01:26:34,239

from uh bernie and

2243

01:26:41,990 --> 01:26:38,400

aoc and would enact a uh

2244

01:26:45,110 --> 01:26:42,000

a green new deal i would uh

2245

01:26:47,750 --> 01:26:45,120

enact a government hiring program

2246

01:26:49,990 --> 01:26:47,760

that would deal with our unemployment by

2247

01:26:51,910 --> 01:26:50,000

basically saying that anybody who lost a

2248

01:26:55,030 --> 01:26:51,920

job from a private employer

2249

01:26:57,430 --> 01:26:55,040

ipso facto now has a job

2250

01:26:59,030 --> 01:26:57,440

at at least equivalent pay from the

2251
01:27:01,750 --> 01:26:59,040
federal government

2252
01:27:03,189 --> 01:27:01,760
uh that would get us 20 30 40 million

2253
01:27:05,110 --> 01:27:03,199
depending on how you count

2254
01:27:07,030 --> 01:27:05,120
people who would now be a new labor

2255
01:27:08,390 --> 01:27:07,040
force for the government

2256
01:27:10,390 --> 01:27:08,400
they would not be governed by

2257
01:27:12,950 --> 01:27:10,400
profitability calculations

2258
01:27:15,350 --> 01:27:12,960
as private capitalists are they would do

2259
01:27:18,310 --> 01:27:15,360
what is socially useful

2260
01:27:20,310 --> 01:27:18,320
that would begin by testing everybody

2261
01:27:22,229 --> 01:27:20,320
for coronavirus

2262
01:27:23,430 --> 01:27:22,239
to determine what kind of strategic

2263
01:27:25,590 --> 01:27:23,440

public health

2264

01:27:27,750 --> 01:27:25,600

initiatives are necessary because that's

2265

01:27:30,550 --> 01:27:27,760

based on who has what disease

2266

01:27:32,310 --> 01:27:30,560

growing in what numbers in what regions

2267

01:27:34,070 --> 01:27:32,320

and that would employ millions of people

2268

01:27:37,189 --> 01:27:34,080

and the rest would be employed

2269

01:27:39,750 --> 01:27:37,199

on the kind of ecological new deal uh

2270

01:27:40,229 --> 01:27:39,760

and by the way this would simply be a

2271

01:27:43,910 --> 01:27:40,239

step

2272

01:27:45,830 --> 01:27:43,920

one in which we recoup and recuperate

2273

01:27:47,430 --> 01:27:45,840

the policies that worked well in the

2274

01:27:49,110 --> 01:27:47,440

great depression because that's the

2275

01:27:52,790 --> 01:27:49,120

situation we're in now

2276

01:27:56,390 --> 01:27:52,800

uh and make them uh the opening gun

2277

01:28:00,070 --> 01:27:56,400

and then i would because of me me

2278

01:28:03,270 --> 01:28:00,080

then i would turn to an enormous program

2279

01:28:06,470 --> 01:28:03,280

of uh the creation of a worker

2280

01:28:09,430 --> 01:28:06,480

co-op based sector of the american

2281

01:28:10,310 --> 01:28:09,440

economy why to give americans for the

2282

01:28:12,550 --> 01:28:10,320

first time

2283

01:28:14,550 --> 01:28:12,560

the knowledge with which to make a

2284

01:28:17,030 --> 01:28:14,560

freedom of choice

2285

01:28:18,310 --> 01:28:17,040

real they're going to be able to choose

2286

01:28:20,790 --> 01:28:18,320

between working in a

2287

01:28:21,510 --> 01:28:20,800

hierarchical top-down undemocratic

2288

01:28:25,590 --> 01:28:21,520

capitalist

2289

01:28:28,470 --> 01:28:25,600

enterprise or a democratic worker co-op

2290

01:28:30,629 --> 01:28:28,480

i would create through government steps

2291

01:28:33,990 --> 01:28:30,639

the kind of sector of the economy

2292

01:28:36,550 --> 01:28:34,000

that already exists in italy in italy if

2293

01:28:39,669 --> 01:28:36,560

you go to the province of amelia romagna

2294

01:28:41,910 --> 01:28:39,679

you will go to a place in italy

2295

01:28:42,790 --> 01:28:41,920

a province where 40 percent of the

2296

01:28:46,070 --> 01:28:42,800

industries

2297

01:28:48,390 --> 01:28:46,080

are organized as worker co-ops i would

2298

01:28:50,470 --> 01:28:48,400

replicate that in the united states

2299

01:28:53,189 --> 01:28:50,480

so that every let me finish that every

2300

01:28:54,870 --> 01:28:53,199

american would be able to know

2301
01:28:57,270 --> 01:28:54,880
because in his or her community or in

2302
01:28:57,669 --> 01:28:57,280
his or her family there's someone buying

2303
01:29:00,790 --> 01:28:57,679
from

2304
01:29:03,270 --> 01:29:00,800
or working in a worker co-op

2305
01:29:04,310 --> 01:29:03,280
democratic enterprise so everybody would

2306
01:29:07,350 --> 01:29:04,320
know what it

2307
01:29:09,430 --> 01:29:07,360
is like to work in and shop from

2308
01:29:11,830 --> 01:29:09,440
such an enterprise so that you could

2309
01:29:14,310 --> 01:29:11,840
choose in a rational way

2310
01:29:15,910 --> 01:29:14,320
what kind of economic system you want

2311
01:29:18,390 --> 01:29:15,920
you wanted half capitalist

2312
01:29:19,590 --> 01:29:18,400
half worker co-op two-thirds one-third

2313
01:29:22,790 --> 01:29:19,600

75

2314

01:29:24,470 --> 01:29:22,800

25 100 one-way let's see

2315

01:29:26,149 --> 01:29:24,480

let's put the whole question of the

2316

01:29:28,629 --> 01:29:26,159

economic system

2317

01:29:29,590 --> 01:29:28,639

to a democratic decision based on a

2318

01:29:31,990 --> 01:29:29,600

population

2319

01:29:33,350 --> 01:29:32,000

that has some idea of what the

2320

01:29:35,030 --> 01:29:33,360

alternative is

2321

01:29:37,189 --> 01:29:35,040

those are the kinds of steps i would

2322

01:29:41,189 --> 01:29:37,199

take i have no illusion

2323

01:29:43,990 --> 01:29:41,199

neither mr biden nor ms harris

2324

01:29:45,990 --> 01:29:44,000

have the idea the concept the capability

2325

01:29:49,189 --> 01:29:46,000

or any history enabling them

2326

01:29:52,390 --> 01:29:49,199

to do any of this so

2327

01:29:53,990 --> 01:29:52,400

one just a footnote to show you how the

2328

01:29:57,750 --> 01:29:54,000

world changes

2329

01:30:00,870 --> 01:29:57,760

kamala harris somewhere does have this

2330

01:30:04,070 --> 01:30:00,880

and the reason is her father

2331

01:30:07,270 --> 01:30:04,080

her father is a colleague of mine

2332

01:30:10,870 --> 01:30:07,280

her father thinks like i do

2333

01:30:12,390 --> 01:30:10,880

he's a marxist a marxist economics

2334

01:30:15,270 --> 01:30:12,400

professor

2335

01:30:17,350 --> 01:30:15,280

and he was at stanford for most of his

2336

01:30:20,790 --> 01:30:17,360

adult life

2337

01:30:23,669 --> 01:30:20,800

bringing it all the way around uh

2338

01:30:24,950 --> 01:30:23,679

nice so my question for you is what are

2339

01:30:28,310 --> 01:30:24,960

your thoughts on

2340

01:30:31,270 --> 01:30:28,320

uh quotas that help that are racially

2341

01:30:32,390 --> 01:30:31,280

or gender-based quotas to help correct

2342

01:30:35,030 --> 01:30:32,400

inequalities

2343

01:30:36,709 --> 01:30:35,040

do you think this is a viable strategy

2344

01:30:39,030 --> 01:30:36,719

two correct inequalities

2345

01:30:40,229 --> 01:30:39,040

well it should never have happened i

2346

01:30:40,870 --> 01:30:40,239

don't believe it could ever have

2347

01:30:45,430 --> 01:30:40,880

happened

2348

01:30:47,030 --> 01:30:45,440

the quote from the inequality both

2349

01:30:48,870 --> 01:30:47,040

but the quotas have been part of

2350

01:30:50,149 --> 01:30:48,880

american education

2351

01:30:52,950 --> 01:30:50,159

if you're talking about quarters in

2352

01:30:55,590 --> 01:30:52,960

education but for me quotas anyway

2353

01:30:56,390 --> 01:30:55,600

there's a fellow named will kim lika uh

2354

01:30:58,790 --> 01:30:56,400

who's

2355

01:31:00,709 --> 01:30:58,800

sort of the father of this sort of

2356

01:31:02,470 --> 01:31:00,719

statist version of multiculturalism

2357

01:31:03,669 --> 01:31:02,480

that's very popular here in canada i

2358

01:31:05,590 --> 01:31:03,679

believe he's the

2359

01:31:06,790 --> 01:31:05,600

dean of political science at queen's

2360

01:31:10,070 --> 01:31:06,800

university

2361

01:31:12,149 --> 01:31:10,080

and he's he advocates very much for uh

2362

01:31:14,229 --> 01:31:12,159

that style affirmative action but across

2363

01:31:16,629 --> 01:31:14,239

the board for all sectors

2364

01:31:19,430 --> 01:31:16,639

not all sectors but sort of replicating

2365

01:31:22,950 --> 01:31:19,440

and expanding that into other

2366

01:31:25,990 --> 01:31:22,960

let's say uh institutions yeah well

2367

01:31:28,629 --> 01:31:26,000

i may end up in the same place for me

2368

01:31:30,790 --> 01:31:28,639

the american education system just to

2369

01:31:34,149 --> 01:31:30,800

take that as an example

2370

01:31:37,350 --> 01:31:34,159

uh has been a quota governed system

2371

01:31:41,110 --> 01:31:37,360

from day one for me

2372

01:31:43,110 --> 01:31:41,120

capitalism is a quota based system

2373

01:31:44,629 --> 01:31:43,120

there's a quota on capitalists there's

2374

01:31:47,590 --> 01:31:44,639

only a certain number of them

2375

01:31:48,070 --> 01:31:47,600

and the rest of us get to be employees

2376

01:31:51,110 --> 01:31:48,080

who

2377

01:31:54,310 --> 01:31:51,120

are told what to do by quota is built

2378

01:31:55,669 --> 01:31:54,320

into this system and there's always been

2379

01:31:57,350 --> 01:31:55,679

quotas

2380

01:31:59,430 --> 01:31:57,360

you know it used to be that the quota

2381

01:32:00,790 --> 01:31:59,440

was you had to be white and male

2382

01:32:03,030 --> 01:32:00,800

and that was it you got into the

2383

01:32:03,830 --> 01:32:03,040

university and if you lacked either of

2384

01:32:05,910 --> 01:32:03,840

those two

2385

01:32:07,669 --> 01:32:05,920

there was a quota and your quota was

2386

01:32:09,110 --> 01:32:07,679

zero

2387

01:32:10,870 --> 01:32:09,120

and then if you made a lot of noise your

2388

01:32:13,590 --> 01:32:10,880

quarter would be two

2389

01:32:15,030 --> 01:32:13,600

you're talking unspoken quotes as

2390

01:32:16,310 --> 01:32:15,040

opposed to formal or are we talking

2391

01:32:20,149 --> 01:32:16,320

formal as well because the

2392

01:32:22,229 --> 01:32:20,159

neighborhoods used to have right now

2393

01:32:23,189 --> 01:32:22,239

yeah the quotas the quotas are on the

2394

01:32:26,149 --> 01:32:23,199

continuum

2395

01:32:27,590 --> 01:32:26,159

from formal written legal all the way

2396

01:32:30,870 --> 01:32:27,600

over to informal

2397

01:32:32,390 --> 01:32:30,880

illegal unspoken you know and everywhere

2398

01:32:34,229 --> 01:32:32,400

in between the quotas

2399

01:32:37,030 --> 01:32:34,239

but the quotas have always been there

2400

01:32:39,830 --> 01:32:37,040

however they have been construed

2401

01:32:40,709 --> 01:32:39,840

all that that the modern struggle over

2402

01:32:43,189 --> 01:32:40,719

quotas

2403

01:32:44,550 --> 01:32:43,199

uh seems to me to represent is the

2404

01:32:46,629 --> 01:32:44,560

determination

2405

01:32:48,149 --> 01:32:46,639

which has always happened to quotas that

2406

01:32:51,030 --> 01:32:48,159

sooner or later

2407

01:32:51,910 --> 01:32:51,040

as the society changes the quotas have

2408

01:32:54,470 --> 01:32:51,920

to change

2409

01:32:56,149 --> 01:32:54,480

because the relative size and strength

2410

01:32:59,350 --> 01:32:56,159

and political power

2411

01:33:00,709 --> 01:32:59,360

of the different quota groups alters

2412

01:33:03,189 --> 01:33:00,719

and sooner or later they're going to

2413

01:33:05,510 --> 01:33:03,199

want the quotas to reflect

2414

01:33:06,229 --> 01:33:05,520

what their social power or their social

2415

01:33:08,629 --> 01:33:06,239

position

2416

01:33:10,390 --> 01:33:08,639

or even their social consciousness tells

2417

01:33:12,550 --> 01:33:10,400

them is appropriate it's a little bit

2418

01:33:14,790 --> 01:33:12,560

like international treaties

2419

01:33:16,550 --> 01:33:14,800

they're always out of date about the

2420

01:33:18,629 --> 01:33:16,560

time they get signed

2421

01:33:21,590 --> 01:33:18,639

because the power relationships among

2422

01:33:23,990 --> 01:33:21,600

the countries that sign the agreement

2423

01:33:24,950 --> 01:33:24,000

changes and therefore it's only a matter

2424

01:33:27,669 --> 01:33:24,960

of time

2425

01:33:29,590 --> 01:33:27,679

before they want the documents governing

2426

01:33:32,790 --> 01:33:29,600

their international relations

2427

01:33:34,709 --> 01:33:32,800

to reflect the change in their actual

2428

01:33:37,270 --> 01:33:34,719

economic and political

2429

01:33:39,430 --> 01:33:37,280

statuses and i think that's what quota

2430

01:33:40,390 --> 01:33:39,440

struggles are about the african-american

2431

01:33:43,590 --> 01:33:40,400

community

2432

01:33:45,830 --> 01:33:43,600

wants to be let in and not blocked out

2433

01:33:48,229 --> 01:33:45,840

i understand that they were blocked out

2434

01:33:51,430 --> 01:33:48,239

for a very long time that quota was zero

2435

01:33:52,070 --> 01:33:51,440

or next to zero or or maybe zero plus a

2436

01:33:56,310 --> 01:33:52,080

few

2437

01:33:59,750 --> 01:33:56,320

um you know examples to look good but

2438

01:34:02,550 --> 01:33:59,760

they want a change across the board

2439

01:34:04,149 --> 01:34:02,560

in their exclusions which were always

2440

01:34:06,790 --> 01:34:04,159

kinds of quota system

2441

01:34:07,750 --> 01:34:06,800

and women want the same thing and latin

2442

01:34:11,189 --> 01:34:07,760

american uh

2443

01:34:13,590 --> 01:34:11,199

immigrant groups want the same thing

2444

01:34:14,709 --> 01:34:13,600

right i mean if you look at like the

2445

01:34:16,629 --> 01:34:14,719

history of the white flight right you

2446

01:34:23,189 --> 01:34:16,639

can look on the deeds to old houses and

2447

01:34:27,189 --> 01:34:24,470

in this country they were called

2448

01:34:28,950 --> 01:34:27,199

covenants all kinds of communities

2449

01:34:31,030 --> 01:34:28,960

did these things some of which had legal

2450

01:34:33,990 --> 01:34:31,040

status of covenants

2451
01:34:34,790 --> 01:34:34,000
in which uh a developer for example

2452
01:34:37,990 --> 01:34:34,800
would

2453
01:34:38,390 --> 01:34:38,000
require everybody who bought a home in

2454
01:34:41,830 --> 01:34:38,400
some

2455
01:34:44,950 --> 01:34:41,840
area to sign a document that he or she

2456
01:34:47,030 --> 01:34:44,960
would not sell it to a african-american

2457
01:34:48,070 --> 01:34:47,040
jew or that's horrible whatever it was

2458
01:34:51,030 --> 01:34:48,080
yeah and

2459
01:34:51,350 --> 01:34:51,040
my question is do we fight old quotas

2460
01:34:55,830 --> 01:34:51,360
with

2461
01:34:58,070 --> 01:34:55,840
new quotas no or do we get rid of voters

2462
01:34:59,590 --> 01:34:58,080
no my guess is the only way you can

2463
01:35:01,830 --> 01:34:59,600

fight an old quota

2464

01:35:02,790 --> 01:35:01,840

at this point given it's the depth of

2465

01:35:05,750 --> 01:35:02,800

its thing

2466

01:35:07,109 --> 01:35:05,760

is to do what you you can offer a no

2467

01:35:09,030 --> 01:35:07,119

quota system

2468

01:35:10,870 --> 01:35:09,040

but you can't deliver it so it's a bit

2469

01:35:13,189 --> 01:35:10,880

of a phony

2470

01:35:15,590 --> 01:35:13,199

because it's baked in it's cemented into

2471

01:35:18,550 --> 01:35:15,600

the system it operates on a thousand

2472

01:35:20,229 --> 01:35:18,560

levels that's i think what the phrase

2473

01:35:23,030 --> 01:35:20,239

systemic racism

2474

01:35:23,510 --> 01:35:23,040

is designed to gesture toward that it's

2475

01:35:26,790 --> 01:35:23,520

built

2476
01:35:30,470 --> 01:35:26,800
in on a general way across the system

2477
01:35:32,070 --> 01:35:30,480
and a change here or a a law

2478
01:35:34,390 --> 01:35:32,080
adjustment over there that's not going

2479
01:35:37,350 --> 01:35:34,400
to do it you've got too many things

2480
01:35:38,109 --> 01:35:37,360
that will get re-create let me put it

2481
01:35:40,950 --> 01:35:38,119
this way

2482
01:35:42,070 --> 01:35:40,960
reinstitute the effective quota that

2483
01:35:45,109 --> 01:35:42,080
existed before

2484
01:35:46,149 --> 01:35:45,119
even when you got rid of it here because

2485
01:35:48,550 --> 01:35:46,159
the forces

2486
01:35:50,070 --> 01:35:48,560
that made for those quotas haven't been

2487
01:35:53,270 --> 01:35:50,080
addressed

2488
01:35:55,189 --> 01:35:53,280

you know for sure for sure 100

2489

01:35:56,629 --> 01:35:55,199

i mean the idea of systemic racism is

2490

01:35:58,870 --> 01:35:56,639

that it goes so deep it

2491

01:36:00,950 --> 01:35:58,880

goes beyond just the formal state that

2492

01:36:01,990 --> 01:36:00,960

the informal power systems that we have

2493

01:36:05,030 --> 01:36:02,000

in our society

2494

01:36:07,990 --> 01:36:05,040

that embed that ideology but at

2495

01:36:10,229 --> 01:36:08,000

the end of the day do we have say

2496

01:36:13,590 --> 01:36:10,239

something like a formal quota like

2497

01:36:19,430 --> 01:36:17,669

well for me i don't think that works

2498

01:36:21,109 --> 01:36:19,440

i'm not against it but i don't think

2499

01:36:24,709 --> 01:36:21,119

that solves the problem

2500

01:36:25,270 --> 01:36:24,719

and i i tend to be critical because i

2501

01:36:27,990 --> 01:36:25,280

see it

2502

01:36:29,189 --> 01:36:28,000

as a way of kicking the proverbial can

2503

01:36:31,350 --> 01:36:29,199

down the road okay

2504

01:36:33,750 --> 01:36:31,360

we're going to now have x percent of

2505

01:36:36,149 --> 01:36:33,760

these that's not going to change

2506

01:36:37,430 --> 01:36:36,159

you know what is fundamentally going on

2507

01:36:39,750 --> 01:36:37,440

in this society

2508

01:36:40,629 --> 01:36:39,760

i would rather go at it from the

2509

01:36:43,030 --> 01:36:40,639

systemic

2510

01:36:44,070 --> 01:36:43,040

change if we agree that there is

2511

01:36:49,030 --> 01:36:44,080

systemic

2512

01:36:50,790 --> 01:36:49,040

is

2513

01:36:52,310 --> 01:36:50,800

let's deal with the system that

2514

01:36:54,790 --> 01:36:52,320

supposedly underlie

2515

01:36:55,350 --> 01:36:54,800

what would it mean for example that if

2516

01:36:58,709 --> 01:36:55,360

that you

2517

01:37:00,149 --> 01:36:58,719

made it a fundamental right of everyone

2518

01:37:03,109 --> 01:37:00,159

in the united states

2519

01:37:04,470 --> 01:37:03,119

to have a job to have the job pay no

2520

01:37:07,350 --> 01:37:04,480

less than

2521

01:37:08,310 --> 01:37:07,360

80 percent of the median wage in this

2522

01:37:10,790 --> 01:37:08,320

country

2523

01:37:11,590 --> 01:37:10,800

and that everybody is entitled to proper

2524

01:37:14,390 --> 01:37:11,600

housing

2525

01:37:15,109 --> 01:37:14,400

that has to be at least x square feet

2526
01:37:17,830 --> 01:37:15,119
per purse

2527
01:37:19,109 --> 01:37:17,840
i mean suppose you really began to deal

2528
01:37:21,270 --> 01:37:19,119
with the quality

2529
01:37:22,709 --> 01:37:21,280
of the job and the quality of the income

2530
01:37:24,149 --> 01:37:22,719
and the quality of the housing

2531
01:37:26,790 --> 01:37:24,159
and the quality of the neighborhood

2532
01:37:27,430 --> 01:37:26,800
services begin to say to everybody we

2533
01:37:30,790 --> 01:37:27,440
really

2534
01:37:35,030 --> 01:37:30,800
are a society that does not

2535
01:37:35,669 --> 01:37:35,040
allow a ghetto over here a ghetto over

2536
01:37:38,629 --> 01:37:35,679
there

2537
01:37:39,189 --> 01:37:38,639
uh whole industries that are female

2538
01:37:40,709 --> 01:37:39,199

versus

2539

01:37:42,870 --> 01:37:40,719

industries that are male and all the

2540

01:37:45,830 --> 01:37:42,880

rest that we know exists

2541

01:37:46,629 --> 01:37:45,840

if we don't do those basic changes the

2542

01:37:50,950 --> 01:37:46,639

rest of it

2543

01:37:54,390 --> 01:37:50,960

strikes me as substitution for solution

2544

01:37:54,790 --> 01:37:54,400

not solution well it was stalin who said

2545

01:37:57,830 --> 01:37:54,800

that

2546

01:38:00,629 --> 01:37:57,840

quantity has a quality of its own yes

2547

01:38:01,990 --> 01:38:00,639

you know yeah well he that's where you

2548

01:38:04,550 --> 01:38:02,000

begin to get

2549

01:38:07,030 --> 01:38:04,560

the hegelian the brilliance of what

2550

01:38:08,950 --> 01:38:07,040

hegel did why hegel becomes the great

2551

01:38:10,310 --> 01:38:08,960

thinker for all of europe in the 19th

2552

01:38:13,830 --> 01:38:10,320

century everything in europe

2553

01:38:17,030 --> 01:38:13,840

that happens starting around you know

2554

01:38:17,669 --> 01:38:17,040

1810 or 1820 everything is derivative of

2555

01:38:20,229 --> 01:38:17,679

hegel

2556

01:38:21,990 --> 01:38:20,239

the influence is overwhelming and and by

2557

01:38:23,109 --> 01:38:22,000

the way in most countries this is kind

2558

01:38:25,910 --> 01:38:23,119

of grasped

2559

01:38:26,950 --> 01:38:25,920

in the united states of course not

2560

01:38:29,430 --> 01:38:26,960

because

2561

01:38:29,990 --> 01:38:29,440

they are so irony is the association of

2562

01:38:34,550 --> 01:38:30,000

marks with

2563

01:38:38,149 --> 01:38:34,560

hegel also condemned poor hegel

2564

01:38:40,550 --> 01:38:38,159

to be ignored too maybe

2565

01:38:41,669 --> 01:38:40,560

i once gave a talk at yale to a

2566

01:38:46,070 --> 01:38:41,679

philosophy

2567

01:38:48,390 --> 01:38:46,080

seminar where i tried to explain

2568

01:38:49,669 --> 01:38:48,400

why students interested in hegel and

2569

01:38:52,790 --> 01:38:49,679

there were a few

2570

01:38:55,510 --> 01:38:52,800

despite the department's hostility

2571

01:38:57,030 --> 01:38:55,520

why they should be interested in marx

2572

01:38:59,750 --> 01:38:57,040

and they were terrified

2573

01:39:01,430 --> 01:38:59,760

by the way they were terrified it was

2574

01:39:04,070 --> 01:39:01,440

another example of what i began

2575

01:39:05,270 --> 01:39:04,080

our conversation with the anxiety of

2576

01:39:07,270 --> 01:39:05,280

association

2577

01:39:08,950 --> 01:39:07,280

you get anywhere near this marxian

2578

01:39:11,669 --> 01:39:08,960

paradigm and you know

2579

01:39:12,550 --> 01:39:11,679

like a child with a hot stove keep your

2580

01:39:15,510 --> 01:39:12,560

fingers

2581

01:39:17,430 --> 01:39:15,520

away but they didn't want to go anywhere

2582

01:39:20,229 --> 01:39:17,440

near marx even though marx talks at

2583

01:39:23,270 --> 01:39:20,239

great length about his hegelian heritage

2584

01:39:24,229 --> 01:39:23,280

what it was what was important about

2585

01:39:28,229 --> 01:39:24,239

hegel what was

2586

01:39:30,550 --> 01:39:28,239

buried in capital from hegel and and

2587

01:39:31,910 --> 01:39:30,560

said really and this notion of

2588

01:39:35,350 --> 01:39:31,920

contradiction

2589

01:39:38,229 --> 01:39:35,360

and this notion that that that

2590

01:39:38,870 --> 01:39:38,239

things don't exist versus don't not

2591

01:39:43,990 --> 01:39:38,880

exist

2592

01:39:46,390 --> 01:39:44,000

two sides of the same thing

2593

01:39:47,830 --> 01:39:46,400

just and where that leads you and what

2594

01:39:51,510 --> 01:39:47,840

that opens up is so

2595

01:39:54,629 --> 01:39:51,520

sad that americans you know don't get it

2596

01:39:56,629 --> 01:39:54,639

it just closes off like the like the

2597

01:40:00,070 --> 01:39:56,639

paranoia about marxism

2598

01:40:03,189 --> 01:40:00,080

it closes off vast realms of

2599

01:40:06,950 --> 01:40:03,199

knowledge for no reason at

2600

01:40:09,910 --> 01:40:06,960

all other than to pander to a short-term

2601

01:40:11,109 --> 01:40:09,920

political narrative from people they

2602

01:40:15,189 --> 01:40:11,119

don't respect

2603

01:40:18,629 --> 01:40:16,790

how does the contradiction in the

2604

01:40:20,470 --> 01:40:18,639

hegelian sense not lead to the principle

2605

01:40:21,750 --> 01:40:20,480

of explosion

2606

01:40:22,950 --> 01:40:21,760

i don't know what the principle of

2607

01:40:24,470 --> 01:40:22,960

experience so that is from any

2608

01:40:27,430 --> 01:40:24,480

contradiction you can derive

2609

01:40:29,270 --> 01:40:27,440

whatever fact you like unless the proper

2610

01:40:30,790 --> 01:40:29,280

term is to call it a hegelian paradox

2611

01:40:32,390 --> 01:40:30,800

which is like an apparent contradiction

2612

01:40:35,910 --> 01:40:32,400

it's not a true contradiction

2613

01:40:36,229 --> 01:40:35,920

a and not a the hegelian notion is that

2614

01:40:43,430 --> 01:40:36,239

a

2615

01:40:46,709 --> 01:40:43,440

of both sides

2616

01:40:49,350 --> 01:40:46,719

so that not a is a property of a

2617

01:40:50,870 --> 01:40:49,360

and vice versa that's my understanding

2618

01:40:53,910 --> 01:40:50,880

of hegel's notion

2619

01:40:57,109 --> 01:40:53,920

so our we can't conceptualize

2620

01:41:00,310 --> 01:40:57,119

our life without conceptualizing

2621

01:41:03,189 --> 01:41:00,320

our death our life is bounded

2622

01:41:05,590 --> 01:41:03,199

by our death and that makes death part

2623

01:41:08,550 --> 01:41:05,600

of life and vice versa

2624

01:41:10,550 --> 01:41:08,560

that for me that's what the hegelian

2625

01:41:13,830 --> 01:41:10,560

notion of contradiction

2626
01:41:15,350 --> 01:41:13,840
uh involves and it means that everything

2627
01:41:18,470 --> 01:41:15,360
that exists

2628
01:41:19,030 --> 01:41:18,480
is in the process of not existing it has

2629
01:41:27,350 --> 01:41:19,040
its own

2630
01:41:29,990 --> 01:41:27,360
flying through the air

2631
01:41:30,950 --> 01:41:30,000
where is it and the answer is it's

2632
01:41:34,149 --> 01:41:30,960
always

2633
01:41:36,470 --> 01:41:34,159
where it is but in its movement it's not

2634
01:41:38,629 --> 01:41:36,480
where it is

2635
01:41:39,830 --> 01:41:38,639
okay i know that you've been extremely

2636
01:41:42,310 --> 01:41:39,840
generous with your time

2637
01:41:44,310 --> 01:41:42,320
i have while i got you i got some labor

2638
01:41:46,709 --> 01:41:44,320

theory value questions quick okay

2639

01:41:48,629 --> 01:41:46,719

i i i have another five minutes then i

2640

01:41:52,390 --> 01:41:48,639

have to go that's fine totally fine

2641

01:41:54,870 --> 01:41:52,400

okay if you want we can do this again

2642

01:41:56,629 --> 01:41:54,880

thank you so much i appreciate it i want

2643

01:41:57,030 --> 01:41:56,639

to call you richie most people call me

2644

01:42:01,990 --> 01:41:57,040

rick

2645

01:42:06,229 --> 01:42:04,310

the problem i have with the surplus well

2646

01:42:08,709 --> 01:42:06,239

why don't you quickly quickly outline to

2647

01:42:10,870 --> 01:42:08,719

the audience the labor theory of value

2648

01:42:12,709 --> 01:42:10,880

very quickly in simplest terms when you

2649

01:42:13,990 --> 01:42:12,719

sit down with an employer

2650

01:42:16,070 --> 01:42:14,000

and you have a conversation about

2651

01:42:16,950 --> 01:42:16,080

getting a job here's how the

2652

01:42:19,189 --> 01:42:16,960

conversation

2653

01:42:20,950 --> 01:42:19,199

basically goes here's what you're going

2654

01:42:22,870 --> 01:42:20,960

to be asked to do come at nine

2655

01:42:25,910 --> 01:42:22,880

leave at five sit over there work with

2656

01:42:27,750 --> 01:42:25,920

this machine do this work

2657

01:42:29,669 --> 01:42:27,760

why are you there because i already have

2658

01:42:31,350 --> 01:42:29,679

a bunch of machines and i have an office

2659

01:42:32,070 --> 01:42:31,360

and i have a factory and i have a bunch

2660

01:42:35,350 --> 01:42:32,080

of workers

2661

01:42:38,229 --> 01:42:35,360

i'm adding you to all of that

2662

01:42:39,350 --> 01:42:38,239

and i'm doing that because by adding you

2663

01:42:42,149 --> 01:42:39,360

i can improve

2664

01:42:42,870 --> 01:42:42,159

either the quality or the quantity or

2665

01:42:45,510 --> 01:42:42,880

both

2666

01:42:47,590 --> 01:42:45,520

of the outputs the goods and services

2667

01:42:51,669 --> 01:42:47,600

that this enterprise is committed

2668

01:42:54,790 --> 01:42:51,679

to producing so by virtue of adding you

2669

01:42:58,550 --> 01:42:54,800

i'm gonna have x more

2670

01:43:01,669 --> 01:42:58,560

product to sell let's assume

2671

01:43:04,390 --> 01:43:01,679

that that's worth a hundred bucks

2672

01:43:05,590 --> 01:43:04,400

so now the question is what am i going

2673

01:43:09,030 --> 01:43:05,600

to pay you

2674

01:43:10,870 --> 01:43:09,040

to come and do this work

2675

01:43:12,550 --> 01:43:10,880

well the answer is i'm going to do a

2676

01:43:14,709 --> 01:43:12,560

little calculation

2677

01:43:16,390 --> 01:43:14,719

i'm going to count up the extra raw

2678

01:43:18,629 --> 01:43:16,400

materials and tools

2679

01:43:21,590 --> 01:43:18,639

that are going to be used up in making

2680

01:43:24,790 --> 01:43:21,600

the extra 100 bucks worth of output

2681

01:43:25,910 --> 01:43:24,800

let's say that's 20 bucks okay now i

2682

01:43:28,070 --> 01:43:25,920

know what i got

2683

01:43:29,750 --> 01:43:28,080

i'm gonna have a hundred bucks output

2684

01:43:31,990 --> 01:43:29,760

i'm gonna have to spend 20 bucks of

2685

01:43:35,270 --> 01:43:32,000

tools equipment and raw materials

2686

01:43:37,030 --> 01:43:35,280

that leaves me 80 bucks how much am i

2687

01:43:40,550 --> 01:43:37,040

going to pay you

2688

01:43:43,830 --> 01:43:40,560

answer something less than 80 bucks

2689

01:43:47,350 --> 01:43:43,840

i'm gonna pay you 50 bucks

2690

01:43:49,189 --> 01:43:47,360

why because by paying you 50 bucks

2691

01:43:51,430 --> 01:43:49,199

and using up to 20 bucks of tools

2692

01:43:54,790 --> 01:43:51,440

equipment and raw materials

2693

01:43:59,350 --> 01:43:54,800

i will have 70 bucks of cost

2694

01:44:02,390 --> 01:43:59,360

for a 100 output the difference between

2695

01:44:05,669 --> 01:44:02,400

what i pay you and what i

2696

01:44:08,229 --> 01:44:05,679

sell the product for that's the surplus

2697

01:44:10,310 --> 01:44:08,239

you've produced it by your labor because

2698

01:44:13,510 --> 01:44:10,320

otherwise i couldn't produce it

2699

01:44:15,590 --> 01:44:13,520

i don't do anything you do the work i

2700

01:44:18,629 --> 01:44:15,600

sit there stare at you

2701

01:44:22,070 --> 01:44:18,639

you do the work you produce more

2702

01:44:24,229 --> 01:44:22,080

than you get for doing it

2703

01:44:25,510 --> 01:44:24,239

the difference between what i pay you

2704

01:44:28,390 --> 01:44:25,520

what marx calls

2705

01:44:29,830 --> 01:44:28,400

the value of your labor power and the

2706

01:44:32,830 --> 01:44:29,840

value that your labor

2707

01:44:34,149 --> 01:44:32,840

creates in that difference is the

2708

01:44:37,270 --> 01:44:34,159

surplus

2709

01:44:40,870 --> 01:44:37,280

and every worker in capitalism

2710

01:44:42,070 --> 01:44:40,880

knows it you know when you sit with the

2711

01:44:45,270 --> 01:44:42,080

employer

2712

01:44:49,189 --> 01:44:45,280

that the only way you would ever

2713

01:44:49,990 --> 01:44:49,199

be paid anything a million dollars an

2714

01:44:54,790 --> 01:44:50,000

hour

2715

01:44:57,830 --> 01:44:54,800

you're going to get that money

2716

01:45:01,750 --> 01:44:57,840

is if hiring you brings him more

2717

01:45:04,310 --> 01:45:01,760

value than it costs him to hire you

2718

01:45:04,950 --> 01:45:04,320

because if it didn't he wouldn't hire

2719

01:45:08,149 --> 01:45:04,960

you

2720

01:45:11,189 --> 01:45:08,159

not

2721

01:45:13,109 --> 01:45:11,199

even then okay great summation

2722

01:45:15,350 --> 01:45:13,119

and the existence of the surplus is what

2723

01:45:17,430 --> 01:45:15,360

equals exploitation

2724

01:45:18,390 --> 01:45:17,440

no exploitation means that there's a

2725

01:45:21,590 --> 01:45:18,400

surplus

2726

01:45:23,270 --> 01:45:21,600

appropriated by a person different from

2727

01:45:27,109 --> 01:45:23,280

the person who produced it

2728

01:45:29,830 --> 01:45:27,119

it's not exploitation okay okay cool

2729

01:45:30,310 --> 01:45:29,840

i've paid people i've paid people and

2730

01:45:31,590 --> 01:45:30,320

made

2731

01:45:33,590 --> 01:45:31,600

nothing the reason why i don't think

2732

01:45:34,870 --> 01:45:33,600

that this i have some issues the reason

2733

01:45:36,310 --> 01:45:34,880

why is because i don't think the surplus

2734

01:45:37,030 --> 01:45:36,320

or the labor theory of value takes into

2735

01:45:39,109 --> 01:45:37,040

account hope

2736

01:45:40,229 --> 01:45:39,119

or uncertainty but i'm sure it does like

2737

01:45:43,350 --> 01:45:40,239

i'm just a ruminantary

2738

01:45:45,510 --> 01:45:43,360

man okay i've paid people

2739

01:45:47,430 --> 01:45:45,520

and made nothing because i hoped that i

2740

01:45:51,350 --> 01:45:47,440

would make something from them

2741

01:45:53,430 --> 01:45:51,360

so who was being exploited there

2742

01:45:55,350 --> 01:45:53,440

it had nothing to do with hope you hoped

2743

01:45:57,590 --> 01:45:55,360

that you would make money

2744

01:45:58,550 --> 01:45:57,600

your employee hoped that you would make

2745

01:46:01,189 --> 01:45:58,560

money

2746

01:46:03,189 --> 01:46:01,199

because the employee has hope too hoping

2747

01:46:04,950 --> 01:46:03,199

not to lose the freaking job

2748

01:46:07,189 --> 01:46:04,960

hope that he didn't move his family from

2749

01:46:08,870 --> 01:46:07,199

timbuktu to wherever you are

2750

01:46:09,990 --> 01:46:08,880

and we'll have to move him again hope

2751

01:46:11,430 --> 01:46:10,000

that he doesn't have to yank his

2752

01:46:14,229 --> 01:46:11,440

teenager out of school

2753

01:46:14,629 --> 01:46:14,239

everybody's full of hope the difference

2754

01:46:24,310 --> 01:46:14,639

is

2755

01:46:26,790 --> 01:46:24,320

he took your job he could have taken

2756

01:46:27,350 --> 01:46:26,800

another job he moved to that town to get

2757

01:46:30,310 --> 01:46:27,360

the jar

2758

01:46:31,590 --> 01:46:30,320

he took all kinds of risks only he has

2759

01:46:35,189 --> 01:46:31,600

no control

2760

01:46:37,669 --> 01:46:35,199

over how the risk he took works out

2761

01:46:38,310 --> 01:46:37,679

you have all the control not only over

2762

01:46:51,430 --> 01:46:38,320

the risk

2763

01:46:52,709 --> 01:46:51,440

that you'll fire him because you'll find

2764

01:46:55,750 --> 01:46:52,719

something else

2765

01:46:56,470 --> 01:46:55,760

that attracts your risk taking more i

2766

01:46:58,629 --> 01:46:56,480

mean

2767

01:46:59,510 --> 01:46:58,639

the degree of risk taking it the burden

2768

01:47:02,310 --> 01:46:59,520

is on him

2769

01:47:03,350 --> 01:47:02,320

not you only capitalists would have

2770

01:47:06,070 --> 01:47:03,360

imagined

2771

01:47:07,189 --> 01:47:06,080

the lopsided notion that because they

2772

01:47:09,030 --> 01:47:07,199

take a risk

2773

01:47:11,750 --> 01:47:09,040

and they don't want to understand what a

2774

01:47:14,790 --> 01:47:11,760

worker does when he or she takes a job

2775

01:47:16,629 --> 01:47:14,800

that they're the only risk taker

2776

01:47:18,070 --> 01:47:16,639

wouldn't it be more accurate to say both

2777

01:47:21,109 --> 01:47:18,080

people take risks

2778

01:47:27,430 --> 01:47:21,119

them

2779

01:47:29,590 --> 01:47:27,440

he's not stable if you don't get the

2780

01:47:32,470 --> 01:47:29,600

satisfaction from the risk you've taken

2781

01:47:33,350 --> 01:47:32,480

if for whatever reason you don't like

2782

01:47:34,709 --> 01:47:33,360

this job

2783

01:47:37,109 --> 01:47:34,719

you think you can make more money

2784

01:47:38,229 --> 01:47:37,119

somewhere else he's taking the writ

2785

01:47:40,310 --> 01:47:38,239

you'll fire him

2786

01:47:42,229 --> 01:47:40,320

he can't even be sure that if he does

2787

01:47:44,470 --> 01:47:42,239

his job and you make money

2788

01:47:45,750 --> 01:47:44,480

you'll keep him on the job you may fire

2789

01:47:47,990 --> 01:47:45,760

him for someone else

2790

01:47:50,149 --> 01:47:48,000

all the risks is overwhelmingly on his

2791

01:47:52,790 --> 01:47:50,159

side i know let me let me push

2792

01:47:54,390 --> 01:47:52,800

please and correct me because okay i

2793

01:47:56,629 --> 01:47:54,400

have a contract with him and he's like

2794

01:47:58,070 --> 01:47:56,639

three months so you're secure in your

2795

01:48:00,550 --> 01:47:58,080

three-month pay

2796

01:48:01,270 --> 01:48:00,560

you get to work 40 hours a week at this

2797

01:48:03,750 --> 01:48:01,280

at 20

2798

01:48:05,189 --> 01:48:03,760

an hour for three months but i am

2799

01:48:06,550 --> 01:48:05,199

assuming the risk because i don't know

2800

01:48:07,750 --> 01:48:06,560

yeah if you're gonna that's wrong too

2801

01:48:09,109 --> 01:48:07,760

and i'll explain to you but then i have

2802

01:48:10,629 --> 01:48:09,119

to cut off because i have somewhere i've

2803

01:48:14,390 --> 01:48:10,639

got to be at 11. yeah

2804

01:48:16,950 --> 01:48:14,400

okay here it is um less than seven

2805

01:48:19,510 --> 01:48:16,960

percent of american workers today are

2806

01:48:20,629 --> 01:48:19,520

in the private sector are governed by a

2807

01:48:22,709 --> 01:48:20,639

trade union

2808

01:48:23,750 --> 01:48:22,719

that protects them with a legal contract

2809

01:48:26,070 --> 01:48:23,760

so in fact

2810

01:48:26,870 --> 01:48:26,080

you can fire a person no matter how many

2811

01:48:29,510 --> 01:48:26,880

months

2812

01:48:30,149 --> 01:48:29,520

you have worked out with him at no legal

2813

01:48:31,830 --> 01:48:30,159

risk

2814

01:48:33,669 --> 01:48:31,840

the person who works in the private

2815

01:48:36,790 --> 01:48:33,679

sector in the united states today

2816

01:48:38,390 --> 01:48:36,800

assumes all the freaking risk

2817

01:48:40,070 --> 01:48:38,400

you could be told to work in a different

2818

01:48:41,030 --> 01:48:40,080

way you can be told to work in a

2819

01:48:43,350 --> 01:48:41,040

different space

2820

01:48:45,590 --> 01:48:43,360

you can be told to suffer this kind of

2821

01:48:48,310 --> 01:48:45,600

quality air that kind of quality water

2822

01:48:51,189 --> 01:48:48,320

and you can be fired at any moment all

2823

01:48:55,109 --> 01:48:51,199

the risk is in the part of the employee

2824

01:48:58,149 --> 01:48:55,119

but he has no power you assume a risk

2825

01:48:58,950 --> 01:48:58,159

and you have power to determine how how

2826

01:49:01,990 --> 01:48:58,960

to pursue

2827

01:49:02,950 --> 01:49:02,000

this risk how to react to changing

2828

01:49:05,669 --> 01:49:02,960

circumstances

2829

01:49:06,709 --> 01:49:05,679

in this risk and how to utilize the

2830

01:49:09,590 --> 01:49:06,719

rewards

2831

01:49:10,550 --> 01:49:09,600

if your risk taking paid off i

2832

01:49:13,510 --> 01:49:10,560

understand

2833

01:49:15,270 --> 01:49:13,520

you take some risk but the notion that

2834

01:49:16,709 --> 01:49:15,280

you're the only you the capitalist or

2835

01:49:20,310 --> 01:49:16,719

the only one

2836

01:49:23,350 --> 01:49:20,320

is a kind of solipsistic conceit

2837

01:49:24,149 --> 01:49:23,360

that really blows my mind but look i do

2838

01:49:26,629 --> 01:49:24,159

have to go

2839

01:49:27,990 --> 01:49:26,639

i appreciate this send me a link if you

2840

01:49:30,709 --> 01:49:28,000

want to do it again

2841

01:49:31,030 --> 01:49:30,719

get in touch thank you so much sir all

2842

01:49:34,070 --> 01:49:31,040

right